NOTE TO USERS

This reproduction is the best copy available.

UMI

University of Alberta

The I.C.W.:A Study in Non-Formal Adult Education

by

Diane Mary Mirth

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in

History of Education

Department of
Educational Policy Studies

Edmonton, Alberta

Fall 1999.

National Library of Canada
Acquisitions and Bibliographic Services
395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Bibliothèque nationale du Canada
Acquisitions et services bibliographiques
395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-46886-0

Canada

University of Alberta

Library Release Form

Name of Author: Diane Mary Mirth

Title of Thesis: The I.C.W.: A Study in Non-Formal Adult Education

Degree: Doctor of Philosophy

Year this Degree Granted: 1999

Permission is hereby granted to the University of Alberta Library to reproduce single copies of this thesis and to lend or sell such copies for private, scholarly, or scientific research purposes only.

The author reserves all other publication rights in association with the copyright in the thesis, and except as hereinbefore provided, neither the thesis nor any substantial portion thereof may be printed or otherwise reproduced in any material form whatever without the author's prior written permission.

September 28, 1999

D Mirth

64 Valleyview Cres.
Edmonton, AB. T5R 5T1.

University of Alberta

Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research

The undersigned certify that they have read, and recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research for acceptance, a thesis entitled *The I.C.W.: A Study in Non-Formal Adult Education* submitted by Diane Mary Mirth in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History of Education.

Dr. P.Rooke
Supervisor

Dr.P.Brook

Dr.S.Jackel

Dr.N.Langford

Dr.B.Young

August 26, 1999
Date

Dr. N.Sheehan
External Examiner

Acknowledgement

Behind every production there is a cast of special people helping to make it happen. I would like to thank my special cast.

My Committee: Dr.Patricia Rooke, Dr.Paula Brook, Dr.Susan Jackel, and Dr. Nancy Langford. Thank you for your guidance, your comments, your recommendations and revisions, and your enthusiasm for the ladies of the I.C.W. Thanks also to Dr. Beth Young, and Dr. Sue Scott, for helping to make it happen.

My Special Friends: Bev and Leighton, Judy, Marg, Irene, Lois, Peggy, and Gwen. Thank you for your encouragement, your interest, your faith in me, your willingness to listen and to walk or run that extra mile when I most needed it.

My Colleagues: Mark and Colleen. Thank you for the moments of sanity and the coffee.

My Funding: The research for this thesis was made possible in part by funds awarded by the Mary Louise Imrie Graduate Student Award, Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research, and the Vice-President (Research) of the University of Alberta and the Camrose Normal School Memorial Scholarship.

My Family: Sonny, Christen, Erin and Andrew. Thank you for your patience and your confidence that I could complete. You have helped make this all possible in ways that you may not even suspect.

ABSTRACT

The following study of the International Council of Women (ICW) examines its educational agenda during the inter-war years. It uses as the main body of evidence, the monthly organ, the *Bulletin,* which illustrates a concerted consciousness-raising effort to urge the translation of feminist knowledge and organizational skills into forms of practical politics. Several questions related to non-formal adult education for women frame the discussion–how the ICW disseminated its programs for the purposes of educating women in the processes which would lead to participatory democracy and how such programs were gender specific being among them.

To illustrate the inquiry one aspect of the social and moral reform movement during this time period has been analyzed–the Traffic in Women and Children–which had its historical antecedents in the social purity movement and the campaigns for an equal moral standard of the nineteenth-century. These issues are examined as discourse, and as implementation at the level of the national councils and on the international stage at the League of Nations.

Several historical constructs had heuristic value in understanding the distinctions and inter-dependence of printed materials as both education and propaganda as well as interpreting the phenomenon being analyzed . These include arguments about the practices and restrictions of social feminism when political and reform roles were circumscribed by this limited view of women's activism, the inter-section of the private and public spheres for female social action during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and the triumph of a transnationalist perspective ("mothering") in a male

constructed and male dominated international forum.

While dramatic world events frustrated such efforts nonetheless a growing international movement of women's organisations and their consolidation of female non-formal education to which the ICW contributed substantially, laid the foundations for the emergence of the second wave feminist movement generally, and, in the structures that participated in the post-war, the United Nations specifically.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION 1

CHAPTER I THE SILENT EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM 13
WOMEN'S VOLUNTARY ASSOCIATION 13
THE 'COUNCIL IDEA' 16
SURVEY OF THE LITERATURE 26
FEMINISM: IDEOLOGY AND STRATEGY 30
THE TROPE OF SEPARATE SPHERES 35
INSTITUTION BUILDING 38
RELATED WORKS 39

CHAPTER 2 THE POLICING OF THE BODY 47
THE HISTORICAL ANTECEDENTS TO THE TRAFFIC 48
DISEASE AS METAPHOR 52
WOMEN'S RESPONSE 55
SOILED DOVES AND SINS OF SCARLET: SOCIAL PURITY 1870-1918. .. 56
THE EQUAL MORAL STANDARD 60

CHAPTER 3 A COMMUNITY OF PRINT 80
THE NATIONAL COUNCILS 80
SOCIAL MOVEMENT–WHAT IS IT? 83
COLLECTIVE CHALLENGE 85
CONSTRUCTING THE "WE" OF COLLECTIVE IDENTITY 86
THE MEANS OF SUSTAINING COLLECTIVE IDENTITY 99
PRINT AND ASSOCIATION 100
PRINT AND SOLIDARITY 105

CHAPTER 4 PRINT AND ROLE MODELS 112
THE FUNCTION OF ROLE MODELS 115
MORAL FAITH 117
SAINTS OF A LESSER KIND 128
WOMEN OF DISTINCTION 131
EXCEPTIONALISM 136
COLLECTIVE ACTION 139

CHAPTER 5 INTERNATIONALIZING A POLITIC OF THE BODY 146
THE ERA OF INTERNATIONALISM 148
THE STUDIES 156
INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS 164
EDUCATION AND PROPAGANDA 172

CHAPTER 6 CONCLUSION 189

BIBLIOGRAPHY 208
PRIMARY SOURCES 208
ARTICLES 211
BOOKS 224
THESES, PAPERS AND REPORTS 235

APPENDIX I CONSTITUTION OF THE ICW 239

APPENDIX II RETURN OF BROTHELS AND PROSTITUTES 240

APPENDIX III SELECTED SAMPLE OF 'WOMEN WORTHIES' FROM NOTES AND NEWS 241

APPENDIX IV SELECTED SAMPLE OF INSTITUTIONAL ROLE MODELS FROM NOTES AND NEWS 247

INTRODUCTION

Few Victorian stereotypes have endured as successfully as that of the middle-class club woman who joined voluntary organisations like the International Council of Women–elite do-gooders in white gloves.[1] Current scholarship has all too readily dismissed these women as " limited in outlook, idle and dependent on men for their livelihood and status in society."[2] This study concentrates on the ICW, a middle-class women's voluntary organisation founded in 1888, and the programs of non-formal education it delivered through the *Bulletin* to its female members. It does this in an attempt to expand our understanding and introduce a further refinement to an area that has been overlooked or ignored by many.

Mainstream histories have given scant attention to women's educational history and feminist historians, in their attempt to include all women, have been quick to dismiss the topic of middle-class women. Meanwhile, both educational history and the historical scholarship of adult education have sidestepped the area of women's organizations. Consequently, female "adult education" in a broader global context has been somewhat overlooked, Whittick's study on the International Alliance of Women (IAW), *Woman Into Citizen,* being an exception.[3] Many histories have studied the various institutional apparatuses of women's organisations and the large-scale educational agendas and programs they offered to the public, to children, and to members. However, none to date have isolated, focused, and elaborated the educational agenda directed specifically at the adult membership that this study highlights. This study aims to help fill this void and

expand the knowledge of the historical development of female adult education. It is the first major interpretation of the ICW as an agency for female adult education and citizenship participation.

The education received by women members of the ICW was a form of non-formal education into citizenship as important as (for example) that received by male-centred Mechanics Institutes or co-educational Methodist societies of the nineteenth-century. [4] This undertaking informs the areas of women's studies and adult education as to the historical issues surrounding middle-class women's efforts to better serve humanity and to inform and educate women. It sheds light on the conscious and deliberate development of an organizational apparatus which was used to relay matters of citizenship through programs of non-formal education. It traces, through the published newsletter, the *Bulletin,* the story of the non-formal education of ICW women, their personal agendas, the changes to these agendas, the reasons for emphasizing and/or de-emphasizing certain platforms and the directions and influence of its leadership (e.g. Lady Aberdeen and Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix) as they progressed through the twentieth-century.

The study, however, is not a conventional historical narrative in the strictest sense. As stated in the title, it consists of a "study in non-formal education." The historical component, the primary source material–the *Bulletin*–provides the major thrust for the study. The evidence garnered from this source has been examined as an historical example of how adult education was conceptualized and concretized in the time frame chosen for the study. Therefore, throughout the dissertation the evidence serves to

illustrate the educational nature of women's organizations in general, and the ICW in particular. It serves to illustrate the ICW as a construct of non-formal education, as an aspect of feminism, as ideology and discourse and as a form of practice (praxis, or practical politics). This conceptual framework of adult non-formal education re-iterates the relationship between the organization being studied, the paradigm of social feminism and the trope of separate spheres.

One publication, the ICW *Bulletin*, has been examined to provide evidence to support a study in non-formal female adult education and its relationship to feminist practical politics. The *Bulletin* aptly fits a definition of adult education as "the silent education system" as members, by reading the pages of the *Bulletin,* could be quietly educated within the confines of their own homes.

At this point it might prove useful to discuss what educators understand by the terms the process of education, and education for transformation. Education in western society, "is concerned with the transmission of what is thought to be valuable,...in any society."[5] As such, the process is conscious, deliberate, and systematic. Educators seek to perpetuate worthwhile activities, transmit skills and impart knowledge in a systematic fashion. They do this in order to transform people to become better citizens in democratic societies and worthwhile contributors to society as a whole. "...[W]hat is learnt must be regarded as worthwhile just as the manner in which it is learnt must be regarded as morally unobjectionable"[6] In other words, education is distinct again from any indoctrination process. In the case of adult education, the concept of indoctrination is not as ethically charged, as adults are viewed as having volition and agency. In this

study the values of participatory democracy and female equality were the values that were identified as worthwhile.

The educational programs of women's organisations fit this accepted understanding of what constitutes education both as process and as product. The *Bulletin,* however, not only fits the definition of education, but it also propagandized. This needs some careful explanation as propaganda has negative connotations in contemporary political circles.

It must be remembered that until after the Second World War and up to the beginning of the Cold War, the term "propaganda" did not have the negative, even sinister, connotations it now assumes. The mid twentieth-century was the first time that politically opposed ideological camps accused each other of propaganda while claiming their own materials and means were not! The suffrage movement, for example, encouraged female theatre and the writing of "propaganda" plays, quite unaware that this activity may be construed as pernicious.[7] There was, in fact a whole movement of agit-prop (combination of political agitation and propaganda) in literature, especially in plays, in radical political and social movements of the period 1910-1939 which, while being acknowledged as propaganda, did not carry the negative connotations that the word summons to those of later decades.

Women's organizations became adept at the use of propaganda. The term propaganda was a code-word for consciousness-raising. By way of example, in February 1932, under a section explicitly named "Propaganda," the ICW made these connections in its *Bulletin*:

> In several countries the NCW, either acting independently or more often in collaboration with the League of Nations of the country, has organized a continuous propaganda through its local Councils or Branches, by means of a series of meetings, study circles, distribution of literature, entertainments, etc.

This clearly refers to consciousness raising or non-formal education. Propaganda was understood to be the means to alert women to matters of concern. Uniformly, women's organizations propagandized their work through their newsletters, bulletins, and conference proceedings. The popular press was aware of this and extracted accounts from organizational literature such as the *Bulletin,* which could be publicized widely in the press of the respective countries.[8]

There is little evidence in the pages of the *Bulletin* to suggest that the ICW differentiated between the terms propaganda and education. Rather, it would appear that there existed a sense of harmony or inter-relationship between the two concepts when it came to adults. Indeed, the term propaganda was used consistently in the place of the term education. The term education, it seems, was used to denote the process that involved children. On frequent occasions ICW members were called upon to engage in propaganda in order to influence decisions. "The immediate concern of women's organisations now, is to carry on active propaganda in their respective countries...."in order to "secure their support for effective revision."[9]

In order to examine the educational agenda of the ICW a number of research questions organize the primary source materials and connect these to the existing secondary source literature:

How did the ICW educate members through the *Bulletin ?*

To be more specific:

1.How did the ICW, through the *Bulletin,* disseminate its educational program and 'conscientize' its membership within a theoretical framework of non-formal education?
2.How were the processes of participatory democracy emphasized and achieved within the model of voluntary association?
3.To what extent were these processes either a gendered experience or a gender-specific program?
4.To what degree did the ICW through the *Bulletin* effect a balance between propaganda and adult non-formal education?

The ICW and the *Bulletin* covered a huge range of issues. By looking at how the ICW informed and educated the membership on the issues involved in the Traffic in Women and Children it is possible to analyze the theoretical framework of non-formal adult education within the organisation. The theme of the Traffic in Women and Children was chosen for this end. The moral and philosophical understandings that surround the Traffic best exemplifies the typical early twentieth century ICW member. Social purity and its agenda which presupposes the commitment to protect the family and extend that protection to society, helps illuminate the story of ICW women and their educational purposes. In the study the theme of the Traffic in Women and Children is analyzed and divided into four topics for the purposes of identifying the educational components:

1. The Background to the Traffic in Women and Children
2. The Equal Moral Standard and Women's Policing
3. The Traffic in Women and Children at the National Councils. This theme is examined through the construct of a theoretical analysis of social movement theory.
4. The Traffic in Women and Children at the League of Nations

At the same time as these four strands are isolated and developed they are used to analyse the relationship to the non-formal education of women; the relationship between this and propaganda; social feminism, and the discourse of practical politics.

Social feminist ideologies and the trope of separate spheres which inform the directions of female education programs focus the intersection between public and private spheres so evident in the work of international women's organizations. In order to demonstrate how the ICW developed an effective apparatus to transmit important civic and political messages [propaganda] to membership at all levels—local, national and international—the consciousness raising efforts are analysed. Such efforts entailed the compiling of statistical data, the collation and analysis of investigative studies, the development of public-speaking skills and critical judgment, the translation of domestic management and economics into the public forum, and moral and social reform.

In addition to the limits set by the nature of the materials used and by the study itself, the researcher has set certain delimitations for the scope of the research. These include chronological boundaries, the conclusion to limit the information of the League of Nations to that of its involvement in the Traffic, and the decision to discuss the international division of the organization called the ICW rather than its national or local chapters. The chronological boundaries expand over two decades to include the years between 1920 and 1940. These two decades represent, for women, an important intersection in feminist practical politics. The analysis considers the development and transition of women's organizational involvement into matters of citizenship during this time of critical female consciousness-raising. These decades were significant in that they

delineated a period after which most Anglo-Saxon nations and colonies had achieved either partial or complete enfranchisement. Enfranchisement provided a great deal of momentum to women's organizations during the early part of the century and these two decades represented a re-alignment of the direction of women's organizations and practical politics.[10] It was this re-alignment that refocused many of the women''s organizational programs and created the energy that directed attention to other problems like the Traffic in Women and Children

The original contribution this study makes –quite apart from its being the first to address the adult educational nature of the ICW itself—is that the organisation is interpreted within a framework of adult education theory. In short, this study provides a historical study to demonstrate some adult education theory. As such it serves to make an original contribution to two fields of study.

Such a study opens up and presents the possibility for further avenues of research and interpretation for the field of adult education. Some researchers may further investigate questions this researcher is unable to address, given the constraints and parameters of this study. Others may examine these parameters using a different methodology and ask different questions of this material.

The study has been divided into six chapters.

Chapter 1, The Silent Education System contains the literature survey to place this study into the historiographical and appropriate scholarly context and sets out the rationale and objectives of the study as non-formal education.

Chapter 2, The Policing of the Body commences at the Quinquennial Meeting of the ICW in Berlin, 1904, where one of the resolutions passed concerned setting up a Standing Committee to deal with the "White Slave Traffic" and Equal Moral Standard. Women resolved to co-operate to eliminate the "odious system" and work towards a program of education to eliminate the double moral standard. The historical antecedents of the problem of the white slave trade and equal moral standard provide an understanding of the social climate of the Traffic and the effective means of educating women in non-formal ways to political activism. The role of the ICW with regards to the Traffic is of specific concern. The education programs that informed women's organizations are analysed. The chapter deals with the separation of the issues surrounding the Equal Moral Standard from those of the Traffic. The development of women's police forces, at a time when the international make-up of the ICW was unable to become involved in the more controversial issues emanating from the equal moral standard debate, is investigated as a viable resolution for praxis. The enthusiasm which the ICW demonstrated in the establishment of women's police forces will be traced through the reports in the Bulletin to demonstrate the skillful use of diplomacy education and propaganda of ICW leadership.

Chapter 3, A Community of Print: While much of what occurred at the League of Nations was involved with the large picture and the rhetoric of the Traffic, individual National Councils were involved in the 'front lines' of the actual work. The *Bulletin* is examined in order to ascertain the work performed by the individual National Councils in the Traffic. This chapter includes an analysis of social movement theory to

demonstrate the reasons why the ICW was able to convince and educate large numbers of otherwise conservative women to become engaged in the reform work surrounding the Traffic. Education via the print medium is examined to ascertain its effectiveness in the dissemination of propaganda and for creating collective action.

Chapter 4, Print and Role Models: This chapter analyzes the effect of the vital and influential women leaders of the ICW. Women like Lady Aberdeen and Madame Avril de Sainte Croix, encouraged members, shaped, and formed the ICW into an international organisation with an agenda that was carefully and purposefully moulded for women's participation in public discourse and citizenry.

Chapter 5 , The International Politics of the Body: The involvement of the ICW at the League of Nations is the subject of this chapter. The work undertaken at the League in the Traffic is analyzed in respect to the ICW. The *Bulletin* is examined with regard to the education and/or propaganda it presented to the membership. How did the *Bulletin* help members comprehend the workings of the League of Nations and how did it encourage women to aspire towards public involvement and the "practical politics" of the organization.

Chapter 6, The Conclusion: This final chapter contains assessments of the non-formal education of the organization in relation to the educational, propaganda and feminist agenda of the organization. It finalizes the research questions. The ICW is interpreted as an agency which provided for, catered to, and encouraged its female membership to become educated about and involved in practical politics and collective action to improve the condition of women everywhere. It contains an analysis of the re-alignment

of the woman's movement in the inter-war years and the particular interpretation of the ICW regarding the equal moral standard as well as the experiment that was the League of Nations.

At this point it is necessary to discuss the initial beginnings and the background of the ICW. The next chapter will set the historiographical and appropriate scholarly context for the study of the ICW and discuss the role of non-formal adult education as a means of improving the condition of women in society.

ENDNOTES

[1]For the seed of this idea go to the introduction of A. James Hammerton's *Emigrant Gentlewomen Genteel Poverty and Female Emigration 1830-1914* (London: Croom Helm, 1979).

[2]Lee Holcombe, *Victorian Ladies at Work: Middle-Class Working Women in England and Wales, 1850-1914* (Newton Abbot, 1973), p. 5, quoted in Hammerton's *Emigrant Gentlewomen*, p.11.

[3] Studies other than Whittick's include: J.L. & Barbara Hammond, *The Town Labourer, 1760-1832*, (London: Longmans, Green and Co.,1920); Thomas Walter Laquer, *Religion and Respectability (Sunday Schools for Adults)* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976); W. P. McCann, *The Educational Innovators, 1750-1880*, (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1967); John McLeish, *Evangelical Religion and Popular Education* (London: Methuen, 1969); J.F.C.Harrison's,*Learning and Living* (London: Routledge, 1963).

[4] B. Semmel, *The Methodist Revolution* (New York: Basic Books, 1973); Harold Silver, *The Concept of Popular Education: A Study of Ideas and Social Movements in the Early Nineteenth Century* (London: MacGibbon and Kee, 1965); Hugh M. Pollard, *Pioneers of Popular education 1760-1850* (London: J. Murray, 1956).

[5]P.A.White "Socialization and Education" in R.F.Dearden, P.H. Hirst and R.S. Peters eds., *Education and the development of reason* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972), p.114.

[6]R.S. Peters "What is an Educational Process?" in *The Concept of Education* edited by R.S.Peters (New York: Routledge & Keagan Paul, 1967), p.4.

[7]For examples of such plays see Bettina Friedl ed., *On To Victory: Propaganda Plays of the Woman Suffrage Movement* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1987).

[8] Arnold Whittick, *Woman Into Citizen* (London: Atheneum 1979).

[9]*Bulletin*, Vol.XIII, no.5 (January 1934), p.40.

[10]Some examples of studies that address this re-alignment are Elizabeth Fox Genovese's *Feminism Without Illusions* (University of North Carolina Press, 1991); Linda Kealey and Sangster, eds., *Beyond the Vote* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989); Stanley Lemons *The Woman Citizen.*;P.T. Rooke and R. Schnell , "That Women Might Speak for Women: Feminist Non-Formal Education at the League of Nations, 1920-1934" Paper presented to the History of Education Society, Minneapolis, Oct.1995.

CHAPTER I

THE SILENT EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM

Most studies addressing women's organisations and their corresponding role in international issues have emphasized efforts to influence government policy either nationally or in multilateral settings. This study examines a separate but related problem: how women's international organizations attempted to educate their members, and all women generally, and how they equipped and led women, through non-formal education, to the means of improving their condition and the condition of society as it related to women. This chapter attempts to establish the historical setting for the ICW and the educational programs it administered.

WOMEN'S VOLUNTARY ASSOCIATION

Influencing government policy and educating members to do so were interlinked objectives in the mainstream, liberal-feminist women's movement at the turn of the century. Women's organizations in the Anglo-American world in the late nineteenth and early twentieth-centuries were rarely able to operate as pressure groups, having no access to government power or recognition in the decision-making process. Women realized that they, as a group, must seek other means of making their demands heard. In areas not recognized as women's domain, that is, in the areas of politics and power which were considered the arena of men, women's organizations deliberately sought and developed means of forcing legal and political authorities to attend to their demands. One successful instrument was the effective mobilization of women on a world-wide scale.

Such mobilization was achieved through international organizations and their information networks of national and local affiliates, and through a very deliberate and determined agenda of non-formal education. This included conscious efforts to educate women and familiarize them with their political and social situations. Movement leaders purposefully and deliberately with the intention of motivating rank and file members to take action to remedy perceived injustices at all levels of political and social life educated their memberships into "practical politics."

The ICW was founded on March 3, 1888 in Washington, D.C. at the close of a conference convened to celebrate the 40th anniversary of the meeting held at Seneca Falls, New York State in 1848.[1] This first meeting of the ICW was attended by forty-nine delegates, representing fifty-three different national women's organizations and nine countries: England, France, Norway, Denmark, Sweden, Finland, India, Canada and the United States.

The ICW is an example of an international woman's voluntary organization that emerged at the end of the nineteenth-century in response to perceived social problems and the growing crusade for literacy and reform. The women who formed its membership were the self-appointed moral guardians of the family and society. They understood that through voluntary association and a separate female "sphere,"[2] coupled with the various means of non-formal education, the ICW represented a committed, yet moderate feminist public forum for the achievement of public moral reform. The building of networks through voluntary organizations provided women with an arena for discourse and participation in social, cultural and political life. This process has been referred to as

"female institution building."[3] The achievements of women during the early twentieth-century were a direct result of the formation of these separate female institutions.

When we speak of women's "voluntary association" we mean any group of individuals who come together in an informal and free manner to work towards a common purpose. Non-formal education will be used in this work to describe the processes which take place away from the traditional curriculum-centred institutes of learning. It is the method of appraising the needs and the pursuits of adults—of communicating with them, stimulating them to participate, helping them to obtain essential skills to employ behavioral patterns, and related activities which will increase their productivity and enrich their standard of living.[4] Keeping this brief description in mind the study examines the nature and extent of the non-formal education employed by the ICW.

The use of the term "feminist" requires some consideration at this point. In a strictly linguistic sense the term was not referenced in England until the 1890s [5] However, the majority of women associated with women's reform plainly identified with the ideologies and issues of female equality that would become foremost in the feminist movement. They were clearly concerned with equal treatment, albeit equal moral treatment, and women's rights. The repeal movement pointed to a woman's culture and public politics that, even though it could not probably be strictly defined as feminist, was at least what some have named proto-feminist.[6]

The mandate of the ICW embraced the equal educational, industrial, professional and political rights for women: the Council unanimously proclaimed itself in favour of

the free opening of all institutions of learning to women, of industrial training for both sexes, of equal wages to be paid for equal work and of an identical standard of personal purity and morality for men and women.[7] The preamble that was accepted by the delegates in 1888 was simple. It was grounded in the belief that women who gathered together in voluntary association could advance the good of humanity and further the application of the Golden Rule to society, custom and law: Do Unto Others As Ye Would Have Them Do Unto You. (See Appendix I). By 1907 the ICW claimed a membership of 4 to 5 million women and by 1925 its claims to membership had increased to 36 million peaking in the 1930s at 40 million.[8] These clubwomen, however, were not trailblazers seeking university entrance or suffrage (initially); instead, they were ordinary, conservative, Victorian women pursuing education, self-improvement, and female friendship through club affiliation. The club movement had become an important and legitimate vehicle for the education of Victorian women.[9] It was in this milieu that women could congregate, learn and discuss ways of improving society: a function that was the domain of "true womanhood."[10]

THE 'COUNCIL IDEA'

At a time of active club association the ICW was unique in its recognition of internationalism. The ICW was among the first to grant women the notion of universality–all women are alike everywhere–a hotly contested idea in today's feminist circles. During the nineteenth-century however, none had to this date claimed women to be universal except for the idea that all women had an innate capacity for evil. This was the first introduction of the concept of women as universal citizens in positive and

institutional ways. The implicit and explicit assumptions of universality pushed the boundaries of understanding and was an important understanding of the ICW in terms of the potential of women's achievements. This unique understanding was communicated through the educational agenda of the organisation. An article written by Lady Aberdeen, the ICW President, stated the objects of the ICW and relates this understanding:

> 1.To promote unity, mutual understanding and trust amongst women workers for the welfare of humanity in all countries
> 2.To provide a means of communication between women's organisations in all countries.
> 3.To provide opportunities for women to meet together from all parts of the world to confer upon questions relating to the welfare of the commonwealth, the family and the individual, and how to further the application of the Golden Rule to society, custom and law.[11]

The "Council Idea" was conceptualized as a chain of freely formed National Councils in countries across the world with representatives from various national groups and organisations. Women would assemble without distinction of race, creed or class for the purpose of improving the status of women everywhere and for the universal benefit of the whole human race. The ideals of the organization were encapsulated in the philosophy that was formulated at the first meeting:

> We, women of all nations, in the conviction that the good of humanity will be best advanced by greater unity of thought, sympathy and purpose, and that an organised movement will serve to promote the highest good of the family and of the nation, do hereby band ourselves together in a federation of women of all races, nations and creeds, to further the application of the Golden Rule to society, custom and law: Do Unto Others As Ye Would That They Should Do Unto You.[12]

The structure of the ICW is straightforward. I use present tense here deliberately in order to convey the ongoing nature and existence of the ICW. The ICW still functions in much the same manner as it did last century despite the constant updating and revision of programs to meet contemporary needs. It consists of the International Council, the National Councils, Provincial Councils and Local Councils.

This structure provides a method of transmission of information from the top down and from the bottom up which ensures that women, through the process of active discussion and debate, can be educated about the issues of the council. The ICW has an International President and a Board of Directors. In addition, it has an Executive Committee which is composed of the Presidents of the National Councils and the Conveners and Vice-Conveners of the Standing Committees. All ICW offices fall vacant at the end of each three-year period. Positions are elected and voting is held to install each new administration. Members of the Board, Conveners of Standing Committees and the Presidents of National Councils are able to vote. Any member of any National Council may be nominated by her council to fill an international position.

In 1899, the Council set up a series of Standing Committees to undertake sections of the work. This structure still exists and has been expanded in number to meet changing needs. The first Standing Committee set up was for Peace and International Arbitration. Some of the earliest standing committees were on Laws, Public Health, Education, Emigration and Immigration, Trades and Professions, and Child Welfare. Each standing committee has an elected Convener and Vice-Convener. The Board and the Executive Committee have the power to set up Ad Hoc Committees to investigate

new interests. In some cases these Ad Hoc Committees have been the initial step in developing new standing committees.

The aims and ideals of the ICW have remained relevant to women. The aim to unite women of the world in voluntary association in a workable structure which encourages dialogue and co-operation, to focus the discourse of women and yet to regard the individual women in the wider context of humanity so that the individual citizen and humanity are parts of the same whole—remains as theoretically pertinent today as it was in 1888. This is evident in the fact that the ICW is still operating in 70 countries around the world. In many ways this democratic vision of participatory citizenship fits in with the progressive philosophy of community and social action exemplified best by John Dewey's interpretation of democracy. Dewey's idea of democracy is an ideal that rests on "faith in the capacity of human beings for intellectual judgment and action if proper conditions are furnished."[13] In short, the ICW was part of a larger web of formal and non-formal educational programs as well as social reforms which have been identified by historians as representing the "progressive movement." Progressivism flourished in the last decades of the nineteenth-century and well into the first half of the twentieth-century.[14] Moreover, progressive philosophy with its belief in the perfectability of society was compatible with the philosophy of the ICW.

The organizational apparatus which has provided the ICW with the flexibility to achieve this appeal covered a wide range of diversity, education, and political achievement. Although originating in a strong Anglo-Saxon base including the United States, Canada, Great Britain, Australia, and New Zealand, the ICW spread to developing

states and nations such as India. Many of the member nations, like Greece, Argentina and France, achieved enfranchisement for their members at different times. France, for example, did not obtain the vote for women until the third decade of the twentieth-century. Still other countries contained states within their nationhood, e.g. Quebec, in Canada did not gain the vote for women until the 1940s. These uneven developments, diverse social, political, and economic conditions make the governance of an organization such as the ICW complex and difficult to control, much less to research. Lady Aberdeen, the ICW President, elaborated on the complexity of the range of the organization in her later writing. She noted that "contact with the different nations showed me the enormous difficulties in the way of bringing together these heterogeneous elements in harmonious action for the welfare and progress of the human race." [15] In light of such diversity the mandate of the ICW—to raise the consciousness of its membership by combining discourse and action—was a challenge.[16]

It was not deemed sufficient merely to be "aware" of women's status in society or sensitive to those areas where women's status was diminished and inequitable. The discourse—in this case transmitted through an educational process and product—the *Bulletin*—was intended to inspire and encourage social action through organizational means. This action in turn was widely recognized by women's organizations ranging from international to national to local as a form of "practical politics." Practical politics was a term widely recognized and understood by early twentieth-century feminists as a lingua franca utilized in public arenas and found in speeches, addresses, publications, and correspondence. It has been discussed by Temma Kaplan and later translated again

into a synonymous term "civic maternalism" by Seth Kovan and Sonja Michel.[17]

This study tests the different understandings of first-wave, or turn-of-the-century feminism which has been variously described as maternal feminism, domestic feminism, social feminism among others. Because of the international identity if the ICW, the general term social feminism will be used. Social feminism values the moral influence of women, ascribing importance to the woman's maternal role. It recognizes that women's work serves a larger social and political role and this recognition is enough to draw the "sphere" closer to the world of men and power. The maternal and moralistic element fell in line with the essentially conservative natures of the women who joined the ICW. This, in turn, was in tune with the social order of the times. Social feminists were not involved, except when their goals co-incided, with the radical feminists of the day who campaigned on a single cause issue—female suffrage. They, instead, viewed the state as a larger home in need of mothering; but by impinging upon the domestic circle, the state conceded motherhood a public role and a social responsibility.[18] This is evident in Lady Aberdeen's description of the work of the ICW as a "grand woman's mission" which could best be explained in one word, "mothering." This demonstrates that the ICW certainly understood their work to be associated with the notion of mothering. The notion of mothering would not upset the established system but was an area that women felt they could become involved and help change the system for women. This was not a concept isolated to the ICW. Mothering was the understanding of a number of associations involved in women's reform which will be discussed more fully later in the thesis.

"Practical politics" and "civic consciousness" appear to be used interchangeably. Women's organizations provided a non-formal means of female civic organization and a collective form of socialization into the polity. Within this framework a dialectical relationship can be discerned between the concepts of education and the practices of consciousness-raising as a form of praxis. Therefore the term "practical politics"will be used throughout the study to demonstrate this praxis or relationship between feminist discourse and social action or reform.[19] In addition, feminism itself cannot be distinguished from the implicit and explicit educative functions of any kind of consciousness-raising. The international organization which forms the basis for this proposal declared its feminist agenda openly and without equivocation. The leadership of the organization made its educational goals explicit by linking these to social change which would transform gender and power relations.

Women's organizations often included non-formal educational programs in their activities. The International Federation of University Women (IFUW) and the World Young Women's Christian Association (WYWCA) are cases in point. The agendas of the World Women's Party (U.S.A.), the Open Door International, the Six Point Group and Equal Rights International (G.B.) made explicit connections between female education and social change. So too did the catholic, but nonetheless expressly feminist organization which was international in membership and which espoused a strong commitment to "equity" feminism, the St. Joan's Social and Political Alliance. Indeed, its monthly organ, *The Catholic Citizen*, unfailingly emphasized this educational function. For example, in 1923 as it discussed the shift from suffrage objectives to a

more generalized citizenship training it stated its aim was to "further the work of Catholic women as citizens" and "to educate speakers to present their case... before other Feminist Organizations."[20] The ICW could not have spoken about its aims more succinctly. Organizations such as the International League for Peace and Freedom, the World Union of Women for International Concord and the International Alliance also sought to educate their memberships and the general public into principles of peace, anti-militarism, and co-operation.[21] Therefore, the ICW was no exception as an agency with an educational purpose.

However, this study does not elaborate all of these "other" efforts, but will examine how a single women's organization is represented as a particularly striking study in the political education of women. Such an organizational setting can be seen as an attempt by women to influence female attitudes and beliefs with regard to the injustices surrounding their status at all levels of public life and to motivate them to take appropriate action, individually and collectively. It helped them to acquire the skills and knowledge needed to effect the changes it deemed necessary for women. These activities are discussed in the *Bulletin* as cases of non-formal political education and socialization. Rooke and Schnell take note of this when they observe:

> Although political education may occur in formal settings most political socialization takes place outside formal institutions. Clearly, the most salient settings are in social interaction between family members, friends and acquaintances. A second major setting is found in non-formal situations. This form of education or socialization has been described as any organized educational activity outside the established formal system—whether operating separately or as an important part of some broader activity—that is intended to serve identifiable learning clienteles and learning objectives.[22]

The political education for collective action of ICW members occurred in most settings as well as in participation at the Council level whether locally, nationally or internationally. It occurred through training for conferences, through correspondence, through public speaking and while women engaged in groups. All of these processes acted as a means of consciousness-raising as well as personal development, and refining of various skills.

The ICW consists of three levels: the local, the national and the international level. This study does not attempt to deal with either the local or the national levels, their structure, membership or their executive, except when issues relate directly to the international organization. The study addresses the issues of the non-formal education provided by the ICW through the organ of the *Bulletin,* as it pertains and was relevant to all of its membership. Furthermore, the study will be conducted from the perspective of an outsider/non-member being educated about the issues carried in the *Bulletin.* The study will therefore be conducted from the outside looking in rather than from the inside looking out. The opportunity provided by the *Bulletin* made it easier for members spread across the globe to know one another's actions and join across wide social and geographical divides, diffusing information to assist in national social movements–practical politics..

The publication of the ICW monthly newsletter, the *Bulletin*, began in 1922. This publication became the official voice of the ICW and carried the values, ideas and ideals of the ICW to the membership. As such it played a role in reporting on and propagating models for collective action. It served to deliver information about how to deal with the

issues that were important to the ICW. Members could read the *Bulletin* and join in what Sidney Tarrow terms "invisible communities of discourse" building solidarity for collective action.[23] If members of the Finnish National Council could read how French towns and cities closed down their *maisons tolérées* then it became possible to follow example and close them down in Finland.

> ...once it had occurred, it entered the accumulating memory of print....The experience was shaped by millions of printed words into a 'concept' on the printed page, and, in due course, into a model.[24]

The *Bulletin* made members aware of a common identity and linked members to one another in invisible communities. This link between print and propaganda was highly developed by the early twentieth-century. The *Bulletin* provides a clear example of the delicate balance between propaganda and political socialization. In short, the *Bulletin* provides us with a chronological summation of the ICW's non-formal educational program for adult women, a program inculcating values of democratic citizenship and female participation in the polity. This newsletter is still being published today; it furnishes us with a rich, continuous account of the history of women as they progressed into and through the twentieth-century. It supplies us with a precise record which allows us to examine the nature and purpose of the educational program of adult non-formal education set out primarily for the women who formed its membership. Furthermore, it elaborates on its secondary function: to educate interested others (men) whose sympathies and support would assist in its fullest implementation at the international level.

SURVEY OF THE LITERATURE

This is a study of middle-class women in a middle-class organization, derived from the group's own records which understandably will be limited and self-serving. The criticism that women make of mainstream history that excludes women is that it is taken from a limited, middle-class male perspective which ignores class and gender, but also ethnicity and race and assumes that both issues are collapsible. This criticism may be raised similarly for this study. Why is there no attention paid to ethnicity or race? Why is there no inclusion of working-class women? By way of rationalization, the successively wider attempts to include all women to the extent that middle-class women have been stereotyped and dismissed is the issue. The assumption is that everything is known about the middle-class woman. One purpose of this study is to illustrate the limitations of this stereotype. While there is no intention to refute this argument there is however, through a genuine scholarly approach, an attempt to argue that there is more story to be told. This study will not contradict nor revolutionize present scholarship, but it will suggest that there is more to be learned. It suggests that maybe the stereotypes have been too quickly framed, accepted, and dismissed. This study will contribute, in a scholarly manner, evidence to flesh out the understanding of this group of women who worked in international organisations like the ICW to expand the public role of women within the bounds of the dominant ideal of the separate sphere. It posits that there is a complexity to offer that has not been completely explored. The study presents some general conclusions that will elaborate upon or refine the present understanding. It presents a sphere of characters that are more interesting than have been previously

thought–that have more story to be told.

This is a study from a feminist history perspective which concentrates on the consciousness-raising agenda and agency of the ICW. The research strategies selected for this study were influenced by the type and availability of the material chosen to address the research question. The primary source for the study is the published issues of the *Bulletin*. The examination of the printed articles, advertising, minutes, president's messages, and correspondence in the *Bulletin* of the ICW provides the data for the study. Such data has been analyzed, collated, synthesized, and interpreted as a study in female adult non-formal education. The *Bulletin* is an important data base as it gives a history of the journal, its membership, and controversial developments in the women's movement in the inter-war years.

While it is accurate to claim, as I have, that to date there is no study on the ICW which isolates and specifically examines its non-formal educational agenda as a form of praxis (practical politics and discourse) it would be inaccurate to claim that such a study is discrete and isolated. The ICW along with such organizations as the IAW, the YWCA, the IFUW, The Women's Christian Temperance Union, The United Farm Women of Alberta, and the Women's Institutes are some of the examples of the civic maternalism and civic consciousness that have received scholarly attention. Indeed, many women's organizations have received a great deal of examination from a feminist perspective, as well as from the less interpretative perspective of women's history as narrative. *Woman Into Citizen,* by Arnold Whittick examined the journals of the organization of the International Alliance of Women (IAW) as a method of communication for its

membership. As such, it was a useful and helpful work in guiding the study. The main difference however, is that, unlike Whittick's work, this is not an"in-house" version or interpretation of the organization. Furthermore, this is a specific analysis of the adult non-formal educational agenda of the ICW as seen through the organ of the *Bulletin*. The *Bulletin* was circulated world-wide and sought to inform and shape the attitudes and political conduct of an international body of predominantly (but not exclusively) middle-class women (members and non-member readerships).

At this point it might prove useful to attend to the differences between women's history and feminist history. "Women's history has a dual goal: to restore women to history and to restore our history to women."[25] Women's history is generally understood to be an examination of the private sphere of women's lives. It centres around and concentrates on women's roles within the family in the diverse stages of their lives. It deals with the relationships women create between and for themselves, rather than with institutions or men (except in the context of the family). Women's history seeks out information concerning the lives of women, the considerations that influence decision making, the manner in which women balance personal goals, prescriptive directives, and public and private constraint. It deals with experiences and frameworks which illuminate how women make sense of and relate to their status in the world.[26] "We have made of sex a category as fundamental to our analysis of the social order as other categories such as class and race."[27]

Feminist history, or gender history as it is sometimes called, on the other hand, is associated with explicit ideological approaches and strategies. It centres around

constructs of power, domination and oppression. It associates with the methodologies of post-structuralist theoreticians such as Jacques Derrida and Michel Foucault.[28]

The difference between the history of men and women is recognised as a social construction involving a power relationship that is embedded in language. Women's rights and the emancipation of women are pivotal issues in this discourse. Feminist historians speak of "representation," "discourse," and "gender." In place of experience, feminist historians speak of representations that are either present or absent in texts; in place of identities, they speak of discourses constructing subjects; and in place of women's experiences, they speak of "gender" as that which gives meaning to sexual differences.[29] Feminists historians aim at consciousness-raising. "Consciousness about one's particular life and experience is the primary knowledge one needs, not only to begin to investigate 'bodies of knowledge,' but to establish them in the first place."[30] Feminist history highlights the radical potential of feminism.[31] Feminist history frequently provides documentation and evidence about women's political movements which serve to provide strategy for contemporary activism.

Given this preamble it must be said that there is an extensive body of literature which elaborates three major strands that will concern the evidence for this project: (a) the ideology of maternal, civic, or social feminism; (b) the trope of separate spheres; and (c) institution building—in order to translate women's organizational genius into a means of non-formal adult education. The latter strand has been studied by previous scholars more implicitly than explicitly. This study will present a reverse scenario.

FEMINISM: IDEOLOGY AND STRATEGY

This work develops and defines the theme of feminism as it operated within the ICW. Defining the term feminism has been a difficult and contested endeavor, many historians claiming the inadequacy of the single term. During much of the history of feminism the term feminism itself has been associated with the radical or extreme faction of women's political effort, for example, the suffragettes of the late nineteenth-century.[32]

Among the earliest to become involved in the scholarship on feminism were Aileen Kraditor and William O'Neill whose interpretation and definitions of feminism are similar. The work done by these two in defining feminism remains influential in the field today. In 1968 William O'Neill coined the term "social feminism" to identify those women who placed particular social reforms ahead of women's rights. Looking at the political activities of late nineteenth-century and early twentieth-century women O'Neill felt that the term feminist referred to a limited aspect of women's political activities. He felt that the term social feminist described a greater percentage of those women who were active and involved in social reform. He contrasted social feminists with what he termed "hard-core feminists" who were the radical or extreme group that agitated for political and social reform. [33] This definition has remained a popular nomenclature and has been discussed by feminist writers and historians who use social feminism as a starting point from which to base their arguments. [34] The ICW and other women's organizations like the YWCA and the WCTU who were not initially involved in the suffrage issue aptly fit O'Neill's classification of social feminism.

Stanley Lemons' *The Woman Citizen: Social Feminism in the 1920s*, was influenced by the Kraditor/O'Neill model but focused on social feminism as a form of the Progressive reform popular and prevalent at the time. Cott (1989) says that in Lemons' hands social feminism became a proxy for the female Progressive.[35] Gerda Lerner in 1971 noted the broad spectrum of definition of feminism and urged women to distinguish between women's rights feminism and women's emancipation feminism. She explained women's rights as the winning or obtaining of legal rights, such as suffrage, property rights, and office holding. Emancipation rights, she said, pertained to the oppressive restrictions imposed by sex.[36] In 1973 Daniel Scott Smith produced his influential work that outlined a nineteenth-century tradition of domestic feminism, and the assertion of the private power that women held within the circle of domestication or the home. He maintained that women, especially nineteenth-century women, asserted a private power over their reproductive rights as a feminist issue.[37] Linda Blair 1980, takes Scott Smith's definition of domestic feminism and develops it further stating that women justified their departure from the home to exert special influence over the male sphere. By evoking their supposed natural talents, women took their Victorian domesticity with them as they ventured forth into the world of reform and practical politics.[38] Smith's concept of domestic feminism has had considerable impact on feminist historical discourse.

Social feminism refers to the tenet that woman's special role as mother gives her the duty and the right to participate in the public sphere. Social feminism de-emphasizes or sub-ordinates personal autonomy in favour of a (relatively) wider social role. At the

end of the nineteenth-century, knowledge of the new social sciences reinforced the idea that women possessed special biological qualities which suited them for repairing the socially damaged economic world. It was this biological quality, relating to nurturing, that gave women the authority to engage in social reform.[39] As these women entered into new relations with the state their political awareness and acumen was sharpened and expanded.[40]

Wayne Roberts notes that although women identified with a "mothering role" that provided a starting point for social reform and concerns, this role did not pre-determine women's consent of her subversive position within the family state.[41] The emphasis placed on motherhood was a muted manner of enhancing the autonomy of women. Marianne Valverde added the element of social cleansing or sanitizing to the understanding in her work *The Age of Light, Soap and Water...*"[42] Social feminism equipped women as moral housekeepers. It was a complex fusion of ideology and strategy by which women could achieve reform without threatening the status quo... "politicians came to realize that a movement dominated by conservative reformers offered no feminist threat...."[43] Thus was the conservative nature of the Victorian women who were termed social feminists. And such was the nature of ICW women members.

Women leaders like Lady Aberdeen saw and understood the complex relationship between their search for power and influence in society as a whole and the ideology of mothering. Mothering represented an effective strategy for entering the public political sphere of men. Mothering was not to be confined or restricted to a single household but

expanded, almost indefinitely, to embrace the whole of society.

Naomi Black suggests in her *Social Feminism* that strong leaders, and Lady Aberdeen certainly fits this description, were often distinctive in their perspectives on feminism and it is unlikely, she maintains, that their views were fully understood even by the groups they led. However, Lady Aberdeen was not alone in this interpretation and understanding of mothering as ideology and strategy. Many, if not most, of the big women's organisations adhered to the concept of mothering. Jessie C.Smith of the WCTU declared "A nation rises no higher than its mothers"[44]

Black suggests that the collective, shared beliefs of an organisation are to be found in the flow of communications.[45] Lady Aberdeen in her "President's Message" in the *Bulletin* maintained a constant agenda and reminder to women members that the world was in need of their mothering. Whenever she spoke at public meetings of the ICW she reminded the members of their responsibility.

> But in the meantime, how can be [sic] best describe this woman's mission in a word? Can we not best describe it as "mothering" in one sense or another? We are not all called on to be mothers of little children, but every woman is called upon to "mother" in some way or another....[46]

We can interpret this complex argument and understanding of mothering as a clever strategic means by which to catapult the ICW into the world of public power and influence. "Women could venture forth and spring clean the nooks and crannies of the world" thereby becoming involved in the political arena which added to and changed the interpretations of the world as women knew it.

Later works by Temma Kaplan and Estelle Freedman present a persuasive case for "female consciousness" as a stimulus to collective action for and by women stemming from their shared sense of maternal nurturing and preservation of life. Freedman writes a convincing argument for "female institution building" when she says that the "historical and contemporary experiences that have created a unique female culture remain both salient for and compatible with the goal of sexual equality.[47] Both Kaplan and Freedman found that the "female consciousness" alive in women's networks was the result of women's acceptance, not rejection, of the division of labour by sex. Women's networks, through their acceptance of a special space for women, discovered that they were more able to affect social change, gain access to, and engage in tactics of practical politics. This resulted in women gaining a closer proximity to equality with men. This theory forms a plausible explanation for the explosion in numbers and the popularity of women's clubs and organizations from 1850 onward. These women, who became members of clubs and women's organizations were conscious of the strength and potential that these networks held for social and political reform.

Women welcomed the opportunity the organizations afforded them as women. They actively sought association with other women in order to avail themselves of the opportunity to participate in entry into a world previously denied them. Seth Kovan coined the term "civic maternalism" to further explore the irony of this double-sided consciousness of women's participation in public life.[48] This study substantiates and reinforces the idea that social feminism, in fact, sought out and welcomed this collective consciousness as a method of accessing entrance into the public domain. It sees these

efforts in terms of women's "agency" revising the usual interpretations of educational systems as forms of social control. In this case middle-class women acted on their own world and transformed learning into their own experience. This education was not something someone else did to them (e.g., males) rather it was an effective strategy to achieve "something SOUGHT AFTER AND GAINED" by WOMEN. [49]

THE TROPE OF SEPARATE SPHERES

The study develops several strands of feminist historiography especially where it has concentrated on the concept of true womanhood and the notion of separate spheres as they illuminate the years leading to women's suffrage and the development of a strong club movement. Alexis de Tocqueville, when visiting America in the 1840s, referred to the separation of male and female spheres. In one sentence, " the inexorable opinion of the public carefully circumscribes [her] within the narrow circle of domestic interests and duties and forbids her to step beyond it," he provided the physical image (the circle) and the interpretation (that it was a limiting boundary on choices) that would continue to characterize the metaphor that would become "separate spheres." [50] The scholarship of the 1960s saw the development of the metaphor of the separate sphere in the works of Barbara Welter, Aileen Kraditor, and Gerda Lerner. These scholars were influenced by Betty Friedan and *The Feminine Mystique* (1963) and all reinforced the centrality of the metaphor of separate spheres for women. The work presented the hypothesis that women's history had to be understood not only by way of events, but through a prism of ideology. Hence, the metaphor of the "sphere" became the figure of speech. The trope began to be used by historians to describe women's part in American and western

culture. Notions of women's sphere permeated the language. Erik Erikson gave the trope of separate spheres a psychological foundation. The metaphor helped historians select what to study and how to report what it was that they found.

Barbara Welter had identified the nineteenth-century stereotypical version of woman. She named it the "Cult of True Womanhood." Victorian virtues were isolated as domesticity, piety, purity, and submissiveness. Home was referred to as the woman's sphere. Welter concluded that women were constrained and restrained. Separation vilified women and kept them subject. Welter's essay has been much cited and the Cult of True Womanhood has become an essential component of the vocabulary and the analysis of women's history.

The 1970s saw the revisionist ideas of Smith-Rosenberg, Blanche Cook, and Kathryn Kish Sklar,[51] which shed new light and offered reinterpretations concerning the world of women. Smith-Rosenberg argued that a strong bond existed between women that enabled women to assist and support one another. The element of "sisterhood" was examined. The components of the physical location of women's sphere not only in the abstract, but in the explicit were examined for the first time. Carl N. Degler's book *At Odds: Women and the Family in America from the Revolution to the Present*, published in 1980, was a strong endorsement of women's separate spheres. Applying the work of Daniel Scott Smith, who coined the term "domestic feminism," Degler defined separate spheres as a significant nineteenth-century development. He maintained that separate spheres manoeurved and made credible the replacement of patriarchal family connections with companionate ones. "Separate spheres," he argued, averted conflict; the

very language suggested a separation which made room for gendered negotiations. The metaphor helped Degler organize uniformity among questions as diverse as abortion, suffrage, literacy, and friendship. Linda Kerber describes Degler's work as a wide-ranging, fluent, and thoughtful survey of women's and family history, but she cautions that it may well represent a dependence on separate spheres as an organizing mechanism.[52]

Recent critiques by Cott, Kerber and numerous others, drawing on the debates of the past decades, have recast the research agenda.[53] This study is sensitive to the subtleties indicated by more recent interpretations of the trope of "separate spheres" which suggest that feminist political power grew out of a separation afforded by a female sphere.[54] It is here that the trope, which has, in fact, perpetuated a set of interpretative problems of its own, intersects with the maternalist ideologies, which shaped the directions of female social reform programs current at the time of this study. These two concepts combined provide the critical focus for the location of the intersection between public and private spheres evident in the work of women's organizations such as the ICW. In conclusion, I refer to the associated Canadian corpus of work. Ramsay Cook and Wendy Mitchinson while defining women's proper sphere in Canada edited a collection of documents which were written between 1856-1930. The collection included documents of the National Council of Women of Canada.[55] Veronica Strong-Boag and Naomi Griffiths have produced substantial and valuable work on the Canadian National Council of Women.[56]

The social times and conditions which combined to form an interpretation of the conduct of the Victorian middle-class woman at the end of the nineteenth-century, both in Great Britain and in North America, produced conditions conducive for the foundation of the ICW. The middle-class women who formed the ICW were products of certain Victorian institutionalized values and mores which contributed to the establishment of an ideal of womanhood. The axiom that "woman's place is in the home" in fact, became a powerful example of the intersection of the public and private world of women and maternal feminist practical politics.

INSTITUTION BUILDING

This proposal contains a further strand of women's history, that of women's organizations as means of non-formal adult education. In short, the study of women's organizations is also a study of adult women's non-formal education. From the last century these organizational structures effectively transmitted important civic and political messages to memberships at all levels—local, national, and international. They contributed an important component to adult female education during a time when women's access to advanced education was restricted.[57] They engaged in ideological debate, and explored channels for individual self-discovery as well as for collective identity. A range of women's associations, literary clubs, and social reform movements engaged in what a later age would call "consciousness-raising"or the dissemination of propaganda and information, the compiling of statistical data, the collation and analysis of investigative studies, the development of public-speaking skills, journalistic writing, critical judgment, the translation of domestic management and economics into the public

forum, the organization of moral and social reform programs, and finally, the development of social science survey methods for application to social problems.[58] Womens organizations were crucial in forming women's civic awareness and encouraging citizen-participation through their programs of non-formal education.

RELATED WORKS

Much of the associated work on the ICW includes studies like *Woman in a Changing World: The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women* published by the ICW (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 19660; *Proud Heritage: A History of the National Council of Canada*, Rosa Shaw (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1957); "The Parliament of Women: The National Council of Women of Canada 1893-1929," Veronica Strong-Boag (Ph.D. diss. Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1976); *The Splendid Vision: Centennial History of the National Council of Women of Canada, 1893-1993*, Naomi E.S. Griffiths (Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1993). These studies have focused the scholarship on the organizational work and credentials of the council and its members either nationally or internationally. As such they are helpful in contributing to the knowledge of the accomplishments of the organization and form valuable and useful references.

Recent local dissertations either concerning the National Council of Women or other similar organisations, while they discuss education, do not engage the concept of non-formal adult education as the sole element of analysis, as this study does. Beverly Lynn Boutilier's "Gender, Organized Women, and the Politics of Institution Building: Founding the Victorian Order of Nurses for Canada, 1893-1900" (1996), is an historical

thesis and presents the argument that the NCWC was a non-hierarchical structure: an hypothesis tested in this work. Shelley Anne Marie Bosetti-Piche's "The Interest of Edmonton Club Women in Education, Health and Welfare, 1919-1930" (Ph.D. diss, University of Alberta, 1990) addresses education and club women. However, although these works concern themselves with the education that club women received or provided to children in programs in schooling or to young adults, they do not, as this study does, examine and isolate the conscious and deliberate efforts to educate the women club members themselves. This thesis examines how the ICW deliberately familiarized members with their political and social situation with the intention of motivating them to take action to remedy perceived injustices at all levels of political and social life–Nancy Sheehan's "Temperance, the WCTU, and Education in Alberta, 1905-1930" (Ph.D. diss, University of Alberta, 1980) and Nanci Langford's "First Generation and Lasting Impressions: The Gendered Identities of Prairie Homestead Women" (Ph.D. diss, University of Alberta, 1994) are others that deal with the non-formal education of adult women, but once again they do not isolate and deal with the non-formal education as the sole focus.

This study of the ICW will therefore examine the *Bulletin* to illuminate how the non-formal programs educated the adult members. The organisation was poised at the end of the First World War to assume its activities and to reestablish its programs. The Sixth Quinquennial Meeting of the ICW in Kristiania (now Oslo, Norway) in 1920, called for the ICW to resume the fight against the Traffic in Women and Children. It is of use at this point to turn to the historical and philosophical antecedents concerning the

ICW and the Traffic in order to understand the educational agenda of the ICW for its women members.

ENDNOTES

[1] The meeting at Seneca Falls was convened by Susan B. Anthony (1820-1906) and Elizabeth Cady-Stanton (1815-1902). It was the first meeting ever called in America to discuss women's rights.

[2] The metaphor of the "sphere" was the figure used to describe women's position within the culture of Victorian society. When exploring the traditions of historical discourse, historians found that notions of women's sphere saturated the language; they, in turn, used the same metaphor in their own depictions. Thus the relationship between the name—sphere—and the perception of what it actually named was reciprocal; widespread usage in the nineteenth-century directed the choices made by the twentieth-century historians about what to study and how to tell the stories that they reconstructed. One of our culture's presuppositions has been that men and women live and work in separate spheres. Erik H. Erikson gave the trope of separate spheres a psychological foundation when he studies the play habits of male and female children in the early 1960s. The three historians that have substantially reinforced the centrality of the metaphor were three women. Barbara Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood" in *Major Problems in American Women's History: Documents and Essays,* edited by Mary Beth Norton (Lexington, Mass:D.C. Health, 1989); Aileen Kraditor's *Up From the Pedestal: Selected Writings in the History of American Feminism* (Chicago: Quadrangle, 1968) and Gerda Lerner, "Women's Rights and American Feminism," in *American Scholar*, XI (Spring, 1971), 236-237; Linda K. Kerber "Separate Spheres, Female Worlds, Woman's Place: The Rhetoric of Women's History," in *The Journal of Women's History,* Vol. 75, (June, 1988), 9-39.

[3] Estelle Freedman names it thus in her article, "Separatism as Strategy: Female Institution Building and American Feminism , 1870-1930, in *Feminist Studies* 5, no.3 (Fall, 1979), pp.512-529.

[4] This definition borrows from the definition provided by the "Report of the Conference and Workshop on Non-Formal Education and the Rural Poor" (Michigan State University: Program of Studies in Non-Formal Education, Institute for International Studies, College of Education, , 1977), p.8

[5]Frank Mort, *Dangerous Sexualities:Medico-moral Politics in England since 1830* (New York: Routledge &Kegan Paul, 1987) p. 92.

[6]Judith Walkowitz suggests that identification of this kind did not guarantee a commitment to feminism, nor did it represent a committed challenge to the restrictions and social inequalities imposed on women. She notes a significant discrepancy between the rhetoric of female solidarity and the actions of most female moral reformers. Female reformers might identify with women's special interests, she says, but more likely their actual relationship with working class women was class structured, hierarchical, manipulative and punitive. See Walkowitz *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class and State* (London: Cambridge University Press, 1980),p.131.

[7]The International Council of Women's *Women in a Changing World: The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women Since 1888*(London: Routledge & Kagan Paul, 1966), p.14.

[8] The number–40 million members–is difficult to confirm. It was used extensively throughout the inter-war period as "the number" ranging from the November 1928 edition of the *Bulletin Vol.VII*, no.3 and the February 1932 edition of the *Bulletin Vol. X*, no.6 quoting the membership of the ICW as consisting of 41 National Councils of Women, "with their membership of over 40 millions of women." The April 1935 edition quotes the ICW as representing "40 millions of women in 40 countries"–Germany had at that point withdrawn. The November 1936 issue , the March 1937, and the May 1939 issues all quote the membership number as 40 million.
It is difficult to check accurate membership numbers as the composition of the ICW, with its systems of affiliated societies, is so complex. In the February *Bulletin* of 1924 the National Council of Hungary stated that in 1914 the Council had 250 affiliated societies. The March 1926 *Bulletin* quotes Belgium as having 31 affiliated societies "with about 50,000 members all told." The November 1926 *Bulletin* quotes Germany as having 77 affiliated associations; Switzerland as having 150, and Great Britain as having 150.The December 1926 *Bulletin* quotes the National Council in the Kingdom of the Serbes, Croates and Slovenes as having 325 affiliated societies and a total of 40,000 members. The October 1931 *Bulletin* quotes Canada as having a membership of 400,000. *The Year Book for 1938 The National Council of Women of Canada* lists 17 Nationally Organized Societies in Federation, p.232 but the Local Council of Toronto, for example, lists 72 Affiliated Societies, p.223, while Ottawa lists 93, p.219 and Vancouver lists 76, p.203.
The *Bulletin* consistently quotes the ICW as having between 40-42 member nations, however, *Women in A Changing World in AppendixII*, p.350 notes 26 member nations, Leila Rupp in *Worlds of Women The Making of an International Women's Movement*, p.16-18 notes 36 countries. The number 40 was probably used as for the purposes of propaganda.

[9]The club movement began in North America, for white, English-speaking, middle-class women after the Civil War, in the late 1860s. It created one of the central social movements of the latter part of the nineteenth-century. Club membership offered the opportunities and experiences which could shape and alter society as these women knew it. Embedded in maternal feminism, the club movement aimed at maintaining the nature of the woman's traditional place. However, by sheer force of numbers it developed into a movement of huge proportion, and took on an energy of its own when women discovered the power of education. Unlike the revolutionary suffrage movement, this movement began as a conventional ripple which appealed to many ordinary women. In the final translation, however, the club movement became an exercise in radical adult education. It provided these ordinary women with a means of accessing the public sphere and the twentieth-century.

[10]For a discussion on Victorian womanhood see, Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood" in *American Quarterly* 155, 1966; Nancy Cott, "Passionlessness: An Interpretation of Victorian Sexual Ideology, 1790-1850," in *A Heritage of Her Own: Towards a New Social History of American Women* , Nancy Cott, Elizabeth H. Pleck eds. (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1979); Linda Kerber, "Separate Spheres, Female Worlds, Woman's Place: The Rhetoric of Women's History" in *The Journal of American History* (1989), pp.9-39; Caroll Smith-Rosenberg, "The Female World of Love and Ritual: Relations Between Women in Nineteenth-Century America," in *Signs* (Autumn, 1975), 1-24; Sheila Rothman, *Woman's Proper Place: A History of Changing Ideals and Practices, 1870 to the Present* (New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, 1978)

The International Council's *Women in a Changing World The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women since 1888* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1966), p.329.

[12]This motto was found in an updated pamphlet published by the ICW titled This motto was found in an updated pamphlet published by the ICW titled "The International Council of Women: What it is and what it does," p.1. no date. This undated article was written by Lady Aberdeen, The Marchioness of Aberdeen and Temair, ICW. Paris. File: Publicity. Lady Aberdeen was the wife of the Governor General of Canadian. She became the first President of the ICW and remained almost continuously involved as President until her death on April 18, 1939.

[13]John Dewey, "Creative Democracy: The Task Before Us" in *Later Works* (1939), 14:227, quoted in Robert B. Westwood's *John Dewey and American Democracy* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991), p.xv.

[14]Progressivism was a broadly based reform movement that reached its peak in the early twentieth-century. This movement began in response to and as a result of the vast changes brought about by the industrial revolution. The factory system, the movement of people from the country to the cities in search of factory-work created conditions that were onerous and difficult. As a result, dedicated men and women set up programs of social reform and programs of self-help aimed at improving conditions for those around them who were less fortunate. There is a large body of literature dealing with the connection between Progrssivism and women's activities. The following are only a few examples: J. Stanley Lemons, *The Woman Citizen: Social Feminism in the 1920s* (University Press of Virginia, 1973); Sheila Rothman, *Woman's Proper Place*, 1978; Lynn McDonald, *The Woman Founders of the Social Sciences* (Carleton University Press, 1994); Anne Firor Scott, *Natural Allies: Women's Associations in American History* (University of Illinois Press, 1991); Linda K. Kerber, Alice Kessler-Harris, Kathryn Kish Sklar, eds. *U.S. Women's History* (University of North Carolina Press, 1995); Ellen Condliffe Lageman, *A Generation of Women: Education in the Lives of Progressive Reformers* (Harvard University Press, 1979); and Susan Lynn *Progressive Women in Conservative Times* (Rutgers University Press, 1992), especially 1-3.

[15]Quoted from Marjorie Pentland's (Lady Aberdeen's daughter) *A Bonnie Fechter* (London: B.T. Batsford, 1952), p.137.

[16]For a detailed discussion on the relationship between consciousness raising , propaganda and feminism see the detailed analysis developed by P.T. Rooke and R.L. Schnell "That Women Might Speak for Women: Feminist Non-Formal education at the League of Nations, 1920-1934." Paper presented to the History of Education Society, Minneopolis, Oct. 1995.

> If propaganda is an organized schema for the propagation of a doctrine or practice-and feminism falls into both categories–then it is obvious that it is fundamental to the feminist enterprise that women and men alike be persuaded as to the reasonableness, efficacy, and justice, of transforming the androcentric nature of gender-systems. Consequently, consciousness-raising undergirds the praxis of and it in their practice that the ICW, and women's organisations, provides us with exemplary role models of this praxis. p.9.

Also see Dale Spender "On Feminism and Propaganda" and Cary Nelson "Envoys of Otherness: Difference and Continuity in Feminist Criticism," in *For Alma Mater: Theory and Practice in Feminist Scholarship*, eds. Paula A. Treichler, Cheris Kramarae, and Beth Stafford (Chicago: University of Illinois, 1985), p.94.

[17]Seth Kovan uses the term "Civic Maternalism" in "Civic Maternalism and the Welfare State: The Case of Mrs. Humphrey Ward." This paper was presented to the Berkshire Conference on Women's History, Wellesley, 1987. See also Kovan and Sonja Michel, "Womanly Duties: Maternalist Politics and the Origins of the Welfare State in France, Germany, Great Britain and the United States, 1880-1920," in *American Historical Review* 95 (Oct.1990), 1076-1108, especially 1079; and "Gender and the Origins of the Welfare State," in *Radical History Review*, 43 (1989), 112-119. Temma Kaplan prefers the term "female consciousness" to "feminist consciousness" because it does not necessarily repudiate the sexual division of labour and operates within a male-dominated political area. See "Female Consciousness and Collective Action: The Case of Barcelona 1910-1918," in *Signs* 7, (Spring, 1982), 545-66; and Nancy Cott's comments on Kaplan's work in "What's in a Name? The Limits of Social Feminism: Or, Expanding the Vocabulary of Women's History," in *Journal of American History* 76 (Dec. 1989), 808-829, espy. P.827.

[18] See Sarah Deutsch "Learning to Talk More Like a Man" in *American History Review*, vol.97, no.2, (1992), 379-404; William O'Neill, "Feminism as Radical Ideology," in *Dissent*, ed. Alfred F. Young (Northern Illinois: UP, 1967), 75-300; Linda Kerber, "Separate Spheres;" Karen Blair, *The Clubwoman as*

Feminist (New York, Holmes, Meier Publishers, Inc., 1980); Wayne Roberts, "Rocking the Cradle for the World: The New Woman and Maternal Feminism, Toronto, 1877-1914," in Linda Kealey, ed. *A Not Unreasonable Claim* (Toronto: Canadian Women's Educational Press, 1979); Marianne Valverde, *The Age of Light, Soap, and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, Inc., 1991), p.61; Linda Kealey, ed. "Introduction" in *A Not Unreasonable Claim*.

[19]See Paula Baker's "The Domestication of Politics: Women and American Political Society 1780-1920," in *American Historical Review* 89 (June 1984), 630; Nancy Cott, "What's in a Name?" Estelle Freedman, "Separatism as Strategy;" Lynn Y. Weiner, "Maternalism as Paradigm" in *Journal of Women's History*, vol.5, no.2 (Fall 1993), 96130; Arnold Whittick, *Woman Into Citizen.*

[20]Quoted in Rooke and Schnell "That Women Might Speak," p.4

[21]For information on other organisations see Harriet Hyman Alonso *Peace as a Woman's Issue: The History of the U.S. Movement for World Peace and Women's Rights* (Syracuse University Press, 1993); Minele Bosch, ed., *Politics and Friendship: Letters from the International Woman Suffrage Alliance, 1902-42* (Columbus: Ohio state University, 1985); Anne Firor Scott, *Natural Allies*

[22]Rooke and Schnell, "That Women Might Speak."

[23]Sidney Tarrow *Power in Movement:Social Movements, Collective Action and Politics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p.48.

[24]Tarrow, p. 54, quoting Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities:Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd ed., rev. (London: Verso, 1991),p.80.

[25]Joan Kelly, "The Social Relations of the Sexes: Methodological Implications of Women's History" in *Women, History, and Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1984), p.1.

[26]Hilda Smith, "Female Bonds and the Family: Recent Directions in Women's History,: in *For Alma Mater: Theory and Practice in Feminist Scholarship*, eds., Paula A. Treichler, Cheris Kramarae and Beth Stafford (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1985), 272-291; Joan Kelly, "The Social Relations of the Sexes: Methodological Implications of Women's History," in *Women, History, and Theory*; Gerda Lerner, "Placing Women in History: Definitions and Challenges," in *The Minority Finds its Past* (New York: 1979), p.148-59; Joan Wallace Scott, "Women's History," and "Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis," in Scott, ed., *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York, 1988), 15-90; Kathryn Kish Sklar, "A Call for Comparisons" in *American Historical Review*, 95 (Oct.1990), 1109-1114. All address the importance of understanding relationships in the lives of women as an essential component in the understanding of women's history.

[27]Kelly, "The Social Revolution of the Sexes," p. 8.

[28] Joyce Appelby, Lynn Hunt and Margaret Jacob *Telling the Truth About History* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1994), comment on the fact that "academic feminists have found postmodernist theory congenial because such theories underline the contingency, the human-madeness , and hence the changeability of cultural norms and practices."p.226. Joan Wallach Scott notes in her essays in *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), that postmodernism relativizes the condition of all knowledge.

[29]Ibid.

[30]Florence Howe, "Women and the Power to Change," in *Women and the Power to Change*, ed. Florence Howe (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1975), p.151.

[31]For more discussion of feminist historiography see Gerda Lerner "The Doubled Vision of Feminist Theory: A Postcript to the 'Women and Power Conference'" in *Women, History and Theory*; Linda Gordon, "What's New in Women's History?" in Teresa de Lauretis, ed.(Bloomingdale: Indiana U.P., 1991); Joan Wallace Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York,1988); Ruth Roach Pierson, "Experience, Difference, Dominance and Voice in the Writing of Canadian Women's History" in *Writing Women's History: International Perspectives*, eds. Karen Offen, Ruth Roach Pierson and Jane Rendall (Bloomingdale: Indiana U.P., 1991); Patricia T. Rooke, "Woman as Artifact: Sexual Scripts and a Female Education from the Reformation to Monique Wittig," in *Journal of Educational Thought*, Vol.30, no.1 (April 1996), 57-78.

[32]See Nancy Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987); Karen Blair, *Clubwoman as Feminist*; Naomi Black, *Social Feminism* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1989); William O'Neill, "Feminism as Radical Ideology," and J. Stanley Lemons, *The Woman Citizen.*

[33]See Kraditor's "Up From the Pedestal" and O'Neill's "Feminism as Radical Ideology."

[34]See for example the works of Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism*, 1989; Black, *Social Feminism*, 1989; Lemons, *The Woman Citizen*,1973; Kealey, *A Not Unreasonable Claim*,1979; Roberts, "Rocking the Cradle," 1979; Strong-Boag, "'Setting the Stage:' National Organization and the Womena's Movement in the Late 19th Century," in Susan Trofimenkoff and Alison Prentice, eds., *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History* (Toronto: McClelland Stewart, 1977); Wendy Mitchinson, "The WCTU:'For God, Home and Native Land:' A Study in Nineteenth-Century Feminism," 1979 in Kealey's *A Not Unreasonable Claim*.

[35]For Cott's discussion of Lemon's work regarding Progressivism see page 818 of *The Grounding of Modern Feminism.*

[36]See Gerda Lerner's "Women's Rights and American Feminism" in *American Scholar*, XL (Spring, 1971), 236-237.

[37]Daniel Scott Smith, "Family Limits, Sexual Control, and Domestic Feminism in Victorian America," in eds. M. Hartman and Lois Banner, *Clio's Consciousness Raised* (New York: 1974), 119-36.

[38]Blair, *Clubwoman as Feminist.*

[39] See Linda Kealey's introduction to *A Not Unreasonable Claim* ; Wayne Roberts, "Rocking the Cradle for the World"; Veronica St Brong-Boag, "The Parliament of Women: The National Council of Women of Canada 1893-1929" (PhD diss., National Museums of Canada, 1976); Wendy Mitchinson, "The WCTU."

[40]Seth Kovan and Sonja Michel, "Womanly Duties," p.1079.

[41] Roberts, "Rocking the Cradle for the World," p.18.

[42]Mariana Valverde The Age of Light, Soap and Water.

[43]Ernest Forbes, "The Ideas of Carol Bacchi and the Suffragists of Halifax: A Review Essay on Liberation Deffered? The Ideas of the English Canadian Suffragists.1877-1918."in *Atlantis* Vol.10, no.2 (1984-85),p.120.

[44]Ramsay Cook and Wendy Mitchinson eds., *The Proper Sphere Woman's Place in Canadian Society* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976), p.230.

[45]Naomi Black, *Social Feminism* (London: Cornell University Press, 1989), p.16.

[46]*Women Workers of Canada*, National Council of Women of Canada (Ottawa, 1894), pp.10-13, quoted in *The Proper Sphere Woman's Place in Canadian Society* edited by Ramsay Cook and Wendy Mitchinson (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976), p.200.

[47]Freedman "Separatism as Strategy," p.525.

[48]See endnote #15.

[49] See Patricia T. Rooke's "From Pollyanna to Jeremiah: Recent Interpretations of American Educational History," in *Journal of Educational Thought*, vol.9, no.1 (April 1975), 15-28, especially p.27. Mark Beach, quoted on page 27 discusses the implication of this in relation to adult education.

[50]Kerber, "Separate Spheres," p.17.

[51]Caroll Smith-Rosenberg, "The Female World;" Blanche Wiessen Cook, "Female Support Networks and Political Activism: Lillian Ward, Crystal Eastman, Emma Goldman" in *Chrysalis*, no.3 (1977), 43-61; Kathryn Kish Sklar, *Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity* (New Haven: Yale Unjiversity Press, 1973).

[52] Kerber, "Separate Spheres," p.10.

[53] Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism*; Kerber,"Separate Spheres"

[54] See Naomi Black, *Social Feminism*; Linda Gordon, 1991; Kish Sklar, 1990; Wiener, 1993; Mollie Ladd-Taylor, "Toward Defining Maternalism in U.S. History" in *The Journal of Women's History*, vol.5, no.2 (Fall, 1993), 110-113; Leila Rupp, "Constructing Internationalism: The Case of Transnational Women's Organisations, 1888-1945" in *American Historical Review* 99: 1571-600.

[55]Ramsay Cook and Wendy Mitchinson, eds *The Proper Sphere*

[56] Other Canadian historians who will be referenced will be Linda Kealey, Wayne Roberts, Marianne Valverde, Wendy Mitchinson, see footnote 42. In addition to these will be Neil Semple, "The Quest for the Kingdom: Aspects of Protestant Revivalism in Nineteenth-Century Ontario," in ed. David Keane andColin Read, *Old Ontario: Essays in Honour of J.M.S. Careless* (Toronto: Dundurn Press, 1990), 95117; T. Morrison, "Their Proper Sphere: 'Feminism, the Family, and Child-Centred Social Reform in Ontario, 1875-1900,'" in *Ontario History* , (1976).

[57] Strong-Boag, 1976, 1977; Sheehan, 1980; Mitchinson, 1979; Cott, 1987; Friedl,1987; Rothman, 1978; Burstyn,1984.

[58]Martin Bulmer, Kevin Boles, Kathryn Kish Sklar, *The Social Survey in Historical Perspective 1880-1940* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991);

CHAPTER 2

THE POLICING OF THE BODY

"...the policewoman is naturally endowed with kindness and love towards children, with a complete knowledge of the character and weakness of her sex and with a high conception and desire for morality and righteousness....The former natural endowment is the best way to gain the esteem of society and to impress upon it, without friction, moral ways of living."[1]

The Traffic in Women and Children did not emerge full-blown from the head of history's muse, Clio! Its historical antecedents are found in the social reform movements of the previous century and into the years preceding World War I. The reforms of the Progressive era saw an increasing female participation which has been historically interpreted as a culmination in social feminism. The campaigns for equal suffrage, a twin sister of social feminism, disagreed in feminist philosophy but the two combined frequently on other social matters like the Traffic. The most obvious antecedent to the Traffic in social feminism can be located in the crusade for social purity. The campaigns for social purity offered education and propaganda in an attempt to resolve problems around prostitution and its corollary, the demand for an equal moral standard which insisted that sexual conduct be handled equally for both sexes.

The last decade of the nineteenth-century and the first decade of the twentieth-century marked a "critical transition, sometimes graced with the label of 'sexual revolution'"[2] Transnational women's groups like the ICW, the IAW, and the WILPF, paid little attention to the controversial questions of sexuality, except for what they called "the traffic in women."[3] The common interpretation has been that women's organisations were in fact unable to distinguish between the two issues. This chapter will

present a different argument. It will examine the silence found in the *Bulletin* concerning the issues surrounding the equal moral standard. It will offer a commentary that states that the ICW leadership was indeed capable of distinguishing between the two issues. It will demonstrate how the education and propaganda of the *Bulletin* carried the message of the ICW leadership to its membership sidestepping such sensitive and controversial issues as the equal moral standard.

THE HISTORICAL ANTECEDENTS TO THE TRAFFIC

At the Sixth Quinquennial Council Meeting of the ICW held in Kristiania in 1920, the following motions were passed:

> That the ICW continue whole-heartedly to fight against the traffic in women, and call upon the different Governments to take rigorous measures to enforce the laws made for the protection of women and girls, and the suppression of procuration in all its forms
> That the ICW call upon all Governments to abolish the regulation of prostitution, especially in the form of compulsory medical examination of women, the registration of prostitutes, the licensing of houses of ill-fame, and all similar administrative measures, such measures being against the equal moral standard, and ineffective in reducing disease [4].

Before we can make sense of this and understand why a conservative organisation of women, such as the ICW, became involved with the issues of the Traffic in Women and Children (the Traffic) we must first examine some of the historical antecedents.

Kathryn Kish Sklar suggests that how and why some middle-class women transformed philanthropy into reform and began to generate new solutions to social problems is a major research question, and does indeed form part of the question for this study. What triggered this transformation? A weighty related issue is how these women of the ICW convinced others to join them in an organized assault on a social problem of

this kind. These questions highlight the most crucial feature of women's reform activism in the Progressive era–the newly conceived ability of women to speak for the national welfare and the growing recognition of a means to participate within the realm of public power. [5] The politics of the body, or prostitution, gave women's organizations, like the ICW, the necessary platform to engage in public, national debate.

When we ask the question why a conservative organization like the ICW became involved with the issue of white slavery and the traffic we can see a socially constructed reaction to the sentiments of the age.[6] Edward Bristow sums it up nicely when he observes that the intervention practiced by women's groups, such as the ICW, was based on the assumption that white slavery was one of the leading social issues of the times.[7] By way of example the problem of socially transmitted diseases (STDS) and the sexualized female body–the prostitute being an antecedent to the present discourse over other sexualized bodies (gay, lesbian, the reproductive body, the right to choose abortion, violence, etc.) continues today.

At the end of the nineteenth-century evangelicals published sensational accounts to add fuel to the abolitionist's campaigns. The image of female seduction was so symbolically charged, so psychologically overloaded, that Bristow suggests that reformers in the nineteenth-century, not to mention the general public, became swept away in their own rhetoric.[8] In addition, the partly ambiguous use of the prostitution question by feminists, and the development of widespread concern and fear with public

health issues, like venereal disease, all combined to make white slavery and the traffic one of the most popular and pressing social questions encompassing the western world at that time. [9]

We might pause at this point to see what is meant by some of the terms surrounding the Traffic, for example, what do we mean when we refer to the term "white slave traffic"? The term white slavery suggests enforced prostitution and was used to distinguish it from Negro Slavery, which had been abolished in the British Empire in 1833.[10] Slavery, in this case however, can be interpreted as synonymous with enforced prostitution. It can be argued that the transaction of women's bodies for sexual gratification was every bit as enslaving as the selling of African bodies into slavery. This interpretation of slavery, rather than the hysterical concept of women and children being smuggled away, was a more realistic and a closer description that delineated the truth behind the images of white slavery. It was this reality that engaged women in prostitution. Prostitution was an economic alternative to the life of many women who had come to the towns and cities in search of work only to be faced with the reality of poor paying jobs and poverty.[11] This argument however, although more realistic, required a completely different social and cultural response to the problem of prostitution. It required that reformers look at the underlying causes of prostitution rather than at the morality involved with the act of prostitution itself. This analysis was less appealing to middle-class reformers than the issue of morality, as morality was closely tied to social feminism and afforded reformers access to public debate. Hence, morality better served the purposes of women's organisations in their quest for public power and influence.

The term white slave trade was ambiguous since the traffic supposedly included women and children of all races and colors across international borders for the purposes of commerce.[12] As for the phrase itself there appears to be a disagreement as to its origins. Edward Bristow acknowledges Dr. Michael Ryan, a London reformer, as the originator of the term in the 1930s.[13] On the other hand Vern Bullough attributes Clifford G. Roe, an assistant States' Attorney in Illinois as being the first one to use it. However, the more realistic explanation is that the term comes from the English translation of the French term, *Traite des Blanches*, (trade in whites), used at the 1902 conference in Paris to discuss the problems of international trade in women.[14]

How accurate was the scenario of young women and children being drugged, snatched and sold into prostitution against their will? Outside the Orient, it would appear that there were in fact some kidnapped and smuggled into prostitution rings, but in the vast majority of cases the individuals involved in prostitution across national or international borders were in fact fully cognizant of their actions and the reasons for being there. Very little substantial evidence for a fully developed Traffic ever emerged. In other words, many of the prostitutes were involved in prostitution as a "career." Mamie Pinzer, a Philadelphia prostitute in the early part of the twentieth-century, and one who strikes me as fairly representative, put it rather succinctly, "I just cannot be moral enough to see where drudgery is better than a life of lazy vice."[15]

The images and myths created by reformers and news articles of the day were sensationalized. Many depicted old ladies with poison rings and furtive men with syringes and drugs skulking around railway stations and in back alleys decoying and

entrapping young women and children. Such reports may have added to moral reformers' sense of urgency about the issue. Clearly, such images are intertwined with the Victorian reform sensibilities pertaining to an ideology of social "rescue".

The myths and surrounding melodramas (plays and movies) like Eugene Brieux's *Damaged Goods* and George Bernard Shaw's *Mrs. Warren's Profession,* concerning prostitution and white slavery served to inflame the imaginations of the middle-classes instilling fear and concern, not the least of which was alarm about venereal disease and its transmission.[16] These stories were designed to create an impression of safety at home, off the streets and behind closed doors, in the separate, private sphere of women. White slavery exemplified everything that was dangerous to single women as well as everything that was dangerous about them.[17] Reports abounded about immigrant women being exploited, innocent country girls and poverty-stricken women being lured and sold into slavery by those who posed as protectors or potential employers. The connotation of white slavery was flexible enough as a construct to embody all of the anxieties and psychological projections of the late nineteenth-century surrounding issues of shifting race, sex, and gender relations coupled with the dangers of urbanization.[18] Furthermore, not to be overlooked was the reality of the spread of venereal disease in a time before penicillin.

DISEASE AS METAPHOR

When speaking of disease Jeffrey Weeks (1989) points out that there are many and varied factors affecting political decision making and moral change. He contends that the moral panic that is created often crystallizes widespread fears and anxieties and

deals with them, not by seeking out the major causes or concerns of the problem, but rather, as is the case concerning the Traffic, by displacing them and creating metaphors and 'Folk Devils' surrounding an identified population (often the 'immoral' and 'degenerate').[19] "Sexuality has had a peculiar centrality in such panics, and sexual 'deviants' have been omnipresent scapegoats."[20] The metaphors and mythologies of the white slave trade were to the nineteenth century and early twentieth century what AIDS is to contemporary society.

These nineteenth-century anxieties which were cast in a moral framework contained the seeds which would flower in the next century in the pseudo-scientific soil of the eugenics debate. Sontag, describes the "syphilitic personality type" as part of the metaphor of disease and civil disorder in the 'body-politic.' Prostitution represented both aspects of the metaphor; just as the prostitute was both the personality type embodying the threat of venereal disease within herself, she was also perceived as the carrier of death and pollution. The significant thing about metaphors is that they can have long-term and pernicious consequences which is the case with the eugenics movement, a subject I will not elaborate at this point as it will emerge again in its right chronological place later in the study. Let it suffice to comment at this point by way of a brief quotation..

> The transmission of venereal disease through sex was seen to disrupt society and contaminate the pure blood stream of populations. Ignorance and superstitions which were linked to bodily fluids, blood, and sex, have always surrounded certain diseases and their metaphors are found in the political philosophies from Machiavelli to Hobbes to the social darwinists of the nineteenth-century.[21]

Sontag's observations are as pertinent from a historical perspective as they are from a contemporary perspective because all societies have created controlling metaphors which have resulted in actual practices: ostracism, exile, stigmatization, and quarantines. We shall see later how policing came to represent an efficacious way of controlling actual behavior rather than proscribing it in policy statements that repeated the metaphors. In short, moral metaphors of the late Victorian society spawned a more lethal combination when they were assimilated into the discourse of eugenics programs.

The metaphorical flourishes that linked venereal disease with evil and the need to wage war against the disease in the nineteenth-century can be recognized in some of the same dynamics working about AIDS in the twentieth. The sexually transmitted disease, seen as the punishment that one brought on oneself as a result of the evil of sexual excess and perversity, applied equally to both syphilis and AIDS. The need to engage doctors and moral reformers in the fight against the disease brought about by the evil of moral deviance is universal in its application. When we examine how disease is socially understood or constructed, a complex interaction of social, cultural, and biological elements comes into view. Society creates its own propaganda to convince itself of the urgency of the threat to innocents. As Susan Sontag (1989) observes, infectious diseases that are connected to sexual deviance always inspire fear of easy contagion in bizarre or unusual ways[22] Hence, the moral panic about catching syphilis or gonorrhea from toilet seats or door knobs, or, in the case of AIDS, from mere exposure, becomes sensationalized. This all combines and reinforces the need and the sense of urgency necessary to combat the evil.

WOMEN'S RESPONSE

The reform of prostitution was the logical consequence in a moral reform movement whose primary thrust centred on the regulation of class, gender, sex and morality in the new, thriving and seemingly anarchic urban centres. Mort (1987) argues that for nineteenth-century reformers the term 'morals' encompassed a plethora of competing meanings. The term was used as a synonym for culture, or lack thereof, and could establish blame.[23] Social stability, says Beverley Skeggs (1997) was seen as dependent on moral purity; the moral condition of the nation was seen to be derived from the moral standards of women. All women were responsible for the welfare of the human race. If they refused to take responsibility for social order then they, in turn, could be blamed for its disruption–all done in the name of virtue. Virtuous women protect the nation while non-virtuous women subvert it. [24] Marianne Valverde argues that if prostitution had not existed the social purity movement would have had to invent it.[25]

A religious language that supported the image of the superior 'moral mother,' provided a powerful critique of male sexuality and fueled moral outrage that inspired women's groups to gain entry and representation into the formally male dominated world of political debate. Maternalist protofeminists used moral reform and repeal campaigns as a method of gaining ground in the public arena.[26] Frank Mort tells us that " nowhere more than in the repeal movement was the link between philanthropic work and an emergent feminist discourse more clearly visible."[27]

SOILED DOVES AND SINS OF SCARLET: SOCIAL PURITY 1870-1918. [1]

It is central to the understanding of regulation to realise that the regulators did not seek to control sexual behavior.[28] The aim was to regulate or to control, not so much prostitution, as the prostitute.[29] Regulation was an effort to have prostitutes made clean to ply their trade and make it, in turn, safe for the male clientele. For the military this was especially critical as "the economic cost to the army of endemic V.D. was widely deplored."[30] The regulators concentrated on members of the working classes who did not subscribe to, or who chose to remain outside middle-class morality–both clientele and providers such as the Mamie Pinzers.[31] The prostitute was viewed as the conduit of infection and a projection of class fear and guilt. Later the theorists and critics of industrial capitalism would use prostitution as a powerful symbol of sexual and economic exploitation. While the prostitute may have flouted middle-class morality, as did her customer, ultimately "it is always only the woman who pays [paid] the penalty"[32]–hence the double moral standard.

The acts, although specifically directed at women, reflected the growing preoccupation with and penchant for state intervention in the form of medical and sanitary hygiene. The mid-century social hygiene movement had created a close link between public order and public health by legitimizing official intervention as policy.[33] The "medico-moral" rationale developed a regulatory system resulting from the need to control human sexuality for the public good. The acts were concerned with the

---

1 This heading is a combination of two thoughts: Acton called prostitutes "soiled doves" and the September 12 edition of the 1863 *Saturday Review* referred to prostitution as "The Sin in Scarlet".

regulation of the sexual and moral habits of two particular "populations" within the urban poor–female prostitutes and the lower ranks of the military.[34] The results however, led to two vastly different approaches emanating from the gender-specific, male defined guidelines which crystallized in an expanded discourse on male and female sexuality.[35] It was the followers of the Social Hygiene movement that later looked to sex education, birth control and eugenics as effective ways of controlling and administering sexuality for the good of the whole.

The passing of the Contagious Diseases Acts (Acts) was largely unnoticed by the British public until the regulationists decided to move the legislation further north in Britain.[36] Trevor Fisher (1997) calls the organized moral reform campaigns "the most serious and sustained political intervention of the nineteenth-century" and points out that opposition came from at least two identifiable areas: libertarians whose opposition to any erosion of individual civil liberties were disturbed by prostitution and immorality among the aristocracy, (particularly the Prince of Wales' set); and middle and upper-class women.[37] It is the work of this latter group that are of most interest to this study as they and their organisations provided a systematic model of education and propaganda tactics that would be followed at a later date by the ICW.

Regulation and its repeal was more politically valuable to moral reformers who were seeking to enter the world of power. This resulted in inaccurate propaganda and information being disseminated throughout middle-class organisations at a time when clubs and voluntary organisations like the ICW were being founded in large numbers. It further resulted in some very powerful moral propaganda being communicated to society

at large and directed reform down a path that was actually disadvantageous to the women it was theoretically aimed at protecting.[38]

It is significant to note that the repeal campaigns left sizable educational records and examples of women organizing other women to achieve public, political results. Detailed accounts of efforts to affect by-elections and speeches were available. The National Vigilance Association (NVA) concentrated on creating and educating large networks of associations to help with the work of social purity. The results of this education were attitudes that had been socially constructed by the intolerance of the NVA. The education in the ideology of social purity was indeed successful. The national network of reformist NVA's was crucial to and responsible for the firmly established puritan hegemonic response to prostitution that swept into the first two decades of the twentieth-century and influenced women's voluntary organisations, like the ICW. [39]

The inter-war years witnessed a major endeavor to restructure morality within the framework dictated by social purity. The results of this effort were evident both in legislation and in the tone of public life.[40] It was social purity with its inherent contradictions and ironies that formed the moral basis for women's voluntary organisations like the ICW who became involved in the Traffic and Equal Moral Standard. And it was the discourse of social purity which dictated the treatment of prostitutes well into the twentieth-century. Not surprisingly, the development of social purity with its repressive social policies was to have profound effects between the 1880s

and the end of the First World War on the regulation of sexual behavior and the reform work of women's voluntary organisations like the ICW, whose work took them into the arena of the double moral standard and the Traffic .[41]

As a result of the rhetoric and social excitement surrounding the issue of the Traffic at the end of the nineteenth-century the ICW established, at the third Quinquennial Council Meeting in Berlin in 1904 (the same year as the first International Conference was called in Paris to address the problem of the Traffic) a Standing Committee to deal with the pressing matter of the White Slave Traffic.[42] The President of the newly affiliated National Council of Norway, Mrs Gina Krog, led the discussion which urged the ICW to create a Standing Committee. "We cannot alter the laws and we cannot exterminate immorality," she argued, "but we can create an opinion so strong and so commanding that laws will have to be made, and, if we cannot succeed in lifting the moral standard higher than it is at present, then we have no right to blame the men."[43] Others crucial to the debate were the French delegation, led by Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix. The work which the ICW was to do over the next three decades in the Traffic would prove to be, to a very large extent, the result of her commitment to its abolition. The meeting presented and voted on the following motion:

> That the ICW is earnestly requested to keep the question of the White Slave Traffic on the International programme til its end be accomplished. That each National Council be asked to co-operate with every effort in its own country for its suppression; and that, considering that it is impossible to combat the White Slave Traffic as long as the state regulation of vice continues, all women unite to obtain the suppression of this odious system which is an insult to all women, and strengthens the idea of a double moral standard for men and women.[44]

At the same meeting another Standing Committee was formed to work on Women's Suffrage. The subject of suffrage for the ICW, a multi-interest organisation, that represented women from all over the world at different stages of political and civic development was, until this point, a sensitive concern. The ICW had always been organizationally challenged by single-issue organisations that worked solely for female enfranchisement. A most severe crisis occurred on this matter when the International Woman Suffrage Alliance (IWSA), later to become the International Alliance of Women (IAW), splintered from its original affiliation with the ICW in 1904. [45] The split occurred in protest about the conservative nature and the reticence of the ICW to become involved in the suffrage issue.

THE EQUAL MORAL STANDARD

The ICW Standing Committee concerned with the White Slave Traffic and Equal Moral Standard, instigated in 1904 in Berlin, was the response to an international situation that was viewed as one of the most peremptory of the times. The ideologies surrounding the equal moral standard and the international traffic were intellectually blended, making it difficult for groups, including the ICW, to differentiate between the two. Seeking to demarcate the equal moral standard from the traffic risks confusing the issue by suggesting that they were indeed two different and separate entities. The equal moral standard, as many have argued cannot be discussed without reference to the Traffic. Both are intricately interwoven and may not be, in actual fact, capable of being separated. It could be successfully debated that the one relies on the other for its impetus. It was in reaction to the introduction of the Acts in Britain in the 1860s to control

prostitution that middle-class women and men mobilized in protest to the inequity of a double moral standard and the implicit power struggle it represented which might be summarized as "the politics of sex."

In order to discuss the education of the *Bulletin* and the work of the ICW in the area of equal moral standard it is important to examine the aftermath of the acts themselves along a continuum of nineteenth-century social attitudes. At this time international meetings and congresses for the big Women's Organisations, like the ICW, the IAW, the IWSA, and the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF) took place exclusively in Europe resulting in an over-representation in leadership positions for elite women from Great Britain, Western and Northern Europe. American women were also included because they contributed generous financial support to the international women's movement. Because of the age of the membership of these organisations what is relevant here is the fact that the work done in the area of the double moral standard in many of the big Women's Organisations, not only the ICW, was ideologically structured, being immersed as it was, in the reform sentiments, social attitudes and rhetoric of nineteenth-century Protestant Europe. Because of this Euro-positioning, the British model supplies us with a representative and illustrative basis for the study of the development of reform associated with the Acts.[46] The British campaigns against the double moral standard and their consequent social action created a precedent for Anglophone colonies and countries trans-Atlantically to duplicate.

It is admissible that the ICW was unable to separate the Traffic from the equal moral standard in 1904 when it established a standing committee to deal with the issue.

However, this chapter will analyze the *Bulletin* to develop the argument that in the inter-war years when the discourse of sexuality had become more contentious and more normalized, the ICW leadership retreated to an inoffensive, neutral stance (consistent with its reputation) by concentrating on the establishment of women's police forces to deal with prostitution, but more particularly, the equal moral standard. It did this to avoid confronting the more radical and inflammatory outcomes that resulted from the work by younger feminists and other moral reformers on the double moral standard – eugenics, birth control, and sex education. Policing–or the surveillance and control of female sexuality was identified as a practical means by which the Victorian and Edwardian spectre of rampant promiscuities and their outcome in misbegotten conceptions, illegitimate births, and venereal disease, could be controlled. This could be achieved without having to give public approval, therefore public offence, to such issues as contraception and eugenics programs in the *Bulletin*. The old anxieties therefore could be diffused and displaced into a less obvious form of practical politics. It seems that policing was in fact an implicit substitution for these contentious debates which were simmering in the public domain and that if we decipher the shorthand of policing as rescue, surveillance and control, the silence in the *Bulletin* becomes more eloquent and what appears to be absence of discussion no longer seems quite so glaring. We might see policing as a deliberate logistical, practical deployment of the ICW leadership; indeed, a demonstration of diplomatic acumen in a forum that proposed to represent all women.

The ICW, perhaps because of its Constitution (see Appendix I), chose to become involved in an educational campaign to encourage countries to establish a structure and

means for recruiting women police to administer to prostitutes (or other women) who had been arrested.[47] The *Bulletin* transmitted this option by emphasizing policing and de-emphasizing, even to the point of ignoring the more controversial aspects of the public debate.[48] It was argued that when women were arrested they were placed under the custody of men and therefore needed to be protected on grounds of respect, modesty and dignity. This became more important if such women were intoxicated

> These women...are often so intoxicated as to be wholly irresponsible, and may at any time disrobe themselves and stand at their cell doors. Better that a virtuous woman jailor, rather than a lustful male warden, should hold the key to her cell. Every honest woman *must* demand that her unhappy sisters shall be protected at all times by a woman official.[49]

Consequently, the propaganda of the *Bulletin* recommended the expansion of women's work–as policing officers, guardians within prisons, and local and national police forces. By ignoring the other more controversial questions, the *Bulletin* replaced the radical discourse with practical education and recommendations about policing for its ordinary members to discuss and implement in their countries. By all accounts, local and national Councils seized upon such forms of practical politics submitting reports to the *Bulletin* as examples of implementation and in the spirit of educating interested National Councils elsewhere. For example, evidence that such education was working came from the National Conference of the NCW of France when Mlle.Weyer, in her 1924 report referred to the work done in England and expressed "the wish that in all towns with a population of over 100,000 inhabitants one or more women should be attached to the police to work in the streets and near the barracks."[50] Such work was in keeping with the conservative agenda of the organisation. Members worked diligently and gradually

towards their goal seemingly unconcerned that the more controversial social issues surrounding the equal moral standard were not part of the project.

Because of the vast body of literature on the issue of eugenics this study will not develop this topic but mention it in passing merely because of its relative absence in the ICW program.[51] In this case silence itself is however telling, if for no other reason than by all accounts many National Councils, including Canada's, were involved in the controversies surrounding the subject.[52] The structure of the National Councils made it difficult to keep the subject "out." Many organisations that were affiliated with the National Councils, like the Farm Women's Associations and the WCTU, had strong eugenics programs. In Canada women such as Emily Murphy (Edmonton), Violet McNaughton (Saskatchewan),Carrie Derick (Montreal), Adelaide Plumtre (Toronto), to name a few, were pro eugenics and had National Council affiliations. It is hard to believe that these women and the affiliated organisations they represented were not introducing such discourse into the business and discourse of the Local and National Councils. Rooke and Schnell argue that the NCW was very involved in prohibiting child immigration on the grounds of bad blood contaminating the purity of Canadian society. Furthermore, women's organisations and the NCW were active in controlling "girl immigration" so as to prevent the introduction of the "biologically inferior strata of British Life." [53]

The discourse, sentiments, practices and policies, that are clearly part of the "eugenics movement" (so defined and now understood as a historical phenenomon) rarely called itself such. The pseudo-scientific theories were called eugenics but ordinary

people only spoke of "the feebleminded problem." The major concern was how to stop immorality, pauperism, criminality and promiscuity from spreading. There were worries as to how to prevent exploitation and predation. Major questions surrounded the problems associated with disabled infants and older infirm people. The problems of funding and administering asylums and orphanages were disputed. Other questions addressed surrounded the topics of how best to detect criminality, potential immorality, and the degeneration of civilization by the survival of the unfit.[54] Although Councils did not speak out and call it eugenics per se, it was present and ensued as the middle-class, superior, euro-ethno centric agenda. In 1933, the National Council of Ottawa, by way of example, unanimously adopted a resolution urging Ontario to pass a sterilization law.[55]

If, as many writers claim, the issues of eugenics and birth control were focal to the decade of the twenties and thirties then these issues were conspicuous by their absences in the *Bulletin* during these years.[56] At this point we cannot overlook or ignore the determined and substantial influence of the ICW leadership, especially of Lady Aberdeen in this matter. In 1932, when some ICW members insisted that "the most burning questions of sexual life" be addressed, Lady Aberdeen ruled that birth control was a matter of religion and as such, according to ICW Constitution, could not be considered.[57] "Political and religious questions of a controversial nature affecting the interrelationship of two or more countries are excluded...." (See Appendix 1). We can assume she regarded eugenics in the same fashion. We must be aware too of the influence of Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix (of France) in this issue, remembering that Sainte-Croix controlled the information that went to the League of Nations (which will

be discussed in detail in the following chapters) from the big Women's Organisations, as well as the information that was reported back to the organisations she represented. France then, certainly not now, was a dominant Catholic culture, therefore unsupportive of either birth control or eugenics. Coupled with this, French (and Quebec) women did not have the vote. This developed country alone demonstrates the difficulties Lady Aberdeen had referred to concerning the reconciliation of "policy" when facing an international organisation such as the ICW. If such an abyss existed between the "progressives" of the Anglo alliance and the Francophones it takes little to imagine the chasm between the developed and the developing countries–apart from the articulate educated elite as in the British colonies. Engaging in "non partisan" politics was an effort to avoid the fractionalization of such a diverse membership. Creating a focus–women's policing–for ICW members that allowed them to participate in the resolution of the problem was artful. Eugenics and birth control, then as now, were volatile subjects. Becoming involved with such issues was certain to cause offence, alarm, suspicion and resistance, among third world and catholic countries. Countries whose demographics embraced peoples of different (and colored) races, immense economic gaps, domestic and work arrangements dependent on large families, and entrenched and institutionalized religious beliefs were at odds with the secular values that dominated the western world. If the women's conferences at Cairo and Beijing in the last decade could dissolve into western/non-western antagonisms of the most bitter kind, it takes little imagination to understand the reluctance of the ICW to embrace these issues in the inter-war years. Leaders of the big Women's Organisations, in this respect,

demonstrated once again a genius for diplomacy, acumen and sensitivity which might well be noted by contemporary feminists.

Bearing this in mind it is therefore less surprising to note that during the two decades there was in fact nothing at all reported in the *Bulletin* pertaining specifically to eugenics. Two separate reports hinted at the problems encountered by disagreements on this issue among women members at two international conferences. The first was held in Gratz in 1924. The organizers of the Conference reported avoiding the rocks on which similar Conferences were so often wrecked. To avoid confrontation they strictly limited the number of subjects to be discussed. Only five questions were placed on the Agenda: suppression of obscene publications, emigration, the employment of foreign women in licensed houses, women police and the protection of women and children employed in places of entertainment away from their own country. [58] It is unclear whether this was an attempt to eliminate the number of potential discussions because of time restrictions, or an attempt to subvert topics such as eugenics and birth control, considered inappropriate and beyond the scope of the organisation. Similarly, in London in 1927, at the International Congress for the Suppression of Traffic in Women and Children the *Bulletin* reported, "Owing to a...conflict of opinion as to the inclusion of certain topics, it looked as if it would be impossible to get any resolution passed"[59] These reports hint at dissension between delegates which could have been the result of several factors including simply a tight agenda. However, we could surmise that some of the trouble might have been the result of tension between younger delegates, or even some of the older, wishing to have such topics as birth control or eugenics included in the conference

discussions. We know that groups like the Six Point Group and the National Union of Societies for Equal Citizenship (NUSEC) and the WCTU supported birth control. [60] These groups had observers and representatives attending the conferences. Similarly, groups like the WCTU, The National Farm Women's Associations (in Canada) and The Federation of German Women's Associations supported eugenics.[61] The *Bulletin* of March 1928 carried a brief report on the meeting of the International Union Against Venereal Diseases where Therapeutic Sterilisation was noted as a point that had been discussed.

The only direct reference to birth control in the *Bulletin* during the two decades came at the very end of the twenties in the November 1929 issue. [62] The report of the Annual Meeting and Conference of the NCW of Great Britain contained a paragraph stating that the resolution passed on "**Birth Control** was perhaps the most highly controversial subject handled at the conference."

> Here the modern point of view differed from that of the older generation, and the standpoint of the younger section that birth control was an accepted fact contrasted strongly with that of the speaker, who dealt chiefly on the ethical side of the question. Throughout the discussion was serious; sympathy for women who have a heavy burden to bear during their years of child-bearing was fully expressed. On no occasion did a speaker even suggest sex antagonism.[63]

This supports the claim that there was in fact friction surrounding the issue and, in this particular instance, it appears to have been generational.

The *Bulletin* ran a three part article over February March and April of 1938 entitled "The Revolution in the Position of Women in Recent Times." This was the longest article printed in the twenty year period. Considering the title of the article it is

somewhat interesting that eugenics, female sexuality or especially birth control were not mentioned. Instead, it focused on family values, the role of the woman within the family and "woman's maternal function," which were hardly revolutionary.[64] Obviously, the ICW, a conservative, respectable, maternalist, middle-class organisation was disinclined to become involved in issues that had far-reaching implications for family life and family values. An organisation that erred on the side of caution and did not endorse suffrage until 1904 was not going to rush into birth control and eugenics. Furthermore "it is our duty to remember that our Constitution forbids our Council identifying itself with any one propaganda...."[65]

Instead, what the ICW concerned itself with in relation to the question of the equal moral standard was an active educational program directed towards the initiation of women's police forces around its member countries. Women police, it was argued, would contribute to the equal moral condition for women (often prostitutes) who had been arrested and thrown into prison. The creation of women's police forces was something that could be accomplished within the parameters of the ICW Constitution and contribute to the spirit of moral purity that infused the organisation. Furthermore, the ICW had aligned itself with the League on the matter of the Traffic and the Equal Moral Standard. And the League did not enter into the arena of birth control or eugenics, perhaps for the same reasons but more likely because it represented such a diversity of cultural and religious traditions.

The idea of creating women's police forces was not new to the post war era. Women, at the end of the nineteenth-century could see the advantage of having female

offenders supervised by female authorities. There are sporadic accounts of national councils talking about establishing forces, as is the case in France in 1917[66], or actually being involved in setting up police matrons in prisons, Canada in 1894 (Griffiths, 1993); Sweden in *1905 (Women in a Changing World*, 1966); by way of example. However, there was no emphatic concerted effort until one of the Resolutions Referred to the National Councils for Action arising out of the Seventh Quinquennial Meeting of the I.C.W. was "The institution of women police in all countries."[67] During the early twenties the *Bulletin* is replete with accounts of countries becoming involved in and embarking on programs to create women's police forces. See Appendix IV.

If involvement and activation of the membership in educational programs is a measure of success, then the police force issue can be judged as highly successful. The Equal Moral Standard Committee of the National Council of Women of Finland and the White Ribbon Society reported co-operating and arranging special training courses for women police.[68] The British National Council reported from it's October 1924 Annual Meeting a resolution to call upon the Home Secretary "to give effect to the recent resolutions regarding the employment of policewomen by including them in the police regulations,..."[69] The National Council of Women of Austria approached the government with the view of getting the appointment of women as police doctors.[70]

It was at the end of the twenties when the League Report on the Traffic advocated that all countries strive to create a women's presence in policing that the ICW mounted a serious propaganda campaign to carry out the recommendations of the League.[71] The ICW carried on an effective propaganda campaign by keeping the issue current and by

encouraging member nations to become involved. The *Bulletin* published the successes and encouraged those still working on the creation of women's policing. Great Britain, who had been active in the program to create police since the First World War assumed leadership in the program for the training of women police. Women police were available from Great Britain to visit, educate and consult with any country or member nations who were interested in beginning campaigns or who needed help, which was the case with Egypt who did not affiliate with the ICW until a much later date (1951). In the decades of the twenties and thirties the National Councils from Italy, Germany, France, Rumania, Switzerland, China, Denmark, Sweden, Norway, Russia, Australia, South Africa, Canada, Estonia, Holland, the United States, Poland, Uruguay, Egypt, Mexico, Turkey, India, Finland, Latvia, Lithuania, Ireland, Burma,[72] New Zealand, all reported to the *Bulletin* the results of their work, or work-in-progress, designed to establish women police officers. This represented thirty of the forty member countries of the ICW reporting activity with regard to this priority.[73]

In June of 1931 the *Bulletin* cited a report submitted to the League of Nations that the total number of women police was then about 1,000. The United States had the largest number at 600; Germany had 159; Great Britain 150; Poland had 57; the Netherlands 33; Denmark 7; and Switzerland had 4.[74] By the January/February issue of the *Bulletin* in 1937 it was reported that there was between 800 to 1,000 police women in Europe alone. In Russia 4% of police were women. "There were now 1,500 police women in the world....In London the demand for uniformed women police far exceeded supply."[75] The ICW and its member nations had achieved a large degree of success and

this success was documented in the *Bulletin* in order to maintain the momentum of the propaganda. A report appeared concerning the British policewomen serving in the Police Forces of Cairo and Alexandria. "A proof that their services are valued by the authorities may be found in the fact that their contracts have recently been renewed for another three years, until 1940."[76]

What can we conclude from this? Seeking to demarcate the equal moral standard from the traffic has enabled us to look at the involvement of voluntary organisations like the ICW from a slightly different perspective. In addition to the accepted understanding that such groups were unable to distinguish the difference between the traffic and the equal moral standard, there now appears to be an added facet to the problem. Underlying the discourse of the equal moral standard was a heavily charged sexual tension that few of the big international groups were comfortable in tackling. Was the ICW, as has been suggested, unable to separate the traffic from the equal moral standard, or, was the ICW, known for its ability to hesitate to commit to controversial goals, merely avoiding the questions surrounding the discourse on sexuality? Did the ICW consider the national sensitivities of its member nations regarding sexuality and side-step potential controversy? Was it mere co-incidence or did the ICW leadership concentrate on educating its membership in the formation of women's police forces and consciously seek out a neutral or more appropriate stance, thereby addressing concerns surrounding the unequal treatment of women at a level that was comfortable for its conservative,

multi-national and diversely religious membership? Or was this a skillful avoidance, on the part of ICW leaders, of the generational issues that would have been potentially divisive and damaging to the women's international movement?

These questions lead us to examine the role that the *Bulletin* played in all of this. The *Bulletin* remained consistent with the propaganda and philosophy of social purity. It published, for the purposes of education and propaganda, the tactics and the results of National Councils and their efforts to have women's police forces created among the member nations. By way of example of the success of the propaganda campaign of the *Bulletin* , the National Council of Ireland presented a letter to the Ministry of Justice impressing upon him the necessity of appointing women policy to duty in Dublin.[77] Miss Edith Tancred, former Convenor of the Police Committee of the National Council of Great Britain and former Director of the Scottish Training School for Women Police, when talking to a public meeting in Dublin stated

> ...that since the recent reorganization of the Police system, the Irish Free State possessed the most up-to-date methods and a high standard of efficiency; but Police women were absolutely necessary, and the provisions of the Criminal Law Amendment Act would be unworkable unless Women Police were appointed to carry them out.[78]

The *Bulletin* carried the message of social purity to the ICW members. It educated women and created a public consciousness concerning the issues involved with the equal moral standard according to the conservative agenda of the ICW. It did not entertain, for whatever reasons, the ideas or ideals surrounding birth control, female sexuality or eugenics–the politics of sex. These issues were deliberately evaded, censored, and remained outside of the consciousness raising efforts or propaganda of the

Bulletin. What was created instead was a deliberate education and propaganda specifically designed by ICW leaders which would permit all of its world wide membership to participate in the campaigns to help work towards an equal moral standard. By allowing women to contribute to the work surrounding the equal moral standard a solidarity was developed which led to successful collective action regarding the establishment of women's police forces the world over.

ENDNOTES

[1]The *Bulletin* Vol. XII, no.6 (February 1934).

[2]Rupp, "Sexuality and Politics in the Early Twentieth-century: The Case of the International Women's Movement" in *Feminist Studies* 23, no.3 (Fall 1997), p.577.

[3]Ibid., p.580.

[4]The National Council Of Women of Canada, "The International Council of Women: Resolutions from 1899-1973 (NCWC, 1976), p.124.

[5] Kish Sklar, "Organized Womanhood", p.177. See *The International Council of Women: Resolutions from 1899-1973* (The National Council of Women of Canada: May, 1976), p.123.

[6] See the *Bulletin*, vol.1. no.6, August, 1922, p.3.

[7]For a complete discussion see Edward J.Bristow, *Prostitution and Prejudice: The Jewish Fight Against White Slavery 1870-1939* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982).

[8] Ibid, p. 30. Rooke and Schnell, "The League of Nations, Women's International Organizations and the Political Education of Women, 1919-1945," unpublished manuscript, p.5.

9 Trevor Fisher, *Prostitution and the Victorians* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997), p.138. ICW Records 1920, p.71, and Appendix 7, p.344, quoted in *Women in a Changing World*, p.141.

[10] This study will not concern itself with the anti-semitic and anti-oriental discrimination that surrounded the discourse of white slavery but will deal instead with the general discourse.

[11] See Bristow for the seed for this argument, p.39.

[12] See Bullough, *The History of Prostitution*, p.173; Marlene D.Beckman "The White Slave Traffic Act: Historical Impact of a Federal Crime Policy on Women," in *Women and Politics*, vol.4 (Fall, 1984), p86.

[13] Bristow, *Prostitution and Prejudice*, p.35.

[14] Ibid. p.174.

[15] Mamie Pinzer, a former prostitute and author of letters which comprise the *Mamie Papers* wrote to Fanny Howe, a Boston patrician and philanthropist. Her letters written between 1910 and 1922 are an autobiography of a women struggling to maintain her independence and self respect. Her letters tell about the circumstances that might compel young women to move into the trade. See Walkowitz, "The Politics of Prostitution" in *Signs*,6, no.1. (1980), p. 133; Bristow, *Prostitution* p. 27.

[16] W.T.Stead, editor of the Pall Mall Gazette, upon the urging of Josephine Butler, an advocate for prostitutes, did an exposee of traffic in English girls. His article "The Maiden Tribute of Modern Babylon," was one of the most successful pieces of scandal journalism written in the nineteenth-century. See Judith R.Walkowitz, "Jack the Ripper and the Myth of Male Violence," in *Feminist Studies* 8, no.3 (Fall, 1982), p.545; Bullough, *The History of Prostitution*, p.181; Marianne Valverde, *The Age*, p.90; Frank Mort *Dangerous Sexualities*, p.103. Stead was drowned when the *Titanic* sunk in April 1912.

[17] Mariana Valverde, *The Age of Light*, p.95.

[18] Ibid.

[19] Stan Cohen notes that societies appear to be subject every now and then to periods of moral panic. "A condition, episode, person or group of persons emerges to become defined as a threat to societal values and interests; its nature is presented in a stylized and stereotypical fashion by the mass media; the moral barricades are manned by editors, bishops and politicians and other right-thinking people; socially accredited experts pronounce their diagnoses and solutions; ways of coping are evolved, or (more often) resorted to; the condition then disappears, submerges or deteriorates....Sometimes the panic is passed over and forgotten, but at other times it has more serious and long term repercussions and it might produce changes in legal and social policy or even in the way in which societies conceive themselves" Stan Cohen, *Folk Devils and Moral Panics*, (London: MacGibbon and Kee, 1972),p.9, quoted in Jeffrey Weeks, *Sex, Politics & Society: The regulation of sexuality since 1800* Second Edition (London: Longman, 1989), p. 14.

[20] Ibid.

[21] Rooke & Schnell, "The Pauper Stamp: A Historical Study of Ervin Goffman's Theory of Stigma and Spoiled Identity" originally presented at the Symposium, In Whose Care and Custody; Orphans of the HIV Epidemic in Historical Perspectives, New York, March 3-5, 1994, p.23 unpublished manuscript.

[22] Susan Sontag, *Aids and Its Metaphors* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1989), p27.

[23] Mort, *Dangerous Sexualities*, p.26.

[24] Beverley Skeggs, *Formations of Class & Gender* (London: SAGE Publications, 1997), p.42.

[25] Valverde, *The Age*, p.79.

[26] Ibid.

[27] Mort, *Dangerous Sexualities*, p.95.

[28] The aim was to manage those aspects of sexuality that were viewed as threatening to the ideals of family life and the success of the bourgeoisie. Public displays of the trade in sexuality and the potential spread of venereal diseases, were both viewed as endangering the prevailing ideology and the fabric of Victorian society.

[29]There was never any intention to eradicate prostitution as there existed a commonly-held belief that prostitution was a necessary evil, a social valve, made to protect middle-class female virtue and maintain the social *status quo*.

[30]Keith Nield quotes the *Lancet*, 20 February 1858 in his introduction to *Prostitution in the Victorian Age Debates on the Issue from 19th Century Critical Journals* (Westmead: Gregg International Publishers Limited, 1973),p.8. The concentration on economic costs postponed difficult moral questions relating to the double moral standard

[31]Regulation was never conceived as a punishment for members of the middle-class who strayed–the husbands, fathers and brothers of the women reformers.

[32]The *Bulletin*, Vol. 3, no.3/4 (November/December 1924).

[33]In the late 1860s policy interventions could draw upon a wide variety of legal precedents to justify their demand for the sanitary supervision of prostitutes–such as the medical clauses of the Poor Law, Common Lodging House Act, vagrancy statutes, and the new Vaccination. Judith Walkowitz, *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class and the State*, (London: Cambridge University Press, 1980), p.4.

[34]The medico-moral model was predicated on three assumptions: (1) that syphilis was spread through promiscuous sexual contact with diseased prostitutes; (2)that existing voluntary facilities for treating infected patients were inadequate as preventive and therapeutic institutions; (3)that available diagnostic and therapeutic methods were suitable to carry out the medical requirements of a regulation system. This argument or model for intervention was aimed only at women but was able to gain impetus from the growing domain of public health which initially linked illness and immorality.

[35]Mort, *Dangerous Sexualities*, p.75.

[36]The Contagious Diseases Acts installed a system of regulation administered by the War Office and Admiralty at certain military and naval stations in the south of England. There had been a proposal put forward, by those in favor of regulation, to extend the acts to include the civil population of the United Kingdom–hence the term "regulationists". See both Mort's *Dangerous Sexualities* and *Prostitution in the Victorian Age* with an introduction by Keith Nield (England: Gregg International Publishers Limited, 1973) for references to the term.

[37]See "Josephine Butler: Christianity, feminism and social action" by Alison Milbank in *Disciples of Faith: Studies in Religion, Politics and Patriarchy* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987), p. 154. As a further aside it would appear that immorality is inherent with the set that surrounds itself with the Prince of Wales even today.

[38]The campaigns for moral reform drove prostitutes underground and forced them to rely on male pimps for protection and security hence changing the power base of prostitution .

[39]Fisher, *Prostitution* ,p.138.

[40]Jeffrey Weeks, *Sex,Politics & Society* p.86.

[41]Weeks, *Sex*,pp. 81-2.

[42] Madame Wanda Grabinska, "A Half-Century of Co-Operation in the legislative development of the International Conventions for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (1899-1949)," p.6, contained in the file Introductory Notes on the Legislative Development of International Conventions on the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (1899-1949), Fawcett Library, London, IBST, 1956.

[43] There are a considerable number of spelling and grammatical errors to be found in the publications of the *Bulletin*. The sentence structure found here is a typical example. Voluntary work on the publication in an underfunded, understaffed and confined space led to such errors. *Bulletin*, Vol.1,no.6 August 1922, p.7

[44] See the *Bulletin* Vol.1, no.6 (August 1922).

[45]The International Woman Suffrage Alliance was changed to the International Alliance of Women for Suffrage and Equal Citizenship in 1926. This new name was always abbreviated to the International Alliance of Women. Bosch, *Politics of Friendship*, p.176.

[46]Leila Rupp discusses in her article "Constructing Internationalism" how many of the other countries like Australia , Hawaii, Brazil, Spain, the Balkans, Czechoslovakia complained about the narrow focus of global distribution of leadership. Refusal by leaders to travel outside Europe to attend conferences etc. caused concern and bitterness especially among those who were always required to travel great distances and always to Europe. p.1579. See her chapter "Who's In, Who's Out" in *Worlds of Women The Making of an International Women's Movement* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997).

[47]See Appendix 1 containing the Constitution of the ICW.

[48]The Editorial Notes in the *Bulletin* , Vol.2, no.9 (May 1924) advises members that the National Council of South Africa held their Sixth National Conference and presented information for discussion on Women Police or Patrols.

[49]See Sheila Rothman's *Woman's Proper Place A History of Changing Ideals and Practices, 1870 to the Present* (New York: Basic Books, Inc., 1978), especially the chapter entitled "The Protestant Nun" and the reference to the WCTU, p68.

[50]*Bulletin*, Vol.3, no.7 (March 1925).

[51] A.M. Brandt, *No Magic Bullet: A Social History of Venereal Disease in the U.S. since 1880* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987); J.Cassel, *The Secret Plague of Venereal Disease in Canada 1839-1939* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1987); Claude Quétel, *History of Syphilis* trans. by Judith Braddock and Brian Pike (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1990); M. Holler *Eugenics* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1963); Steven Epstein, *Impure Science AIDS, Activism, and the Politics of Knowledge* (Berkeley: University of Claifornia Press, 1996. For discussions on eugenics see Jeffreys *The Spinster;* Mort *Dangerous Sexualities;* Valverde *The Age of Light;* Nancy Langford; *Politics, Pitchforks and Pickle Jars;* Sheehan's "Temperance, the WCTU;" Bland's *Banishing the Beast.*

[52]See Rooke and Schnell *Discarding the Asylum From child Rescue to the Welfare State in English-Canada (1800-1950)* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1983), esp. p.229, notes 1,13 on pp. 457-8.

[53]Ibid., pp.260-261.

[54]Much of the reproductive discussion today around amniosynthesis and artificial insemination is part of the ongoing eugenic debate but is never called such–rather it is referred to as genetic engineering and other more polite terms. Euthanasia is another aspect of the history. Rarely do people refer to these technologies as eugenic after the German experiments during World War 11–but even before people were careful because the Catholic Church (then and now) condemned the process. Other churches that were originally against the concept revised their positions after the United Church changed its position. Rooke, personal communication, February 1, 1999.

[55]Strong-Boag, "The Parliament of Women" p.373.

[56]For discussion on birth control see Johanna Alberti *Beyond Suffrage: Feminists in War and Peace, 1914-28* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1989), pp.120-125; Deborah Gorham's "'Have we Really Rounded Seraglio Point?': Vera Brittain and Inter-War Feminism" in Harold L. Smith (ed.) *British Feminism in the Twentieth-century* (England: Edward Elgar Publishing, 1990), pp.84-103; Mary Kinnear *Margaret McWilliams An Interwar Feminist* (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991),p.4, 8; Mort *Dangerous Sexualities;* Jeffreys *The Spinster.* Sherna Gluck "Socialist Feminism between the Two World Wars: Insights from Oral History" in Lois Scharf and Joan M. Jensen *Decades of Discontent The Women's Movement, 1920-1940* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1983), pp.279-297; Nanci Langford's *Politics, Pitchforks and Pickle Jars 75 Years of Organized Farm Women in Alberta* (Calgary: Detselig Enterprises, 1997).

[57]See endnote # 163 in Rupp's *Worlds of Women,* p.276.

[58]*Bulletin,* vol.3, no.3/4, November/December, 1924.

[59]*Bulletin,* vol.VI., no.1, September, 1927.

[60]See endnote #51.

[61]Ibid.

[62]Rupp tells us in *Worlds of Women* that *Jus suffragii* "bore no trace of the subject of birth control for eighteen years...until 1935." p.153.

[63]*Bulletin,* vol. VIII.,no.3, November 1929, p.10.

[64]*Bulletin* Year XVI, no.7, March 1938.

[65]*Bulletin* Year VIII, no.9 May 1930.

[66]*Bulletin,* Year XIII, no.7 (March 1935).

[67]*Bulletin,* Vol. 3, no.9/10 (June/July 1925).

[68]*Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.10 (March 1923).

[69]*Bulletin,* Vol. 3., no.3/4 (November/ December 1924).

[70]*Bulletin* Vol. IV, no 7 (March 1926).

[71]*Bulletin,* vol.VII., no.2, October 1928.

[72] "A number of women's organisations in Burma were affiliated to the National Council of Women of India under the British joint administration of the two countries. In 1937, when the administration of Burma was separated from that of India, these organisations affiliated directly to the ICW as the National Council of Burma and worked actively with the ICW for a number of years before the establishment of the Union of Burma Women's Associations."p .303 *Women in a Changing World.*

[73] This number represents affiliated ICW's at the end of the 1930s. Germany and Austria were forced by political activity to cease membership in the ICW in the thirties. South West Africa was the last to be affiliated to the ICW before the second world war in 1938.

[74] *Bulletin,* Vol. IX, no.10 (June 1931).

[75] *Bulletin* , Year XV, no.5/6 (January/February 1937).

[76] *Bulletin,* Year XV, no.10 (June 1937).

[77] *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.7 (April 1939).

[78] *Bulletin* , Year XV, no.9 (May 1937).

CHAPTER 3

A COMMUNITY OF PRINT

Again and again the fact forced itself on our consciousness that, whatever group we may belong to we are all linked together by the bonds of a common necessity to realize our human solidarity.[1]

The ICW *Bulletin* was a propaganda and consciousness-raising apparatus whose purpose was to create solidarity. It did this by emphasizing the commonality of female experience at the local level (in the NCWs) and at the international level (in the League). While such work concerned the *practice* of the politics of the body, that is, what was actually transpiring at the front lines, this information was passed on via the *Bulletin* as a *discourse*. This consciousness-raising effort was elaborated primarily through printed means, (the *Bulletin)* and in symbolic forms, all of which united women into another "politic of the body," a sorority or sisterhood of ICW members. The chapter that follows will discuss the *practice* or how this discourse was embodied, manifested, and transmitted in praxis.

THE NATIONAL COUNCILS

As the *Bulletin* was reporting, propagandizing and educating the ICW membership on the events and discourse at the League on the Traffic, and on the worth of its own Standing Committee, it also carried reports of the work of the individual National Councils (Councils, or NCW, hereafter). These reports provided a conduit through which to educate, inspire and guide individual Council members to action. The emancipatory project to which the ICW was committed, along with the other

international women's organisations, was based on the assumptions of full citizenship. These assumptions outline social equality as preferable to inequality as a prerequisite for transformative knowledge and self actualization, which in turn enhances society as a whole. This common starting point joined Councils in a collectivity of women's international work. Marthe Boël, ICW president elected after Lady Aberdeen's retirement in 1936, understanding the value of the education forum provided by the *Bulletin* wrote that it, and other journals of its kind could, (or had already),

> become by degrees a platform where the different feminine tendancies (sic) and all those problems which apply to women could be ventilated and discussed, where the experiences of some, with their successes or failures loyally recognized, could become examples or lessons for others, where divergent opinions could confront each other for the wider development of ideas we cherish.[2]

During the late nineteenth-century and early twentieth-century much of the discourse concerning the Traffic centred on the closure of the licensed houses or *maisons tolérées*. Such attempts dated back to the Repeal efforts of the previous century. The first International Conference in Paris in 1904 and those that followed, identified the licensed houses as the centre for the moral and social "evils" that prostitution represented. Nothing had changed as far as this view was concerned twenty four years later. The Report of the Ninth Assembly of the League of Nations repeated, "They are at the root of the problem and must be abolished."[3] During the 1920s and the 1930s the discourse of the League proliferated a rhetoric that endorsed this assumption and aimed

to solve the issue either by political process or by legislation. Sainte-Croix, if nothing else, was both insistent and consistent in this demand and irritably reiterated her concerns again in 1932:

> Though I do not like to repeat what I said last year in my article on the Tenth session of our Committee, it must be stated once more that an effective result will not be arrived at until the Governments have understood that a real suppression of the traffic is not possible unless all *maisons tolérées* are closed.[4]

The closing down of the licensed house became a symbol of the reform of prostitution in that it represented a focus that was visible, manageable, and internationally recognizable. Furthermore it was within the mandate of social feminism that charged women with social stability. Here was an arena for the collective action of the ICW, National Councils, and individual members in a fashion not unlike the experience of Carry Nation and the WCTU's with respect to alcohol and beer parlours. In this case, however, rescue replaced the militancy of the axe, symbolizing a more moderate form of practical politics. Thus we see an order of things to be accomplished: first, solidarity through collective action; second, establishment of Rescue Homes; and third, the ratification of the International Conventions sanctioned by the League.

At this point in the study it is apt to return to the complex question asked in chapter 2. How did the conservative, middle-class women of the ICW, with the reputation for aversion of controversy (the ICW had been described by Yella Hertzka of the WILPF as "the most boring in the world" because of its unwillingness to engage in issues that were controversial)[5] convince their members and others to join them in an organized assault on a social problem of this kind? The answer to this question, while

complex, lies largely within the concept of collective identity constructed and sustained within social movement analysis. This chapter therefore, will provide some aspects of theoretical analysis which seems to best fit the role of the *Bulletin* with respect to the ICW attempts to close down the *maisons tolérées.*

SOCIAL MOVEMENT–WHAT IS IT?

The ICW, as well as the other big Women's Organisations, looked to educating their members into collectivities to interpret social problems and to devise responses to them. Alberto Melucci (1995) says that analysis of social movements helps to answer the questions about how people "make sense of their world"[6] While this is not a strictly theoretical study I will, at this point, be guided by the theoretical framework of social movement theory developed by two theorists, Sidney Tarrow and Herbert Blumer, to structure the analysis of the question of how and why the middle-class women of the ICW convinced friends and other members to become involved in the contentious issue of the Traffic.[7]

Tarrow says that social movements "are created when political opportunities open up for social actors who usually lack them," in this case ICW women seeking public, political participation in order to improve the situation for women, particularly those who were involved in the Traffic.[8] Blumer groups social movements into two types–general and specific. The ICW and its agenda fit into Blumer's *specific social movement* category as these movements concentrate and are centred on reform.

> A specific social movement is one which has a well-defined objective or goal which it seeks to reach....It develops a recognized and accepted leadership and a definite membership characterized by a "we-consciousness." It forms a body of traditions, a guiding set of values, a philosophy, sets of rules, and a general body of expectations. Its members form allegiances and loyalties. Within it there develops a division of labor, particularly in the form of a social structure in which individuals occupy status positions. Thus, individuals develop personalities and conceptions of themselves, representing the individual counterpart of a social structure. [9]

Theorists use numerous categories or groupings to help explain how social movements are constructed but most arrive at different titles for the same mechanisms: (1) agitation or collective challenge, (2) development of *esprit de corps* or common purpose, (3) the formation of ideology or solidarity, (4) the development of tactics or plans–collective action. However, while these theorists differ slightly on the terminology of the general categorization of elements involved in the formation of social movements, one essentially crucial element identified by them all is the power and necessity of large social networks. Without the potential of networking a sense of community and solidarity can never be achieved and the social movement would be immobilized. The ICW with its well established framework of National and local councils was very aware of the importance and potential of networking and sought to educate all of its members in this fact.

> ...for until we realise the results in each country of the co-operation and common work of the federation of women's organisations which is the result of the existence of National Councils, and also how our Standing Committees can stimulate, study and promote action regarding various movements all over the world, we do not understand the potentiality and the responsibility of the ICW.[10]

Social movements rely on recruits to sustain the momentum and to spread the cause. Of course, large women's international organisations, like the ICW, were constantly recruiting new members through their very extensive women's networks. Lady Aberdeen, when reporting on the Seventh Quinquennial Meeting in Washington, D.C. in 1925, wrote "You will realize what a wonderful power for the world's welfare lies in the hands of our chain of National Councils linking the women of the world together for united thought and action."[11]

COLLECTIVE CHALLENGE

Tarrow notes that common purposes, collective identities, and identifiable challenge help movements to sustain collective action. "The magnitude and duration of these collective actions depend on mobilizing people through social networks and around identifiable symbols that are drawn from cultural frames of meaning."[12] In this instance the ICW mobilized women through social networks, particularly the Local and National Councils, and around identifiable symbols (colors, banners, anthems, mottos) and cultural frames of meaning. These frames of meaning were consciousness-raising, building consensus among members, lobbying and negotiating with government and League authorities, demanding reform of longstanding cultural codes (i.e. the double moral standard) and entrenched customs (i.e. the Traffic in women).

When Henni Forchhammer, ICW representative at the League, wrote in the *Bulletin* that Article 7, clause 3 of the Covenant of the League "was not in the first draft...and its insertion was due to the initiative of officers of the ICW and the International Suffrage Alliance," she was merely asserting what women's organisations

knew as fact: that women new to the political arena and lacking the resources that controlled power in partisan politics explored collective means to challenge and gain the attention of opponents and third parties.[13] In the instance discussed by Forchhammer in December 1922, the big Women's Organisations used the status of Lady Aberdeen and requested and received an audience with Woodrow Wilson. They presented their case, and achieved results. The *Bulletin* recognizing this accomplishment remarked that "...women have developed and broadened in thought and action, and are realizing better than ever before, their power for helping forward the welfare of the world and its re-construction on a new and better basis."[14]

CONSTRUCTING THE "WE" OF COLLECTIVE IDENTITY

The fundamental building block of all social movements is collective identity which, in turn, leads to collective action. This chapter will examine how the ICW went about constructing a collective concept of the "we." Who did the "we" represent–who was included and who was excluded? Why was it important to be a part of the "we"? What were some of the boundaries to membership? How did this collectivity engage the members of the ICW and influence the agenda for moral reform?

Who were the women of the ICW? Middle-class women who had become progressively more isolated within the home during the nineteenth-century initially were looking for meaningful activity outside of the home. They flocked to study groups and reform organisations at the end of the nineteenth-century. Some joined church societies but many joined organisations like the ICW, the IAW, the Women's International League for Peace and Freedon (WILPF), the WCTU, the WYWCA, and the International Labour

Organisation (ILO) to name a few. Membership in any one of these organisations did not exclude membership from another.[15] Many, if not most, of the women we are considering had sufficient money and household help to allow them to leave the home and spend time in the activities of an organisation, at least at the local level, if not at the national or international. Hence, financial resources were necessary to the formula for the collective "we." Working class women who were engaged in gainful employment worked long hours and were unable to attend daytime meetings. Most, if not all, meetings were called in the daytime to allow women time to be with their families during the evenings. Time was an impediment whereas membership fees were not as these were nominal. Moreover given the class structure of the National and Local Councils a full time working class mother would be reluctant to join a Local unless she saw this as a means to social mobility and had the demeanor and social skills to make the accommodations necessary for acceptance. Exclusiveness was not entrenched in policy; however, inclusiveness was elusive on grounds of class and race. Nonetheless, among those who were middle-class, financial considerations did prevent some from taking on national positions of leadership where travel expenses might be incurred and local funds not forthcoming. While a factory worker or domestic would be loathe to join a Local even if she had the luxury of "time," the wife of a clerk in a manufactory might be equally loathe to put herself up for office in case she would be required to partly or fully contribute to a journey of several days (in times of train travel) or be away from her family duties for that period. Therefore, while the financial dilemma could be resolved and was resolved as we shall see, nonetheless "time" remained a problem. The dilemma was, curiously

decided more equitably at the international level than at the national. As early as the 1899 Second Quinquennial Meeting of the ICW there was an awareness of the predicament:

> women from 28 countries were represented at this meeting. Many more would have liked to come, but were held back for personal or financial reasons. Husbands did not always allow wives to leave home for such long, and sometimes even dangerous journeys, and few women at this time had means of their own, independent of husbands or fathers.[16]

Lady Aberdeen was sensitive to these complications and did not want to place onerous financial burdens on more modestly situated members. In the early years of her presidency she had paid all of her own expenses but finally refused, out of fear of creating a precedent for those who might follow her.[17] In 1906 the ICW voted to provide travel grants to its leaders "otherwise the choice of Officers would be limited to ladies of independent means."[18] A definition of independent means might have been interesting in this instance in light of the fact that ICW members were described as being in this happy situation. In the 1920s the international organisation decided to pay part of the officers' expenses and provided voluntary officers with professional assistants.[19] The urgency of financing its leadership was more apparent than for the Local and National Councils. In spite of this, membership in any of the big Women's Organisations remained a middle-class privilege in light of the class and financial structures already discussed. Indeed, the ICW was considered to be the most elite of women's organisation–at least in terms of economics and social class–with a Scottish noblewoman as president. On the other hand other organisations, such as the Six Point Group, the IFWU, the Open Door International,

and the International Federation of Business Women, were no more democratic as far as social class identifications were concerned. These women members represented another form of elitism–intellectual and educational. While there may have been some social mobility through education in these years it was rare for a working class woman to attain this. Even the more radical and egalitarian women's international organisations recruited from the middle-classes. As one can hardly describe any organisation that appealed to academic or business women (there were so few), or intellectual and libertarian women, as being open to working class, disenfranchised, poor, rural or immigrant women the problem–if indeed it is construed as that–of universal representation remains.

The problem noted above, leads into some speculation about feminist history–which groups is one to study if the data base represents the articulate and educated classes of the past? This question will be touched on again in the concluding section of this chapter. Many female collective interests and identifications had their own organisations, e.g., certain sections of the trade union movement, women's institutes, the International Labour Organisation, and the All-Asian Conference of Women at Geneva. Social class was the analytic category that separated women in the early part of this century in same way that marital status, race and sexual orientation has come to during the second wave of feminism.[20]

Many of the big Women's Organisations, like the ICW, were started in Europe or America. Consequently the leadership of these middle-class organisations was centred in Europe, and European colonies. Doubtless members from this predominantly Christian/European profile, despite constitutional claims of universality–unofficially and

even indirectly, precluded many on grounds of culture, ethnicity, race, or social class. Colonies which were predominantly Muslim or Hindu (as in India, Sri Lanka or the Middle East) were affiliated with the majority religion. Often their members were Euro and Anglophiles, descendants of European heritage, or at the very least had strong cultural ties with either France or Britain which represented the leadership of the ICW. Nonetheless, Lady Aberdeen out of deference to the other religions present in the membership, had the custom of beginning meetings with spoken prayers revoked to that of a minute of silent prayer. This was an unexpected demonstration of sensitivity and respect in a time long before sentiments of multiculturalism required it.

From the motto "Do unto others as ye would that others should do unto you," to other addresses and printed reports there is a recurring penchant for scriptural allusions and Christian assumptions throughout the printed messages, President's addresses, and speeches of the ICW. The annual Christmas message itself was a clear demonstration of this identification. Thus statements such as the following intersect the secular agenda. In April of 1925, Lady Aberdeen, in preparation for the Seventh Quinquennial Meeting of the ICW, asked the membership to "invoke the presence and blessing of the Divine Spirit"to help to make the meeting a success.[21] "Welcome it, grasp it and you touch the Angel's hand that brings it to you....believe me that Angel's hand is there."[22] "'God wills it' was the old Crusaders' cry, and it is ours"[23] "This is why, on the eve of Christmas, in remembrance of the day when the light of Divine Hope flooded the earth, I can only

formulate a single wish, but one that includes all others, namely: PEACE ON EARTH AND GOODWILL IN THE HEARTS OF MEN."[24] This aspect of ICW collective identity and discourse will be developed further into the chapter.

If the construct of race and ethnicity is seen as a "problem" perhaps it should be stated at this point why this is so in relation to a more developed discussion elsewhere. Previously we have seen that questions of eugenics and birth control touched on delicate predicaments with regard to the membership of a non-partisan organisation such as the ICW who boasted a universality of members on grounds of nationality. When we consider the relationship between this construct of race, religion, ethnicity as problematic the discussion becomes clearer. It is no less problematic today on the international stage with regard to the Western views on divorce, gay families and abortion, and what is still seen as a form of cultural imperialism or Western imposition of human rights legislations.

Embedded in the fact of a Euro-Christian predominance in world view was the assumption of the biological and cultural superiority of Euro-American leadership. It was therefore not easy for women of other nationalities to gain leadership positions. While members of other ethnic origins were accepted, and involved in their native countries, very few attained such influence at the international level. This was complicated by matters of language and accessibility. Yet the issue of language itself presented complications. Provisions for translators and interpreters delayed proceedings at meetings and risked misunderstandings on translation. The need to translate proceedings, reports, and announcements, into three, let alone four, languages was costly.

*[2] Lady Aberdeen reported in the President's Notes of the June *Bulletin* of 1928 that great progress had been made at the Officer's meeting as "There was very little need for interpreting from one language into another, as all were able to understand two at least of our languages." She continued by encouraging members of National Councils likely to attend the upcoming Quinquennial meeting in 1930 in Vienna to prepare themselves by learning at least another of the official languages. "If they can only *understand* our three languages, even if they cannot speak them, the whole work of the ICW would be greatly facilitated and strengthened."

A later report on the Seventh International Congress for the Suppression of Traffic in Women and Children complained about the time taken to interpret in three languages making it difficult for a full discussion to occur.[25] This reinforced the class base of the organisation, as only women of means would have the time or money to learn languages other than their own native language. Spanish was added as a semi-official language in 1930 to include South American members. This was the result of the rapid growth of international women's organisations from this continent. Such rapid growth resulted in influence and leadership in the discourse on citizenship and equal rights treaties at the League of Nations. Women in South America through the work of their Pan-American Conferences such as the Montevideo Conference, supported by the Inter-American Commission on Women were making impressive advances in these areas [26]

---

* At this point the three official languages of the ICW were English, French and German contributing further to the Eurocentric flavor of the organisation.

Another barrier built into the structure of the ICW was that of inter-generational communication. The leadership was, not only European but the women who made up the membership were older. In 1900, at the age of twenty-six, Alice Salomon became the youngest-ever member on the ICW Council board at a time when the next youngest was already over sixty![27] Lady Aberdeen was 79 years of age when she retired from the Presidency of the ICW in 1936 at the Dubrovnik Plenary Council Meeting. Madame de Sainte Croix was 84 years of age when she died in 1939 (she had only resigned her position in the ICW three years prior to this).[28] Madame Chaponnière-Chaix was 70 in 1920 when she took on the Presidency of the ICW.[29] She was obliged to retire only two years after due to ill health. Countess Albert Apponyi, the President of the National Council of Hungary was 82 years old in 1927.[30] Hon. ICW Vice-President and Past-President of the Austrian NCW, Frau Marianne Hainisch, was 90 years old in 1929.[31] The ICW was not alone in this: Rosa Manus of the IAW was 60 years old in 1941 and Carrie Chapman Catt was 82 years old the same year.[32] There was, understandably, a desire to recruit younger women, but recruitment campaigns were not successful and, in fact, seemed to fail. The British National Council of Women held its Annual Meeting in October 1924 and had as its special subject for consideration "The Call to the Younger Generation."[33]

Several possibilities suggest why such campaigns might have failed. Young women in the 1920s and the 1930s would not be attracted to organisations composed largely of older women. Young women would not have the finances to travel to the international meetings and conventions in far off places that older, more established

women would have. Young women might want to make changes which would not be well received by the older, more experienced, members. Carrie Chapman Catt of the IAW was concerned that "we must select them with a view to working harmoniously together."[34] Finally, young women had more options, especially during these years as they were now accepted into mixed-gender socialist or peace groups. They were also gaining salaried occupations and entry into professions. After World War 1 the shortage of men became critical and the "woman question" (the problem of the surplus women) which had occupied social critics before the war was raised again. The husbandless sought gainful employment and the debate concerning marital status intensified. Wage earning women identified increasingly with men that once a woman marries she should withdraw from the labor force and reduce the tensions of competition. With more entry into the paid work force a paradox emerged. This paradox witnessed the younger generation becoming more male-identified and women's organisations being the casualties of the new ethos.

Thus we see that money, religion, ethnicity and age were determining factors in the construction of the collective "we" of the ICW. The leadership consisted of predominantly Euro-Christian, middle-class matrons who, in spite of good intentions and professions of internationalism, created barriers that were exclusive by their nature. Neither can we overlook the psychology of social organisations, regardless of their gender identifications or *raison d'etre.* Leaders, then and now, are often reluctant to give up the benefits of privilege or to accept that the time and effort they have invested in an organisation, needs to be replaced to ensure continuity. Often such leaders could not

welcome the changes necessary to transform organisations or to grapple innovatively with the challenges of contemporary circumstances.

What appealed to women? Women's organisations provided opportunities for women to engage in leadership and political activities that had earlier been denied them. Women in the National Councils were learning how, being educated, to organize propaganda and networks of support through meetings, fund raising, study circles, distribution of literature, and entertainments. They became increasingly involved in political issues including suffrage, equal rights, equal moral standards, peace, disarmament, and public education. More significantly they began to develop an appreciation, as well as experience and understanding, of what they as women could accomplish in the political arena, as has been previously argued. The ICW provided its membership with education on current news of the activities of members as they ventured into the meeting rooms of the world, especially the most prestigious of them all, the League of Nations. The *Bulletin,* Local and National organs and newsletters conducted an active propaganda on women's successes. Membership in a women's organisation created a special niche for women in their separate sphere with work consistent with the ethos implied in the phrase, "the housekeeping of the world."

An additional appeal, and one not to be understated, was found in the friendships these organisations created and nurtured. Networks of friendship that had been previously more difficult for women, because of the concept of the private, separate world of women in Victorian times, were established and extended to like-minded women, not only nationally but internationally. Many involved in organisations had been

educated and wanted to continue in meaningful engagement and common areas of interests and concerns with other women. Particular friendships and the emotional ties between individual women, in the ties of kin, or within Church association had provided women with sustenance prior to their venturing into the public domain. By extending the parameters of the private domain this protopolitical action represented a broader and more heterogenous identification on grounds of gender. Opportunities for leadership in an all-female organisation opened up a whole new vision of stewardship and service. For able women of administrative talent or personal charisma, the women's organisations offered an excitement about and appreciation for their skills and talents. Organisations provided and arena for practice and development of skills through the deliberate programs of education they offered. Organisations like the ICW provided access to elite circles and provided a framework of leadership, friendship and involvement hitherto outside the possibilities of women's political scope. Women traveled together to attend meetings and conferences, stayed in one another's homes, corresponded and conducted business with friends who were engaged in the same work. Bosch's *Politics and Friendship* (1985) demonstrates how these alliances were formed and the degree of meaning they held for the women involved. Rosa Manus, the younger disciple of the elderly leader of the IWSA, Carrie Chapman Catt wrote in October 1932

> Dearest Mother Carrie:–
>
> It seems such a long time since I saw a letter from you and I am so longing to get one from you again and hear how you spent the summer and who were your guests at Carrielaan. Ruth Morgan writes and says how active you are and how much she enjoys working with you always. So at least I know you are pretty well and that is good to know. Just 10 years ago we were beginning our big trip together through Central Europe and South America. How time has gone and

> how much has happened since. My good Father who always knew every port when we came and when[sic] I found his letter waiting for me. Then the flowers which awaited you and me in Rome and Rio and the happy days I spent with you on that trip. Often I sit and recollect some events and as you have always said: no one in the world can take away our remembrances.
>
> That evening in Vienna when you had made a speech and we had to hurry for our train to Praag [Prague] and when the millions of Kronen were not enough to pay for our taxi and luggage. The 100.000 dollar knife!! The room in Lima!! Can you smell it yet? The hanging train of sugarloaf and the little "Venuzuala" ["Venezuela"] with the good food and the mass of passengers. Our arrival in Paris, the buying of clothes; the strike and then the Rome Congress. For me such happy and interesting days will never come back again. Mother Carrie when may I look into your sweet eyes again? I do want to kiss you and tell you how much I love you. But your stepdaughter seems to have duties to fulfill.[35]

Bosch accurately observes that "no clear distinction can be made between personal letters and business, and consequently between the personal lives of these women and their lives in the movement."[36] Their personal and public lives became interwoven. Networks of friendship between internationally organized women accomplished much in the name of universal sisterhood and for universal solidarity among women

> It is never without emotion that the writer...can take part in this ceremony, and watch the presentation of these women, many of whom have traveled far over land and sea, to bring their message of affection, and to re-affirm their loyalty to the Law of Love which circles us under the banner of the International Council.[37]

Organisations like the ICW developed mottos, emblems, songs, designed flags and slogans which provided symbolic references to a collective identity.[38] Women members, the world over, could identify with the symbols of their own organisations. Women of the ICW could respond to the motto of the Golden Rule, whose philosophy had universal appeal and imbued all of the great world religions. The official colors of the ICW–purple, gold and white were used whenever ICW women met and wherever

they sang their international anthem.[39] The Mayor and Municipality of Lyons, France, through Sainte-Croix presumably, presented the ICW with magnificent silks for their new banner (which had been designed by a young Norwegian artist) to be made in time for the Quinquennial Meeting that was coming up that same year in May 1925 in Washington D.C., U.S.A.[40] Motivational symbols of membership and specific rituals of meeting evolved with national flags adorning meetings, conventions, processions, and social events. Tours and elaborate dinners were organized to facilitate the development of *esprit de corp.* The comradeship of the male clubs or the solidarity of men bearing arms or fighting in labor unions for their rights now had an equivalent in the sisterhood of women united to fight for their own sex. In the introductory chapter socialization was identified as part and parcel of the educational process and in the ceremonials and symbolic motivations of the ICW we see how this was initiated and realized.

The Agenda for the Quinquennial Meeting of 1925 included such gatherings as "Evenings free for parties given by Ambassadors, Ministers, or private friends on Friday May 8th. The following evening was put aside for the Evening Pageant of Peace and War with the Sunday program delegated as a "Mother's Sunday" with special services in all of the churches.[41] The attraction of socializing with "high Society" added to this sense of importance and pride.

> After a big luncheon party at the Foreign Office where we were entertained by His Excellency and Mme. Mitilineu, we had the pleasure of a visit to Mme. Bratianu, who showed us her marvelous collection of Rumanian embroideries. Later we were graciously received by the Princess Royal Elena in her palace, where her mother, Queen Sophie of Greece, was also present.[42]

We might note at this point that the social exclusiveness of the ICW and the elite nature of its leadership had good reason for not welcoming other women into their ranks (working class, ethnic, racial minorities)–not merely as a condescending ploy because they might be an embarrassment or socially unacceptable at such functions–but even more crucially, that they might themselves be deprived of attending such functions should they open up leadership positions for more rather than fewer candidates. Hence, organisations like the ICW created a body of elite, educated women, interested in social and moral issues like the Traffic. Such women were able to engage in and influence practical politics by virtue of the collective identity that membership provided them and we must concede, monopolized such positions.

THE MEANS OF SUSTAINING COLLECTIVE IDENTITY

Crucial to the development of collective identity, and of utmost importance in maintaining and nurturing membership and keeping women involved, especially in international organisations, is the organizational publication.[43] It is primarily through print that organisations like the ICW could establish lines of communication among and between its international members. National Councils and members could participate in a broader collectivity. Of course, the *Bulletin* could only be effective if it's message was read by the membership. This was facilitated by the fact that the *Bulletin* was printed in the three official languages and by1930 extended to include Spanish.[44]

> The editor of the *Bulletin* emphasized the importance and value of rapid interchange of information between members...and begged that *more use be made of the Bulletin* in reporting successes and advances that can be helpful to other

> countries. The National Councils were urged to make more use of the information made available to them through our official organ by largely increasing its circulation.[45]

Print united people in "invisible communities of discourse." By means of letters to the editor, reports, position pieces, dialogue and discussion groups, print opened up a new kind of public forum.[46] For those who could not travel to national or international meetings the *Bulletin* was a silent means of including and educating them in the politics and activities of the event. As Rupp says "Organisational publications, accessible at least to those who knew the official languages, opened a window on the world of international activism to the widest circle of all."[47] Such publications: the *Bulletin* in the case of the ICW, *Jus Suffragii* (to become in 1930 *International Women's News*) for the IAW, *Pax et Libertas* for the WILPF and *The Catholic Citizen* for the St. Joan's International Alliance, all served to create large, universal circles of female participation and practical politics.

PRINT AND ASSOCIATION

Historically people have come together in associations to achieve a common goal. England developed large scale associations, based on religion or commerce, before most of the continent or other places. It was the association that became a model for those involved in social organization and change to gather and collaborate. Associations create an inter-connectedness between groups and the opportunity to share learning strategies, planning and success. Associations helped ordinary people think of themselves as part of a broader collectivity.[48] It was the association that provided the impetus for reform

movements, such as the Moral Reform Movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries which is of interest to this study. It was the association and the networks that resulted from them that could provide the strength in numbers and the common purpose that was needed to direct collective action for an equal moral standard. Lady Aberdeen in her "President's Notes" referred to this in September 1927 when she said "...we have discussed together various common needs affecting us as citizens of the world, and in many instances we have come to a decision as to how we can help one another to meet these needs."[49] Social networks provide the basis for associations, such as the ICW, to become influential potential centres for collective action.[50]

After the events of the Great War when women's organisations restructured and reestablished their links to politics and internationalism, the ICW reaffirmed its commitment to the equal moral standard and work against the Traffic. In the 1920s reports began to appear in the *Bulletin* noting the efforts of the National Councils. While these reports appeared idiosyncratic and discrete, like pieces in a jigsaw they began to take a definite form. Yugoslavia announced the building of homes and training schools for orphans and those in moral danger.[51] The National Council of Greece provided, for the education of the ICW members, a detailed, step-by-step process of involvement for any Council to follow when working with the Traffic.[52] Sainte-Croix visited Austria and Hungary helping Councils to get re-established in their work for an equal moral standard and wrote reports for the readers of the *Bulletin*.[53] Uruguay, in 1925 and 1926, reported active work in the fight against the Traffic.[54] However, it wasn't until the League's 1927 report on the Traffic was publicized that the ICW rekindled its previous interest both in

the Traffic and the double moral standard. A later League Report requested the Committee of the League "to examine as soon as possible this question of desirability of recommending to all Governments the abolition of the system of licensed houses." This and related recommendations were printed in the *Bulletin*.[55]

Tarrow observes that "If print and association were complementary channels in which movement networks could develop, together they made for an explosive combination."[56] Because Sainte-Croix represented the voluntary organisations at Geneva, League delegates understood that the *Bulletin* reflected the views and opinions of the other big Women's Organisations, not only the ICW. Invisible communities of women felt "connection" with each other and otherwise unrelated groups acknowledged their existence. The local could be linked with and educated about the universal. This sense of collective identity–being part of a committed whole–attracted many women to join women's voluntary organisations. Lady Aberdeen in her President's Notes of September 1927 urged National Councils to report special events, awards, achievements, public recognition or honors that occurred within their Councils, in order to foster solidarity "...the great lesson taught us by the international tie which unites us is how dependent we are on one another, and that if one member of our world federation suffers, all others suffer with it–and that if one member is honoured, all other members are honoured also.[57]"

The combination of print and association played a key role in the propaganda and diffusion process. ICW members were asked to recruit one new subscriber to help make the *Bulletin* "worthy to take its place among the best international publications...."[58] It

was pointed out that if each of the ICW's 40 million women were to recruit just one member, the women's cause would be advanced dramatically and as a consequence could agitate with such strength of numbers to rectify the problems surrounding the Traffic. In 1933 the *Bulletin* was able to state with some confidence: "Little by little we gain ground in widely differing circles."[59]

During the thirties the French NCW dominated the pages of the *Bulletin* with reports on the Traffic. The "Temporary Union," (of which Sainte-Croix was an Hon. President, and the French NCW were active members) was established as an ad hoc federation of all of the associations and societies in France that had engaged in the fight against state regulated prostitution.[60] Nowhere do we have a better example of solidarity, diffusion of propaganda to unite the disparate groups under a common banner, collective action, and recruitment. As a consciousness-raising campaign, the "Temporary Union" published pamphlets, wrote reports for the *Bulletin* and distributed propaganda about the dangers of licensed prostitution to enlighten and educate the public about the Traffic. The *Bulletin* promoted these tactics with full understanding of the power of its education programme:

> ...the very contact with the mass of the people, with the ordinary man in the street, who comes to our lectures and conferences, affords us hope. The cause for which we are working involves questions of which public opinion knows next to nothing; as soon as it learns what it is all about, it takes our side and the number of our protagonists grows from month to month.[61]

That such a campaign of propaganda succeeded is evident in the following facts. In the first two years of its existence the "Union" had recruited "about fifty big national

associations or federations" [62] and by 1937, five years later, it had succeeded in closing *maisons tolérées* in Chateau-Thierry, Pontarlier, Lievin, Hazebrouk, Carmaux, Strasbourg, Haguenau, Mulhouse, Grenoble, Salins, Oyonnax, Nancy, and Castres. It was able to boast of a membership of 19 local branches and 400 member societies so that it toyed with the idea of becoming an international organisation as support had spread to other countries, especially the East.[63] The success of the French Council and its affiliates was based on voluntary networks engaged in distributing and creating effective printed propaganda which informed and educated supporters of collective action across a diverse geography and social divide.[64] At no other time was the politics of the female body in France so hotly disputed–in newspapers and tracts with the contending camps polarized between abolition and regulation. The "Union" had at least brought the commodity of sex and the question of who would control it out of the closet and onto the public arena. It was not until the 1970s that the politics of the body and its ownership would re-emerge in France with equal outrage concerning the abortion question and later still the "gay body." By that time, however, communities of print and association were augmented with the electronic media, the sexual revolution, and second wave feminism. France did not lead here as it did then.

A further example of French solidarity and that country's sophisticated exploitation of the word is seen when the French Union Temporaire met bitter opposition for proposing a Bill to close the *maisons tolérées*. The opposition had raised fifty million francs to fight the Union and its Bill. The *Bulletin,* in support of the Union's stand, published a list of prominent supporters among whom were numerous doctors,

magistrates, barristers and members of the Senate: Mme Brunschvieg, Under-secretary of State at the Ministry of National Education, Dr. Rosenthal, representative of the Radical Party, Dr. Pinard, specialist in venereal diseases, and Dr. Lavergne, member of the Public Health Committee of the Senate. Thus we see an example of how the ICW co-ordinated the efforts of diverse local associations and exploited the press in order to gain publicity and support. In this instance the *Bulletin* attempted to exert political pressure on a parliamentary system and not merely report on events.

PRINT AND SOLIDARITY

Once again Tarrow provides us with our framework to continue the discussion,

> Primary associations and face-to-face contacts provide solidarity for collective action among people who know and trust one another. But print, association and coalitional campaigns of collective action build solidarity among larger numbers of people and help to diffuse movements to new publics. They thus permit the formation of loose, often contingent social coalitions, sympathetic or parallel issues and broad movement cycles.[65]

Lady Aberdeen, Sainte-Croix, Louise van Eeghen (International Secretary of the ICW) and other members of the ICW Executive traveled and visited various National Councils in order to recruit or to provide encouragement within the membership. Lady Aberdeen reported to the membership in December of 1925 that "Miss van Eeghen's latest letters tells [sic] of successful visits to Bolivia and Chile. She was able while at La Paz to meet ladies interested in the working of the ICW and to form a National Council of women of Bolivia, soon to affiliate with the ICW."[66]

International and National meetings were organized to avail members of the benefits to be derived from face-to-face contacts. Lady Aberdeen noted that only by

attending such meetings would members be really convinced "of the unique character and influence of this organisation."[67] An example of this is found in the IAW when Rosa Manus claimed no surprise when the U.S. chapter considered withdrawal from the Alliance as it's president "has never been at one of the congresses and therefore has never got the international thrill about it."[68] Lady Aberdeen enthused about the " personal understanding and friendship" so important to women's work that is gained at such meetings, while Aino Kallas of Estonia declared "The world's map is, so to speak, now peopled for me."[69] The big Women's Organisations understood the importance of providing time and opportunity for informal discussion and socializing at such meetings although, according to Rupp, the ICW was the most lavish about the latter.[70] Because of the international dimensions of the Traffic this informal time was valued for the opportunities it presented in forming liaisons and exchanging information. At informal gatherings delegates discussed policies, strategies, and social philosophies which, in turn, generated discussion in their respective Council meetings–non-formal education at its best.

At the National level, while visiting other towns and cities, members would "drop in" on a local branch of the Council, not merely for curiosity but because the visits affirmed their sense of identity. In 1937 the National Council of the U.S. reported the establishment of a Hospitality Committee to arrange meetings, visits and introductions, and provide accommodations. "We think that if such visits were better planned and arranged beforehand, they would be more satisfactory to visitors and hostesses alike, and prove more fruitful to international work and interests."[71]

While face-to-face communication was undisputedly the most effective method of creating solidarity, print was its surrogate. At a different level of interaction and participation print, as a metaphorical gathering, facilitated a meeting of minds–it silently educated. When the *Bulletin* reported its success in 1927 by asserting that "our paper is arousing a good deal of interest and ...our membership finds it useful and are anxious for its continuance" this was not merely self-congratulatory as the evidence indicates that subscriptions remained in the area of 1,500 in the mid-thirties, despite the Depression and economic bad times.[72] Over half of the subscriptions went to English speaking members while the remaining number was divided between the German and French members.[73]

This sense of community is seen in the following comment made by the ICW president Marthe Boël in 1939:

> At this moment when the hard law of the jungle dominates the relations between certain nations and when the moral values underlying human intercourse seem to be in eclipse, we feel the necessity of re-affirming the principles on which the ICW is based and which have guided its development during fifty years.
> Our belief in the potentialities of international work, in the necessity of human solidarity, in the beneficent results of international contacts is greater than ever, but in order to apply our Golden Rule...we must agree on certain, essential principles: the recognition of right based on justice, the respect of the human personality, moral and physical, and the reprobation of all violence, both as a means and as an end.[74]

It was this sense of community that was provided through the medium of print that was so valuable to those in the invisible communities.

ENDNOTES

[1]Marthe Boël, *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.6 (March 1939).

[2]Marthe Boël "Report on the Activities of the ICW since the last Council Meeting," ICW, *President's Memorandum,* 1938, in Rupp, *Worlds of Women,* p.178.

[3]Report of the Ninth Assembly of the League of Nations by Oliver Bell, *Bulletin,* Vol.VII, no.2 (October 1928).

[4]Mme Avril de Sainte-Croix's Report on the Eleventh Session of the League of Nations, *Bulletin,* Vol.X, no.9 (May 1932).

[5]Yella Hertzka to Mary Sheepshanks [German], July 12, 1930, WILPF papers, reel 2, quoted in Rupp *Worlds of Women,* p.20.

[6]Alberto Melucci, "The Process of Collective Identity" in Hank Johnston and Bert Klandermans eds., *Social Movements and Culture Social Movements, Protest, and Contention,Volume 4* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995), p.42.

[7]Tarrow's work was specifically chosen because of its attention to the role of print in establishing collective action–and Blumer's because of his attention to role models.

[8]Sidney Tarrow, *Power in Movement Social Movements, Collective Action and Politics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994).

[9]Herbert Blumer "Social Movements" in R.Serge Denisoff and Robert K.Merton eds. *The Sociology of Dissent* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc.1974), p.6.

[10]*Bulletin* , Vol.VI, no.2 (October 1927).

[11] *Bulletin,* Seventh Quinquennial Meeting at Washington, May 4,5, 1925. Vol.3 n0.9/10 June/July 25.

[12]Tarrow *Power in Movement,* p.6.

[13]*Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.8 (December 1922).

[14]*Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.6 (August 1922).

[15]Nancy Sheehan, by way of example, tells us that in Canada Mrs. Louise McKinney belonged to the Women's Missionary Society, the Ladies Aid Society, A Library Society, the Alberta Prohibition Society and the Moral and Evangelical Council of the United Church, as well as being the long-time president of the Alberta WCTU and a national vice-president; Emily Murphy was a member of the National Council of Women, the Social Service Council of Canada, the Imperial Order of the Daughters of the Empire, and the Canadian Social Hygiene Council; Nellie McClung belonged to the WCTU, Women's Press Club, the Political Equality League, the National Council of Women, General Council of the Methodist Church and the League of Peace. See Nancy Sheehan's "Women and Education in Alberta: The Rhetoric and the Reality" in *Exploring Our Educational Past,* Nick Kach and Kas Mazurek eds. (Calgary: Detselig Enterprises Limited, 1992.

[16]ICW *Women in a Changing World,* p.21.

[17]"Treasurer's Report" and "Minutes of Council Meeting, " ICW 1899 congress report, vol.1, 91, 162-64; Lady Aberdeen to President's of National Councils of Women, August 1897, ICW papers, box 3, NCW-GB HQ, as quoted in Rupp, *Worlds of Women,* p.53.

[18]See footnote #16, chapter 3 in Rupp, *Worlds of Women,* p.245.

[19]ICW *Women in a Changing World,* p.49.

[20]See Rooke and Schnell, unpublished paper, "Unfettered Liberty :Protective Legislation, Equal Rights and Women on the Margins at the League of Nations" (March 1994); Susan Lehrer, *Origins of Protective Legislation for Women 1905-25* (Albany : State University of New York Press, 1987) and Carol Reigelman Lubin and Anne Winslow *Social Justice for Women: The ILO and Women* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1990).

[21]"The Call to the Seventh Quinquennial Council Meeting of the I.C.W.", *Bulletin,* Vol. 3, no.8 (April 1925).

[22]The President's New Year Message, Lady Aberdeen, *Bulletin* ,Vol.VI, no.5 (January 1928).

[23]Presidents' New Year Message, Lady Aberdeen, *Bulletin,* Vol.XII. No.5 (January 1934).

[24]President's Christmas and New Year Message, Marthe Boël, *Bulletin,* Year XIII, no.3/4 (December 1939-January 1940).

[25]*Woman's Leader* "International Conferences and What They Did" printed in the *Bulletin,* Vol. VI, no.1 (September 1927).

[26]See Francesca Miller, *Latin American Women and the Stand for Social Justice* (Hanover and London: University Press of New England, 1991).

[27]Rupp, *Worlds of Women,* p.61.

[28]*Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.7(April 1939).

[29]Bosch, *Politics and Friendship,* Letter # 58, p.188.

[30]"Notes on my Visit to Hungary, Austria and Germany" Lady Aberdeen, *Bulletin,* Vol.V, no.7 (March 1927).

[31]*Bulletin,* Vol.VII, no.7 (March 1929).

[32]Carrie Chapman Catt to Rosa Manus, August 6, 1941, *Politics and Friendship Letters from the International Woman Suffrage Alliance, 1902-1942* ed. Mineke Bosch with Annemarie Kloosterman (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1990), p. 261.

[33]*Bulletin* , Vol.3, no.3/4 (November/December 1924).

[34]Carrie Chapman Catt to Aletta Jacobs, May 24, 1919, Jacobs papers, IIAV, quoted in Rupp, *Worlds of Women,* p.62.

[35]Letter # 72. Rosa Manus to Carrie Chapman Catt, Bosch's *Politics and Friendship,* p.215.

[36]Bosch, *Politics of Friendship,* p.23

[37]*Bulletin,* August 1922, Vol.1, No.6.

[38]Eva Upmark of Sweden was made an honorary member of the National Council of Women of Sweden for writing the words for the ICW song adopted at the Hague in 1913. The music was composed by Adèle Cederschiøld. *Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.11 (May 1923).

[39]Ibid.

[40]*Bulletin,* 3, no.3/4 (December 1924) and *Bulletin* 3, no 5/6 (Jan-Feb.1925).

[41]*Bulletin,* Vol.3, no.5/6 (January/February 1925).

[42]*Bulletin,* Vol. V, no.6 (February 1927).

[43]Tarrow, *Power in Movement,* chapter 3.

[44]*Bulletin* Vol.VIII, no.10 (June 1930).

[45]*Bulletin,* Year XV, no.5/6 (January/February 1937).

[46]Elizabeth Eisenstein "Revolution in the Printed Word," in Roy Porter and Mikulas Teich, eds. *Revolution in History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), pp.186-205, quoted in Tarrow's *Power in Movement"* p.53.

[47]Rupp, *Worlds of Women*, p.175.

[48]Tarrow *Power in Movement,* chapter 3, p. 48-61.

[49]Lady Aberdeen "President's Notes, *Bulletin* ,Vol.VI, no.1(September 1927).

[50]Tarrow, *Power in Movement,* p.56.

[51]*Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.9 (February 1923).

[52]*Bulletin* , Vol.1, no.10 (March 1923).

[53]*Bulletin,* Vol. 2, no3 (November 1923); Vol. 2, no.6 (February 1924).

[54]*Bulletin* , Vol. 3, no.8 (April 1925); Vol.IV, no.9 (May 1926).

[55]*Bulletin* , Vol.VI, no.4 (December 1927).

[56]Tarrow, *Power in Movement,* p.58.

[57]*Bulletin,* Vol.VI, no.1 (September 1927).

[58]*Bulletin,*Vol. VI. no.1 (September 1927).

[59]*Bulletin* , Vol.XI. no.7 (March 1933).

[60]*Bulletin,* Vol.IX. no.3 (November 1930).

[61]*Bulletin* ,Vol. XI. no.7 (March 1933).

[62]*Bulletin*, Vol.X, no.7 (March 1932).

[63]*Bulletin*, Year XVI, no.1 (July 1937).

[64] See Tarrow *Power in Movement*, p.48.

[65]Ibid, p.60.

[66]*Bulletin*, Vol. IV, no.4 (December 1925).

[67]Lady Aberdeen to Fannie Fern Andrews, August 10, 1920, Andrews papers, box 119, SL, quoted in Rupp, *Worlds of Women*, p.175.

[68]Rosa Manus to Carrie Chapman Catt, November 12, 1939, Catt papers, IAW, quoted in Rupp *Worlds of Women*, p.175.

[69]Both quotes can be found in *Bulletin*, Vol. 3, no.9-10 (June-July 1925).

[70]Rupp says that lavish social events, the speciality of the ICW, entertained and rewarded attendees for their hard work. Excursions, receptions, teas, pageants, dinners, and eventually even films filled the hours (or minutes!) that were not spent on business. See *Worlds of Women*, p.172.

[71]*Bulletin*, Year XVI, no.3 (November 1937).

[72]*Bulletin*, Vol.6, no1 (September 1927).

[73]G.M.Günther, "Editor's Report," ICW, *President's Memorandum*, 1938, 51-55, quoted in Rupp, *Worlds of Women*, p. 177.

[74]Marthe Boël, "President's Message" *Bulletin*, Year XVII, no.7 (April 1939).

CHAPTER 4

PRINT AND ROLE MODELS

> They know that in the old heroic days when women had not yet conquered their rights, you were one of the first to acknowledge them. You were one of the pivots round which they centred the awakened consciousness of their new rights and duties....[Y]ou understood that such a movement could not remain the privilege of one country or of one race alone, but should spread across the frontiers. Based on this fundamental idea you created the ICW in its present form.[1]

When Blumer defined *specific social movements* he noted that "individuals develop personalities and conceptions of themselves, representing the individual counterpart of a social structure"and the ICW was no exception to the rule.[2] Such structure can be found within the ICW. Strong leaders emerged, at the International, National and Local levels who acted in turn as role models. Blumer continues that in order for life, enthusiasm, and vigor to be established and maintained within an organisation (the essential test of solidarity in the face of adversity) there needs to develop a sense of morale or group "will." Role models and leaders acted as intermediaries in this process.[3]

In order for an organisation to develop such morale or group will Blumer states, there needs to exist faith in several convictions. The first conviction concerns a strongly held belief in the purpose of the movement: a belief that the movement will fight injustice, and wrong will be corrected with the success of the social movement. In this sense, he asserts the goal is always overvalued.[4] Such a conviction is exemplified in the preamble to the constitution of the ICW.

> We, women of all Nations, sincerely believing that the best good of humanity will be advanced by greater unity of thought, sympathy and purpose, and that an organized movement of women will best conserve the highest good of the family and of the State, do hereby band ourselves in a confederation of workers to further the application of the Golden Rule to society, custom and law: DO UNTO OTHERS AS YE WOULD THAT THEY SHOULD DO UNTO YOU.[5]

The second conviction is a faith in the ultimate realization of the movement and its goals. Since the movement is seen as a necessary agent for the regeneration of the world, in this case the woman's world, it is regarded as being in line with the higher morals of the universe, and in this sense divinely favored. Hence, the belief that success is attainable. Finally, as part of this complex set of convictions there exists the belief that the movement is charged with a sacred mission–to sustain and stabilize society. Together these convictions serve to strengthen the efforts of the movement and work towards establishing the necessary morale. Obstructions, checks and reversals are viewed as occasions for renewed effort since they can in no way impair the faith in the convictions or in the inevitability of success.[6] Fernande Baetens in her eulogy to Lady Aberdeen (in the *Bulletin,* May 1939) pointed to the understanding and belief that Lady Aberdeen had in these convictions, and the inspiration that she provided. She quoted her as saying "United work for great and inspiring causes is hallowed by passing through dark days of opposition, danger and disappointment as well as through days of glorious achievement."[7]

Clearly, the development of morale in a movement consists of developing a sectarian attitude and a faith bordering on the religious. Similarly Berenice Fisher (1988) and Jeanne Braham (1995) argue that any understanding of the importance of role

models, whether in personal and individual engagement, with a mentor, or as is discussed here, in organizational dynamics, initiates moral "faith." As Jacqlyn Padavell observes in her 1998 study, "the role model impacts on one's feelings of isolation–the loneliness one feels by a sense of being alone in a struggle against the constraints placed upon behavior, actions and beliefs."[8] Berenice Fisher elaborates the point:

> If historical change has any real meaning, we find ourselves on a constant moral frontier in which neither our or anyone else's experience or knowledge of the world guarantees out transition from the present to the future. Thus, the loneliness of women trying to create new kinds of lives or a new kind of society is not merely psychological or even sociological. It is historical and ultimately, perhaps, existential. It is the loneliness of not knowing where our efforts to change social relationships will take us and whether, in the end, the struggle will be worth the cost.[9]

Again Padavell notes that "(m)inimally, the role model helps others learn to express themselves even in the most ordinary of areas such as using new language or vocabulary."[10] Therefore role models are essential mediators in the educational, propaganda campaigns of the women's movement and as a pseudo-social construct.

The idea of moral faith provides cohesion, integrity and morale to group identity in the emergence of a "saint cult" which can be identified in every enduring and persisting social movement. Today such saints curiously are called cultural "icons," a term also derived from religious belief; whether they be Madonna for pop culture or Princess Diana for the democratization of a class ridden Britain. There is usually a major saint to any social, reform or revolutionary movement, in this case, Lady Aberdeen, and a series of minor saints, such as the ICW executive, Mme Avril de Sainte-Croix for her work with the Traffic, NCW presidents, and other national and international "worthies"

that can be held up to members for emulation. "The development of this whole saint cult is an important means of imparting essentially a religious faith to the movement and of helping to build up the kind of convictions spoken of above."[11]

When considering the purpose of role models within the ICW, Lady Aberdeen was considered to be the major secularized role model or saint and the other leaders minor role models or minor saints. This hierarchy of saints was invested by the membership of the ICW who elected these women to be their leaders or role models, as a means of securing solidarity and ensuring success for the movement.

THE FUNCTION OF ROLE MODELS

Berenice Fisher argues that patriarchy assigns to women through the rearing of children and the taking care of others within extended families the role of sustaining traditional culture–the caretaking of the world, or social feminism. Any changes to this order applies tension to the social fabric and threatens to tear women's worlds apart. This rending, of not only the social fabric but of women themselves, provides the context for the search for role models as another version of "the ties that bind."[12]

ICW women during the 1920s and the 1930s who were engaged in issues at the League, or with social concerns such as the Traffic, Education, Disarmament, Peace, Women's Politics, or Economics were searching for role models that would "imply a kind of healing, a reconciliation of values that the world presents as contradictory."[13] They were searching for role models who would allay their uncertainties and speak convincingly about the issues they were fighting for. Lady Aberdeen, was the undisputed role model of the ICW over three decades.[14] If we concede that the world of middle-

class women, up until this historical moment, was saturated with the rhetoric of social feminism, we can then understand why the *Bulletin* exploited this ideology and sentimentalized its rhetoric by representing her as a universal mother figure. Lady Aberdeen, in her column or "President's Message"and her annual Christmas and New Year Messages reassured and "mothered" her members through the hard times that embodied the ideals of the movement. Her own actions and indefatigable energies transformed somewhat pedestrian appeals into authentic entreaties for sacrifice and service. She asked no more of her membership than she was prepared to give herself.

> Meanwhile, let every ICW member in all countries remember that our Golden Rule principle calls on every woman qualified to render social services to be prepared to give all voluntary help in her power at a time when motives of economy oblige every country to cut down expenses, and so much good work for the sick and suffering, for public health and the welfare of mothers and children is suffering.
> We shall be glad to receive any reports that National Councils may be able to send us as to what their members are doing in this respect[15].

Elsewhere the Bulletin reiterated its maternalist roots "Ever remember that it is our divine mission to "Mother the World" and the world at this time is in urgent need of that *Mothering*"[16] Acting this role therefore she kept the mission of the ICW before the members, reminding them of their duty and of the fact that they, the members, had much social housekeeping still to do.

After she retired from the presidency in 1936, she remained its Hon. President. She requested that she be called "Grannie"so that her influence would continue and her messages could sustain the work of "mothering" her international family of daughters "...she responded by a devotedness that made her numerous ... correspondents feel they

had in her a real mother" observed Annie Cristitch in her eulogy to Lady Aberdeen.[17] In this respect the ICW was not alone. We have noted several pages previous to this that Rosa Manus, presumedly representing the affection and admiration of her generation for Carrie Chapman Catt, referred to her as "dearest Mother Carrie." Lady Aberdeen saw no need to apologise for such frankly sentimental expressions anymore than when she used overtly religious allusions as we have seen in this chapter. She frequently evoked "God's will" to legitimate and assure the faithful work of the ICW would be rewarded or when she saw such work as a "Crusade."

MORAL FAITH

While we cannot imagine the evocation of God's will, let alone the militant and triumphal images of Crusaders inspiring the modern woman, however, these were familiar, even comforting metaphors in a society where Christianity provided much of the impetus for reform, as, indeed, the term "social gospel" implies. Fisher, when talking of the processes of choosing role models to inspire members to heights and achievements yet to be realized explains her preference for the term **moral faith.**[18] Correspondingly, the metaphor of the cult of saints is peculiarly apt for the ICW because Lady Aberdeen herself was quite unabashed in the manner in which she sentimentalized her appeals or when she resorted to scriptural language and religious allusion. Recalling Padavell's observation that "(m)inimally the role model helps others learn to express themselves in the most ordinary areas such as using new language or vocabulary" we might make the

following comment. This form of linguistic borrowing was not new to the listener or the reader therefore one might suppose that the members were not learning to express themselves differently, nonetheless two transformations were taking place.

First, that they were learning to express themselves publicly at all constituted an educational part of women's organisation, and Lady Aberdeen's rhetorical style demonstrated the qualities necessary for such public gestures–confidence, care and concern, passion, and the use of articulate and poetic prose. Second, while using familiar linguistic traditions–preaching and scriptural forms–she demonstrated how the old could be regenerated with an infusion of educative progressive social concerns. In much the same way Martin Luther King Jr., used familiar prose forms and scriptural references (albeit far more powerfully that the genteel Lady Aberdeen) to infuse his civic rights movements with meaning, persuasion, and symbolism. Nobody would treat his scriptural metaphors of freedom and the promised land with derision even now. In the first decades of this century few would have expressed contempt for similar rhetoric used by women like Lady Aberdeen to unite the women's movement. Speeches such as the following fit this pattern of inspirational borrowing. Lady Aberdeen in her Christmas message for 1922 speaks of the call to work to prevent war:

> On the International Council of Women lies a special duty, as it links together women of so many different types aud [and] ideals, as well as of so many different races. And it is on the rising up of all sorts and conditions of women, to grasp their great power to prevent war in the name of the motherhood which all women can claim in their relations with the world, that the issue depends. Again and yet again let us encourage one another with the massage [sic] given to us at The Hague last May:
> All things are possible to Him that believeth.
> There is a word which has been a watchword between the women of the National

> Council of Women of Canada and myself ever since the days long ago when I had the happiness to be their President
> "Altior"–meaning "higher"–ever "higher".
> May I make that word "altior"! the watchword for the ICW this year, and with that word on our lips and in our hearts, go forth to our victory of Faith and Love?[19]

The motto–"Altior"–that Lady Aberdeen bequeathed the ICW was symbolic of a divine sense of mission and solidarity as the term itself has a transcendent almost translucent quality in its meaning–"higher and higher." Lady Aberdeen infused ICW members with the inspiration that was needed to rise up and join in the fight for peace.

Again in her Presidential letter of April 1931 she called ICW members forth to rally for the cause of peace:

> Dear friends of the ICW, remember the marching orders of the ICW, so often repeated at our Council meetings, and again emphasized at Vienna, and be up and doing with the full realization that in this great Crusade we can with all confidence adopt the watchword of the Crusaders of old–
> "GOD WILLS IT"
> and so we must succeed.[20]

The moral faith that Fisher describes consists of three important components for those who legitimate role models for their cause:

(I) First, such faith arises in practice after an organisation creates an ideal model, in this case Lady Aberdeen. It then validates this choice by trying out the actions that she suggests.[21] Over the years Lady Aberdeen's ideas were transmitted through the *Bulletin.* Some examples will suffice. In April 1926, the president circulated a letter to all Presidents of National Councils containing <u>precise</u> information regarding the constitution of the League and its various educational activities over the previous five years. She

suggested that Councils diffuse this "correct knowledge" not only to its membership and affiliates but also to Government Education Departments. She mentioned, in passing, the success of the French NCW, in this respect. "In France the Minister of Public Instruction is arranging for the distribution of several thousand copies."[22] In September of 1928 she urged members to take on the responsibility of making known in each country the conditions of the Kellogg Briand Pact*[3] "that he or she is pledged to uphold the principles embodied in the Pact to make it a reality, so that August 27th, 1928, may be forever regarded as the date of a new era."[23] Later that same year she encouraged members to become involved in the ratification of the Convention for the suppression of obscene publications. "We trust our National Councils will exert themselves to spread information regarding these matters which affect so vitally the welfare of humanity and will make their influence felt."[24] Her 1934 Christmas Message called upon her members to rally for peace "surely it must be within the power of the mothers of the human race, with the blessing of God, to bring to bear on the politicians which will prevent world suicide."[25] However, it was not enough to wish for peace she provided practical steps and suggestions in order to secure it. In 1936, just before her retirement as President, she suggested that the National Councils "send messages of loyal support and good wishes to

---

3 * Kellog Briand Pact was an agreement signed on August 27,1928, condemning "recourse to war for the solution of international controversies." It was more properly called the Pact of Paris. It was proposed to the U.S. Government by Aristide Briand, the foreign minister of France as a treaty outlawing war between the two countries. Frank B. Kellogg, the U.S. Secretary of State, suggested instead a proposal for a general pact against war. After prolonged negotiations the Pact of Paris was signed by 15 nations: Australia, Belgium, Canada, Czechoslavkia, France, Germany, Great Britain, India, the Irish Free State, Italy, Japan, New Zealand, Poland, South Africa, and the United States.

the Assembly of the League of Nations meeting at Geneva on September 21st which will be called upon to make very important decisions."[26] All of these forms of practical politics could be readily executed and to her credit they were. As National Councils reported their successes the *Bulletin* continued to encourage and affirm their responses by calling up the imagery of their president.

> ...she has written the word *progress* on the banner of all the National Councils; that she has made the ICW contribute to the awakening of the feminine conscience; that she has encouraged women's desire for higher ideals and strengthened their resolve to serve ever better their families, their country and humanity as a whole.[27]

(II) The second component describes how moral faith flows directly from the first condition: the practice of such faith has its own truth. This truth, Fisher says, is dynamic, concerned more with discovery than what is already known. In the case of role models the discovery process expressed itself in the form of a narrative carried to members by the *Bulletin*.[28] The narrative is often an oral transmission. In this case the narrative is in print. The role model acts like the central figure in a myth–and the role of myth is to bind, educate, and construct a group identity. The hero's adventures direct attention to otherwise inaccessible parts of the world, e.g. the League and other centres of international convocations to which these members could explore and aspire. The *Bulletin* carried the narrative of Lady Aberdeen to the membership and in some ways she became a mythical figure in her leadership qualities and persona which projected an elegant, articulate, aristocrat whom one might assume too distant from the ordinary middle-class wife and mother. Such idealized representation however, is given flesh and

form through the leveling processes of news print and image. With literacy and the use of the printed word heroes and cultural icons become more accessible and their moral superiority democratized because they are now constructed and reconstructed by the rank and file. The media really was the message! Her activities sent powerful messages to the membership. Numerous accounts of her visits to other countries and her meetings with officials at the League and with heads of State reinforced her as patron, mother of the ICW, and a worthy role model to emulate. We could chart a course of her activities through the *Bulletin* commencing with her re-election to the Presidency, after Madame Chaponnière-Chaix was forced through ill-health to retire in 1922, to her retirement from the Presidency at Dubrovnik in June of 1936 at the age of 78 years, before her death three years later. Her activities embraced meetings and conferences of the ICW and other major organisations at the Hague, Geneva, Washington, Paris, Vienna, and numerous other national venues.[29] Moreover, she was not only a vociferous public orator but a tireless letter and speech writer as she took upon herself the mantle of Ambassador for the world's women.[30]

Lady Aberdeen was not an ordinary role model–she was a "celebrity" and as such was admired and heeded. She was a model of womanhood. She and Lord Aberdeen served as a model couple exemplifying all that was respectable in a conservative western society that valued marriage and family. She drew Lord Aberdeen into her political work referring to him frequently in her articles and speeches. At the National Executive Council meeting in Ottawa, Canada, in 1898, Lord Aberdeen was included in the official photograph of the NCWC Executive.[31] Upon his death in 1934 the *Bulletin* devoted half

of its April issue to a tribute, written by Lady Aberdeen's good friend Alice Salomon.

> Our President...would never have been able to work as she did for the International Council of Women, had she not had, at all times, the support of Lord Aberdeen's full consent, his inner and outward interest and his ever ready sympathy and co-operation.[32]

The article continued stating that "Many, many of us have lost a *father* in him."Lord Aberdeen had been welcomed at several of the ICW meetings "in London, in Canada, in Paris, in the United States, as well as in Ireland and Scotland."[33] His home had been open to ICW members who "were always made welcome as if they had been members of his own family"whether at Haddo House, the Vice Regal Lodge in Dublin or finally at the House of Cromar.[34] The Aberdeens granted members access into a family of nobility, celebrity, and success.

The *Bulletin* kept the image of its major saint before the members. Many photos highlighting Lady Aberdeen can be seen throughout the pages during the inter-war years: on their Golden Wedding Anniversary, November 1927; a photo of Lord and Lady Aberdeen with their new car;[35] a photo of the Executive Officers of the ICW meeting at her home in Cromar in June,1928; a photo of Lady Aberdeen being capped by Principal Sir George Smith at the Graduation Ceremony, Mitchell Hall Aberdeen when she received her L.L.D. in April 1929; and a photo of her at six years of age appeared in January 1934. Her image served as an inspiration to those in far-off communities of print.

(III) The third feature of this moral faith is that it fosters a loyalty to an ideal and therefore to others who are willing to work for that ideal. The myth-like character

exudes an aura of divine appointment.[36] There can be no disputation about the fact of Lady Aberdeen's popularity as a leader. Proof of the acclaim the membership held can be seen in the presentation to her and Lord Aberdeen of "an Austin car" to which she responded with the usual graciousness "...whenever we travel together in our beautiful ICW motor car, we will always look upon it as a symbol of the faith and love which unites us all, and in the power of which we confidently believe that we shall be permitted to work miracles."[37] Members applied on her behalf for Honorary L.L. D.s from the Universities of Queen's in Canada, and Aberdeen in Scotland. In 1928 she was granted the Freedom of the City of Edinburgh, her name being only the third woman's name to appear in the Burgess Roll of the Scottish capital.[38] Three years later, in January 1931, she became Dame Grand Cross of the British Empire.[39] On the last New Year before her death she was presented with The Scroll of the Légion d'Honneur by the French Government. This public recognition solidified and gave credence, through the intervention of her public image and universal acclaim, to the work of the ICW. One can only speculate whether Lady Aberdeen would have been awarded a Nobel Peace Prize when her name was put forward just before her death.

A major concern for all ongoing social movements, and in this respect the women's movement is no exception, is whether its impetus will lessen with the demise of a larger-than-life leader in which is invested symbolic meaning. Many a political and religious crusade had floundered on this issue. Lady Aberdeen's personal magnetism and ideals had created a strong, vital presence in the ICW for over three generations. Her grandsons, John Pentland and Archie Gordon, Marquess of Aberseen, give us a glimpse

of this charisma as they remember their grandmother. John Pentland said:

> She was very big; she made herself comfortable as she settled down to talk. She had personal magnetism. Her style was a one-to-one rapport in numerous small conversations. She was sympathetic toward those she talked to, but shrewd underneath...
> I always thought of her as someone who had discovered at an early age that she could almost do without sleep entirely. After the dinner guests left she would write letters until three or four in the morning, or even later–and the postman would arrive about six with more loads of mail.[40]

and Archie Gordon remembered:

> She looked like the prototype of Grandmother, large, with magnificent hair; at dinner she heard the conversation at the far end of the table. Many were frightened of her, she was so imposing. She encouraged one to talk, especially about politics.[41]

It is still uncertain and impossible to say whether the decline in the popularity of the national councils and the membership after the war can be attributed to the death of Lady Aberdeen before the conflict. Afterwards there was so much devastation and social reconstruction to be done and the world had changed so fundamentally that it was not possible to find her replacement. In short, no ICW woman could fill the shoes of the woman who had access to Prime Ministers, Presidents and Queens. Queen Mary frequently joined Lady Aberdeen for tea when she was holidaying at Balmoral Castle.[42] However, the economic and political forces of this era are probably more important to the ICW's failure to generate the same energy and cooperation among women as it had for almost four decades. The ICW had been vibrant and attractive at the turn of the last century, strong up until the 1930s, struggling with ideological divisions among women's organisations before the war, and enfeebled after. The daughters did not follow their mothers into the national councils as they entered gainful employment and made inroads

into all occupations and professions. Even at the League by the late thirties the more radical, libertarian, and "progressive" of the women's organisations had gained the ascendancy which was a portent of what was to come once women recouped their losses after the second world war and re- organized themselves into NGOs at the United Nations.

Dr. Alice Salomon, of the ICW Executive, anticipated the forthcoming crisis in moral leadership and raised the issue at the Executive Committee meeting that was held in London in 1929 to prepare for the forthcoming elections at the Quinquennial Meeting in Vienna.[43] She further cautioned the ICW membership of its inordinate dependence on Lady Aberdeen and the need to plan for the future. The ICW was, in many ways, Lady Aberdeen's creation and formed in the image of her own aspirations. She had become less of a role model and more of cultural icon for her followers. Salomon was concerned lest the ICW prove itself to be merely the lengthened shadow of one woman.

> This is the problem which the ICW will have to solve in the near future. The Quinquennial Meeting at Vienna will have to elect new officers for responsible positions. This involves important and far-reaching decisions,as the ICW has during the 40 years since its foundations–with the exception of two short intervals–received the imprint almost exclusively of one personality. It is an open secret that the ICW has members in all countries who cannot picture the Council under new leadership.[44]

There is some irony in this concern if we recall that Dr.Alice Salomon, now aged 55, had been the same 26 year old who was the youngest at that time to be elected to the ICW board in 1900. On the other hand we see in Dr.Salomon a gravitus, friendship and

loyalty that had not faltered except in this one doubt for over a quarter of a century. She too can be afforded, one should think, the status of 'beati.'

Identifying with a certain role model did not guarantee an easy passage through the historical uncertainty that organisations were facing. However, it did lessen the sense of "loneliness' that Padavell speaks of, decrease anxiety, facilitate adjustment to new environments, and aid in the transformation of woman from wife to reformer. Role models do not appear magically before us: the identification with a role model implies a conscious choice, or consent, on the part of members to imitate certain "virtues" that the group deems valuable.[45] Role models are vitally important to character and conduct, for we strive to become like the mental image that we have of the object of our admiration and respect. Thus, the choice of a role model implies a connection to other women who are drawn to the same ideal and inspiration this model evokes. After all, if Lady Aberdeen was a role model for the members of the ICW it would be redundant if members did not say "she is my role model" and wish to become like her. This would just be a nod in the direction of someone whom members may have recognized as having admirable qualities but the attractiveness had not been internalized enough to create a desire for emulation and conscious imitation. The *Bulletin* facilitated this connection transnationally for its members and reinforced its choice of role model regularly with unquestioned loyalty that the ICW membership legitimated. The *Bulletin* acted as Lady Aberdeen's messenger and mediator, an instrument of her convictions as it conveyed her

words, persona, and actions to the invisible communities of readers who needed reassurance, by way of example, that their causes were worthy, especially during those times of self doubt which emerged in the dark years of the 1930's.[46]

SAINTS OF A LESSER KIND

Drawing again on the metaphor put forward by Blumer we recall that the Church has two levels of sainthood: the Canonised and the beatified (the 'beati'). In similar terms Lady Aberdeen can be considered a major saint in such a hierarchy of the blessed, but there existed many saints of a minor order. [47] Because of Madame Avril de Saint-Croix's high public profile as the assessor representing women's voluntary organisations at the League of Nations concerning the Traffic, we might appoint her as a role model of the second order.

Madame G. Avril de Sainte Croix was a founding member of the French chapter of the ICW in 1901. She had been a journalist in the 1890's, writing about the abuses of prostitutes in the St. Lazare area of Paris. She saw the fight against regulation as common to all feminists' and women's charitable organisations. She had written profusely in order to educate women about the usefulness of suffrage and the need for women to be represented in official bodies in order to achieve results. She was a friend of Josephine Butler's. Madame Avril's commitment to the cause of the Traffic provided a compelling example to ICW women and a dedication to moral reform that spanned over thirty two years. She had a single minded sense of purpose and was determined to end injustices in the system of regulation. Convinced that the ICW could bring about the abolition of *maisons tolérées* and improve the lot of women who had been enslaved to the life she

asserted confidently that "A little more effort and everywhere, with us as elsewhere, truth will prevail and we shall see the total disappearance of a system, which is unworthy of any civilized country."[48]

Sainte-Croix offered, by way of education and validation to the members, practical suggestions for their involvement. When the Standing Committee on the Traffic at the League circulated a questionnaire in 1929 to the women's organisations that she represented, a summary of replies were printed in the *Bulletin.* She asked for explicit information as to what actions were being taken in several areas including:

- The protection of young women artists engaged in music halls and similar establishments, when on tour in a foreign land.
- Abolition of the system of licensed houses.
- Penalties to be inflicted on persons living on the immoral earnings of women.
- Raising of the age of consent beyond the limit set in the Convention of 1910 and amended by the Convention of 1921.
- Suppression of the traffic in obscene publications.
- Measures to be taken for the assistance of women leaving prison.
- Campaign against venereal diseases.[49]
-

Sainte-Croix was totally committed to the abolition of the Traffic. She therefore insisted that women of the ICW be mentally equipped and knowledgeable of League policies, conventions, procedures, principles, and debates, so that their efforts would be effective. For this purpose, always didactic rather that inspirational, as with Lady Aberdeen, she used the *Bulletin* to instruct the readership in the enormity of the problem and the means by which the Traffic could be stopped. In this respect Sainte-Croix was reminding members of the importance of co-operation with the League. She recognized that League decisions required women to take "adequate steps, in their own countries, in order to secure the application of the decisions adopted at Geneva" and that women must

study the questions that were presented for the meeting of the next year's Advisory Committee Sessions.[50] She reiterated her concerns in 1932 by reminding members once again of the necessity of taking an interest in the League. "(T)hey should know the League literature which deals with the subject [of the Traffic] and which will supply them with ample documentation for the defense of the cause which we all have at heart....[51] Sainte-Croix desired nothing less. The questionnaires sent out annually by the League were of themselves educational tools intended to inform women around the world of the problems at hand and to encourage self-examination as to what councils were actually doing about the problems. Results were compiled and published annually which Sainte-Croix advertised through the *Bulletin* "We strongly recommend the members...avail themselves of this useful source of information, which will enable them in turn to pass on thorough information to their Councils."[52]

In 1935 she wrote earnestly:

> Passing from the report of the experts to that of the women's organisations, we are able to state with deep satisfaction that they bear witness to the efforts of women's associations in all countries to combat the traffic and to help in ameliorating women's moral position in countries where laws and traditions still hold them in a state of inferiority.[53]

and five years later again we read another example of her sense of purpose

> I must add, that if the ICW Standing Committee on "Equal Moral Standard and Traffic in Women", through the ready response of National Councils to our enquiries and thanks to the efficiency of its work, afforded me the most valuable support, the other organisations have also had a large share in enabling me to persuade the League of Nations Committee of the social and moral value of our claims. [54]

Like Lady Aberdeen, Sainte-Croix had many honors to attest to my claim that she was identified as a worthy role model, including an appointment to the French Inter-parliamentary Commission on Moral Reform. She went to Germany, Italy, Greece, Canada and the United States on behalf of France. [55] The French Government awarded her the Gold Medal in recognition for public service in the area of venereal disease. The *Bulletin* proudly acclaimed her work: "It is the first time that the medal has been awarded to a women."[56] Moreover, France conferred upon her the "Gold Medal" for extraordinary merits in the domain of Social Welfare and Public Health as well as a Knighthood and later Officer of the Légion d'Honneur.[57] Mme Woytoviez-Grabinska (Poland), her colleague on the Traffic in Women Committee of the League for many years, bore witness to her ability, in a speech given when Sainte-Croix stepped down from her position on the Committee on Equal Standard of the ICW. Woytoviez-Grabinska noted that Sainte-Croix was held in high esteem in Geneva for her expert knowledge, her wisdom and deep understanding of human nature.[58]

WOMEN OF DISTINCTION

The *Bulletin* printed historical articles on women "worthies" and lesser saints, e.g. Josephine Butler, or Frances Willard who had been one of the organizing members of the ICW in 1888 and the first National President of the NCW of America. It also printed biographical profiles of lesser saints and contemporary role models. The May 1930 edition, in preparation for the Quinquennial Meeting in Vienna, produced a special issue dedicated to great women. Women, such as Anna Howard Shaw 1847-1919, of the U.S.; Paula Becker-Modersohn 1876-1907, the German painter; Ellen Key 1849-1926, the

Swedish writer and pedagogue; Gertrude Bell 1868-1926, Hon. Director of Antiquities in Iraq, from Britain; Rose Scott 1847-1925, the Australian pioneer; Eleanor Duse 1858-1925, the Italian actress; Clémence Royer 1830-1902, French scientist; Berta Von Suttner 1824-1914, the Austrian Peace Movement pioneer; Calliope Ath. Kehaghia, 1839-1909, the Greek social reformer; Olive Schreiner 1855-1920, the South African writer; Koidula 1843-1886, the Estonian poetess; and Pandita Ramabai 1858-1922, the Indian woman's leader and educational reformer were featured.

Indeed, the ICW used the term "saint" to refer to Frances Willard and elevated her to cultic realms in its coverage. In July 1939 the *Bulletin* published an article, "Saint or Politician?" to mark the one hundredth anniversary of the birth of Frances Willard. "Saintlike, she set a high standard for herself, and inspired women of the world to set a similar standard for themselves. 'Woman is the mercury in the thermometer of the race,' she said. 'Her status shows to what degree the race has risen out of the dust.'" It continued, "For the first time in history, the centenary of a woman is being celebrated all round the world," it told its members.[59] Her own saintliness represented a maternal metaphysic with which all women were imbued.

The *Bulletin* also produced a remarkable record of women's public successes and activities during the inter-war years in the form of terse "bios" often accompanied by the printed image. The pages of the *Bulletin* consistently recorded women's achievements, recognitions, and successes in the public domain and as they entered the professions and created new ones. In the "Miscellaneous Column", which became in October 1926 the "Notes and News" column, such meticulous documentation was aimed at educating,

encouraging and inspiring the membership. In this respect factual evidence written in the form of a brief biographical description became a sophisticated form of instruction, propaganda and incentive. In short, the ICW *Bulletin*, continued a veritable Who's Who, of female activity and distinction.

The reports were short and concise and usually between six and thirteen to an edition. Most referred to individuals, but many constitute a chronology of events that were significant in the history of women's political and social involvement. Although too numerous to itemize, a sample illustrates the previous observation. The December 1927 "Notes and News" contained the following items: German University Teachers' Association; Woman Judge in China; Women Mayors in England and Wales; Italian authoress gains the Nobel Prize for 1926; Woman Commissioner appointed by the Australian Federal Government; New Woman M.P. in Great Britain; First Hostel for working girls in South Africa; Women and Broadcasting; First Women Editors in India; Second Woman of the British Royal Academy; International Typewriting Champion.[60] This small example provides an idea of the scope covered by the section. Items from all walks of life and from every corner of the globe were reported. The same issue drew the readers' attention to legal changes to the age of marriage for British women. This kind of item might best be described as a type of "institutional role modeling" as it was a well used strategy intended also to motivate, inspire and encourage, as well as inform. Having a sense of what other women world-wide were doing and achieving was motivational. Vicariously women felt less isolated.

In all there were 1,186 entries in the *Bulletin* between 1922-1939 under the Notes and News column. As it is not within the scope of this study to include them all Appendix III represents a sample of this use of role modeling whereas Appendix IV documents the significant events in the history of women's political, social, and economic advancement which have been referred to as "institutional role models." The printed record was highlighted on occasion by printed icons–photographs–of women whose achievements were being lauded or whose eulogies were used summarizing their lives. The range of achievements was broad including as it did women of distinction in a given year and in a variety of fields: science, art, aviation, engineering, literature, philanthropy, the professions, politics, travels and explorations, international organisations, and journalism. In this manner the *Bulletin* documented its own narrative history of "saints,"(or to borrow yet another religious phrase, "the communion of saints") with the intent to inspire rather than to overawe its more ordinary readers with the examples of extraordinary women.

One might speculate on the impressive accumulation of female achievement during the inter-war period for it is doubtful that such a cohort had been produced before, or, for that matter, since. The combination of suffragist and the nineteenth-century building blocks of women's organisation which culminated in a protofeminist movement came to fruition in the inter-war generation when this cohort was fired with the promise and the passion of internationalism and a formidable belief in the transformative power of women in the new social order; a conviction that had not yet been disillusioned with the realities that awaited them to dash their hopes for equality.

This documentation provides a compelling account of the achievements of women in the inter-war years. In addition, it gives us an insight into the ICW leadership's understanding of the feminist movement–despite its conservative agenda–of the value of the community of print to which it had contributed substantially.

Like hagiographies within church devotional literature these were meant to be inspirational as well as informative. They exemplified the cardinal virtues of fortitude and integrity in the face of criticisms and difficulties. They modeled dedication and loyalty to a cause which sublimated self-interest except as a common good. The *Bulletin* brought together both historical exemplars and distinguished role models thus uniting women, both past and present, in a common vision and narrative of betterment for their own sex. By example, however, the lessons that were conveyed in a didactic sense and the narrative which was delivered in an inspirational manner, contained explicit and implicit messages. These messages paved the way, by way of example, for ongoing generations of young women who would continue the work pioneered by their foremothers. There can be no question that the ICW was conscious of its responsibility to create a common identity through voluntary association and networks of support. Both print and association played a key part in the diffusion process and role models served as a kind of lightning rod which would attract and animate those processes that might become daunting and disheartening. Neither can there be any doubt of the deliberate and conscious motivations behind the editors and contributors on the *Bulletin* staff in exploiting (in a non-pejorative sense) role models for consciousness-raising. Such efforts give credence to the claims made in the opening chapter that for the process

to be educational it must include intention. Communities of print represent the memory of social movements and role models serve the need for the constant revitalization of such memory in order to rededicate oneself to a cause. Print therefore becomes a culturally inscribed means of such communication and diffusion whose intent is to galvanize collective action and practical politics through education.

EXCEPTIONALISM

Some will object that the use of the kind of role models found in the *Bulletin* cannot be a referent to less visible women. A common criticism says that we cannot extrapolate from a privileged position. How can "female worthies" act as a reference to others given that it is then exceptionalism that warrants attention but it is this exceptionalism that separates them from us? Is there not a danger of universalizing and homogenizing different gendered experiences?

At this point it seems imperative to anticipate such criticisms about using middle-class women as role models because they are not representative of ethnic, racial, working class, or lesbian women. The main justification is a straightforward one. Women's history is not yet in a position to eliminate any examples or data bases even if they do represent white middle-classes. Mainstream (or "male-stream") history has banks of historical credit from which to draw, but women's history, as a discipline, has no more that twenty five years of incremental scholarship. Moreover, it is still comparatively youthful in its interpretative and methodological life and while it is searching for new ways to discover women's past lives by utilizing innovative approaches (i.e. literary reconstructive criticism, architectural design, oral traditions, art and symbolic

configuration etc.,) like mainstream history as a discipline it remains largely dependent on written documents. These materials are middle-class in that they were created by and for the class interest of the literate and erudite, elite, and privileged. These classes also had the foresight to preserve such records. (Even the cost of pen, ink, paper, or later the printing presses were prohibitive for other social groups even had they the time and the education to similarly preserve their histories.) Therefore, most of women's history is "whig" by definition. Herbert Butterfield's *The Whig Interpretation of History* (1965) has not been supplanted by a better study of this problem. In a slim but tightly argued essay he asserts that most history has been told from a middle-class protestant perspective whose historiography is on the side of progress and presentism especially when interpreted from an ideological (i.e. feminist in this case) vantage. Such hindsight tends to be biased, selective, state simple rather than complex roles, and is sequential in narrative. Typically the narrative points to winners and losers, triumph of good causes (the women's movement), the justice of claims, and therefore a "good. "On the other hand the enemy has no redeeming qualities (i.e.patriarchy). This interpretative stance is reinforced because the records not only reflect these tendencies but also the class interests of the social group creating the documents, their worldview in understanding the events they observe or the causes they promote. [61] This remains a dilemma and an irony if for no other reason than that the revisionist historians have reclaimed the voices of silenced social categories who are often seen through the lens of middle-class professionals who are writing about them–and feminists can be ranked among them. Because it was the middle-classes who left written records their imprimatur remains,

therefore, stamped on historical events and data. Moreover, as has been noted they had the luxury of economic means to enable them to be in the vanguard of the early feminist movements. On these grounds therefore, Lady Aberdeen and Sainte-Croix must be accorded their place in the annuls of history as role models and protofeminist leaders enshrined in the printed word and the printed image. However, this defense, might be constructed more simply yet. This study, for the reasons that have come before, is about a middle-class organisation, its middle-class leadership and membership, and the middle-class lens through which it interpreted the world of women and sought to advance the lives of women in general. That it had limitations because of its social class interests is hardly a revelation.

While one may be careful not to use such role models for disenfranchised and other racial groups, or even white working class women, it is evident that middle-class women responded to the achievements of such women and when unable to achieve similarly (as few of us are even with present advantages) were not intimidated by their "highflyers." Moreover, the historical role models in this study are not inventions of the present, although a contemporary historian may select an unknown figure and use her for this purpose in reconstructing female experience. The role models of the first generation feminists were identified as such by their peers and cohorts and no amount of grumbling about their exceptionalism can alter these facts of history. The point of a role model is that her example mediated the fluid boundaries of voluntary associations as she led collective appeals to authorities or distinguished herself in singular ways. These fluid boundaries were common to protopolitics which were "based on solidarities found in

everyday life (that of the family, community, and collective experience)"[62] The ICW was an example of protopolitics in this sense as were the majority of non-partisan women's organisations before suffrage. By their examples, and in the ordering of their lives, role models, even if they appeared to operate from lofty heights of privilege and intellect when compared with ordinary women, exhibited those qualities necessary in their refusal to cordon off the public and private domains.

COLLECTIVE ACTION

After outlining a theoretical framework for collective action found in women's organisation, what in conclusion can we say about the collective action of the ICW concerning the Traffic in the inter-war years? In spite of the propaganda campaign and mobilization around the issue represented by reams of print in the *Bulletin* and issuing forth from the League, the concept of prostitution as a moral sin had not changed substantially. At best the prostitute was still viewed as a victim without agency in need of rescue and protection. The idea of prostitution as a career, then (or now for that matter) was not considered as a valid aspiration and women's groups appeared to have ignored it almost completely. The closure of the *maisons tolérées* seemed a concrete possibility and provided Councils with definite and achievable goals. They could even deceive themselves that they were making headway as the words of Dame Rachel Crowdy indicate

> ...by the late 1930's the work of the Pimp and the Madame had become so hazardous and the eyes of the public in many countries so open that traffic was nearly impossible, but then came the second world war and when the tide of that war ebbed, much mud, flotsam and jetsam was thrown up on the world's beaches[63].

Because poverty was rarely given as a cause for prostitution, any recommendations were superficial and doomed to failure. It was argued that prostitutes needed respectable work to be assimilated into the community but nowhere does the *Bulletin* report any training programs or projects to meet this end. As long as the ICW and its counterparts disregarded the economic predicament nothing was destined to change.

In fairness, there were legitimate reasons behind the failure. The ICW could not do anything on a large scale without the financial support of the international assembly and this was not forthcoming. The ICW had neither the organizational or financial resources to attempt macro-economic schemes. In addition, the Leagues's expenditures had been reduced, along with the International Labour Office, by 20% in the late thirties.[64] It is feasible that nothing by way of programs was done owing to lack of funds but neither had it the will. While the Traffic committee was serious about its work there is no evidence that the League as a whole saw it as significant. Indeed, neither did many of the other women's organisations who were getting involved in issues such as child welfare, peace and disarmament, the 'nationality' of married women, and equal status. Consequently, by the thirties Councils were obliged to focus their respective energies on issues of peace and disarmament and the work on the Traffic took a back seat to these more pressing concerns.

"Communities of print" have a power that outlives the actual date of circulation for they represent a historical document of a given time period in conjunction with both a

past and a present. In the case of the ICW theirs is a record of what has gone before (i.e. in their historical biographies of role models) and the record of the moment. However, the *Bulletin* also informs and educates the future and can continue to enrich the lives of contemporary proponents of similar causes. How the *Bulletin,* and by extension other feminist organs, gave life to their role models, heroines, and women of distinction, provides us today with examples in the efficacy of such forms.

This chapter has examined the role of communities of print in social movements generally and in the ICW particularly. As part of the discussion it was demonstrated how role models contributed to the diffusion, personae, words, and images in the printed word. The *Bulletin,* though published primarily for its own membership in the national and local councils throughout the world, was subscribed to by numerous women's organisations just as it was circulated at the League where it found a permanent place on the League Library shelves at Geneva. In this way it appealed to other contingent and sympathetic groups. It does not seem presumptuous to suppose that its editors surely hoped that they would educate men and women, including those at the League as we shall see in the next chapter, as to the justice of their causes including their work with the issues surrounding the Traffic in Women.

ENDNOTES

[1]*Bulletin,* Year XV, no.7 "To Lady Aberdeen, on her 80th Birthday" (March 1937)

[2]Blumer, "Social Movements", pp.6-7.

[3]Ibid.

[4]Ibid.

[5]*Women in a Changing World,* Appendix 1, "Preamble and first two articles of the Constitution of the ICW adopted in Washington, 1888., p.329.

[6]Blumer, "Social Movements", p.11-12.

[7]Fernande Baëtens "Lady Aberdeen, Pioneer of World Peace" *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.8 (May 1939).

[8]Jacqlyn Padavell, "Gender and the University: The Debate Over Women's Studies" (master's thesis, University of Alberta, 1998), p.114.

[9]Berenice Fisher, "Wandering in the Wilderness: The Search for Women Role Models" in *Signs*, Vol.13, no.2 (Winter, 1988), p.217.

[10]Padavell, "Gender and the University," p.115.

[11]Blumer, "Social Movement" p.11-12.

[12]Fisher, "Wandering in the Wilderness" p.217

[13]Ibid.

[14]Lady Ishbel, Countess of Aberdeen, wife of the seventh Earl of Aberdeen, (1857-1939) was elected President of the ICW in 1893 at the International Congress of Women in Chicago called by the National Council of Women of America. This congress was held in conjunction with the World's Columbian Exposition. Lady Aberdeen was thirty six years old at the time. Coincidently, as Rosa Shaw observes in her *Proud Heritage*, Lady Aberdeen served as international president for thirty six years (except for the five year period during the war and the two years from 1920-22 when Madame Chaponnière-Chaix was president) until 1936, when she stepped down at Dubrovnik, Jugoslavia, at the age of seventy-nine. Lady Aberdeen's death was reported in the May 1939 edition of the *Bulletin.*

[15]"President's Letter" *Bulletin,* Vol.X, no.7 (March 1932).

[16] "President's Letter" *Bulletin,* Year XIV, no.2 (October 1935).

[17] Annie Christitch wrote in the memorial edition commemorating the death of Lady Aberdeen, "Our Lady Aberdeen" *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.8 (May 1939).

[18]Fisher, "Wandering in the Wilderness" p.226.

[19]"President's Letter" *Bulletin,* Vol.1, no.8 (December 1922).

[20]"President's *Letter*" *Bulletin,* Vol. IX, no.8 (April, 1931).

[21]Fisher, Wandering in the Wilderness" p.226.

[22]"Letter to the Presidents" from Lady Aberdeen, *Bulletin,* Vol. IV, no.8 (April 1926).

[23] "President's Notes" *Bulletin,* Vol. VII, no.1 (September 1928).

[24] "President's Notes" *Bulletin* , Vol.VII, no.4 (December 1928).

[25]"President's Letter" *Bulletin,* Year XIII, no.4 (December 1934).

[26]"President's Letter" *Bulletin,* Year XV, no.2 (September 1936).

[27]"Now that Death has closed her Eyes..." *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.8 (May 1939).

[28]Fisher "Wandering in the Wilderness" p.226.

[29] The *Bulletin* documented her attendance at meetings from the Hague1922, Rome1923, Geneva 1923, London 1923, Copenhagen 1924, Washington 1925, Paris 1926, Geneva 1926, Geneva 1927, Geneva 1928, her own home, the House of Cromar in Aberdeen 1928, London 1929, Geneva 1929, Paris 1929; Vienna 1930 Paris, 1934, Dubrovnik 1936, Edinburgh 1938 being some examples.

[30]Lady Aberdeen wrote to the editor of *The Times* on the "Protection of Children;" the President of the Assembly of the League regarding the "Instruction of Youth in the Principles of the League of Nations;" the Governments of those States of the League who did not include a woman delegate. She made official visits to: Bled, Zagreb, and Belgrade, Yugoslavia; Sophia, Bulgaria 1926; Bucharest, Roumania 1926 to encourage and sustain members. Her special occasions were noted, for example, her 70th birthday March 14, 1927; her 50th wedding anniversary, November 1927; her award from the City of Edinburgh October 1928. All of these were communicated to the membership through the medium of print.

[31]See the photograph from the Public Archives of Canada reproduced on page 257 of Doris French's *Ishbel and the Empire A Biography of Lady Aberdeen* (Toronto and Oxford, Dundurn Press, 1988).

[32]*Bulletin* Vol.XII.,no 8. (April 1934), p.1

[33]Ibid.

[34]Ibid.

[35]As an interesting aside from this–there appeared in the Jan/Feb 1937 *Bulletin* a full-page add from Austen complete with photos of the Aberdeens and Lady Aberdeen and her driver on the way to Dubrovnik. The add quoted Lady Aberdeen as saying in her speech at Dubrovnik "I have traveled hither in an automobile which was the gift of my friends of the ICW on the occasion of our Golden Wedding nine years ago, and I am very proud to be able to show you that automobile still going strong after having traveled hundreds of thousands of miles. Now it has brought me across Europe, up hill and down dale, without ever causing any trouble or delay." Even the advertising people at Austin understood the nature of her position as major role model for the ICW.

[36]Fisher, "Wandering in the Wilderness" p,226.

[37]The car was actually presented at the Annual Meeting of the Scottish Branches of the British National Council at Aberdeen, presumably in May of 1927 as Lady Aberdeen gave her thanks in the *Bulletin,* Vol.V, no.10 (June 1927). It was also reported in "To Lord and Lady Aberdeen on the occasion of their Golden Wedding, November 7th, 1927, *Bulletin,* Vol. VI, no.3 (November 1927).

[38]Gertrud Margarete Günther "Ishbel, Marchioness of Aberdeen and Temair 1857-1939"*Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.8 (May 1939).

[39]*Bulletin,* Vol.IX, no.5 (January 1931).

[40] Personal communication John Sinclair, Lord Pentland, to the author, New York, June 1979, quoted on page 301 in French's *Ishbel and the Empire*.

[41] Archie Gordon, 5th Marquess of Aberdeen, to the author, London, 21 July 1977, page 301 in French's *Ishbel and the Empire*.

[42] French's *Ishbel and the Empire*, p.310.

[43] *Women in a Changing World*, p.59.

[44] Dr. Alice Salomon, "Future Plans for the ICW" *Bulletin*, Year VII, no.7 (March 1929).

[45] Mary Niles Maack and Joanne Passet *Aspirations and Mentoring in an Academic Environment Women Faculty in Library and Information Science* (Westport, Conneticut: Greenwood Press), p.28.

[46] For further information of the life of Lady Aberdeen see French's *Ishbel and the Empire* and Marjorie Pentland's *A Bonnie Fetcher* (London: B.T. Batsford, 1952).

[47] The names of some of the other women who held office, were all made familiar to ICW members through the pages of *Bulletin*, for example, Madame Chaponnière-Chaix of Switzerland; Louise van Eeghen of the Netherlands, the ICW Secretary; the Vice Presidents, May Ogilvie Gordon, D Sc, Ph.D., F.L.S., J.P., London; Mme Avril de Sainte-Croix, France, Convener of the Standing Committee on the Traffic; Mrs Philip North Moore U.S.A; Fru Anna Backer Norway; Fröken Henni Forchhammer Copenhagen; Dr.Alice Salomon Germany; Madame F. Plaminkovà Czechoslavakia; and Princess Alexandrine Cantacuzène, Roumania. Other officers, Mlle. A.Christitch, Yugo-Slavia; Madame Helène Romniciano, Geneva; Dr.Marie Elizabeth Lüders Germany, Treasurer; Lady Trustram Eve; Laura Dreyfus Barney, France, Vice-Convener of The ICW Standing Committee on Peace and International Relations; Maria Vèrone of France, Convener of the Standing Committee on Law and Suffrage; Madame Pichon-Landry of France, Dame Elizabeth Cadbury of Great Britain, Convener of ICW Peace Committee; Countess Albert Apponyi of Hungary; Madame Marianne Hainisch President of the Austrian NCW; Dr. Thuillier-Landry, Convener of ICW Standing Committee on Public Health France; Lady Nunburnholme of Great Britain, to name a few.

[48] "Equal Moral Standard and Traffic in Women" Avril de Sainte-Croix, *Bulletin*, Vol. 3/4 (November/December 1924).

[49] "Committee on Equal Moral Standard and Against Traffic in Women" *Bulletin*, Vol.VII, no.9 (May 1929).

[50] "Ihe.Traffic in Women and Children" *Bulletin* Vol.VII, no.10 (June 1929).

[51] "Once More: The Publications of the League of Nations" *Bulletin*, Vol. XI, no.3 (November 1932).

[52] Ibid.

[53] "Traffic in Women and Children at the League of Nations" *Bulletin*, Vol. IX, no.9 (May 1933).

[54] *Jubilee Bulletin*, no.10 (June 1938).

[55] "In Memoriam. Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix. 1855-1939" *Bulletin*, Year XVII, no.7 (April 1939). It is of interest that the two women who had worked together for the ICW for so many years, and who provided the major thrust for much of the work died the same year within a month of each other.

[56] "President's Notes," *Bulletin,* Vol. IV, no.3 (November 1925).

[57] "Mme Avril de Sainte-Croix and her 80th Birthday" *Bulletin,* Year XIII, no.6 (February 1935).

[58] *Bulletin,* Year XV, no.3 (November 1936).

[59] *Bulletin* ,Year XVII, no.10 (July 1939).

[60] *Bulletin,* Vol.VI, no.4 (December 1927).

[61] Herbert Butterfield's *The Whig Interpretation of History* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1965).

[62] Louise A. Tilley and Patricia Guren eds., *Women, Politics and Change* (New York; Russel Sage Foundation, 1990), p.7.

[63] Dame Rachel Crowdy, "Modern Steps", p.3.

[64] Loiuse C. A.Van Eeghan "The reorganization of the Secretariat and the Social Work of the League of Nations" *Bulletin,* Year XVII, no.5 (February 1939).

CHAPTER 5

INTERNATIONALIZING A POLITIC OF THE BODY

So very little from each member would make the ICW a very Croesus, able to do great things for the world by the propaganda of its Gospel of the International and National practice of the Golden Rule in all relations of life. [1]

In 1922 the *Bulletin* embarked upon a serious program of education and propaganda as a result of

> Article 7, clause 3 of the Covenant of the League of Nations [which] may be called the Women's Charter under the League. It provides that 'all positions under and in connection with the League, including the Secretariat shall be open equally to men and women.'[2]

The development of the League of Nations (League hereafter) at the end of the first World War was a source of great optimism and excitement for the world in general, and, the ICW in particular. The concept of internationalism, not new to the ICW, was viewed with eager anticipation by the women leaders of the ICW as they recognized the opportunity for admittance to the world's forum and the arena of international politics.

> Inspired by promises of inclusion in this "great experiment" and heady with the assurances of "equity" written into the league Covenant, national organisations marshaled their resources to translate their aspirations into international co-ordination in order to have representatives on the various constituent bodies and committees at Geneva.[3]

And further:

> Women... saw such an organisation more in terms of a world parliament of peoples rather than a bureaucracy of governments and technocrats disproportionately representing men.[4]

ICW leaders were quick to engage diplomats and influential members to ensure that the

entry or inclusion promised was accessible. The ICW can, in many ways, be termed a forerunner to women's participation at the League. It enjoyed the prestige and influence gained because of the relationship it developed with the League. Mrs. Olgivie Gordon, who represented the National Council of Women in Canada, on a later committee for representation at the League, extolled the spirit of internationalism in Geneva, as "the new patriotism" which revealed itself "more equally and universally in women than in men, by virtue of the inborn protective instinct of motherhood in all women," thus reaffirming the maternal ideologies of protofeminists. [5]

This chapter will elucidate the deliberate and detailed educational agenda of the ICW regarding the development of participation by women's international organisations at the League. It will demonstrate the hope that women's organisations placed on the League as a venue to catapult women into the forefront of political decision-making in international affairs. This hope, based on Article VII of the Covenant, that stipulated the League was "equally open to men and women" was seen as a momentous opportunity and breakthrough for organisations like the ICW. Full and detailed reports on the meetings of the Assembly and the Committee on the Traffic of the League were printed in the *Bulletin* and presented as part of the non-formal educational agenda and consciousness-raising of the ICW.

The work of the League of Nations, or any analysis of the failure of the League, is beyond the scope of this study except and only as accounts of its work were reported in the Bulletin for educational and propaganda purposes on the Equal Moral Standard and Traffic in Women and Children.

THE ERA OF INTERNATIONALISM

Peace after the war offered hope and encouragement for fresh beginnings. The twenties represented hope for reconstruction and renewed prosperity. The League would provide the experimental vehicle through which all of this would be achieved. The League presented the first opportunity for women's groups and men's, States and Governments, to get together under the banner of internationalism. The enthusiasm for the experiment of internationalism was anticipative. Indeed many have hailed the twenties as the "era of internationalism." We must remember however, that some women's organizations, like the ICW, the IAW, the YWCA, to name but a few, had come to the idea of internationalism at a much earlier date: certainly by 1915 when the Hague hosted the International Congress of Women which advocated a Society of Nations. Mrs Ogilvie Gordon, in her presidential address at the Annual Meeting of the National Council of Women of Great Britain and Ireland on June 25th 1919, proclaimed that

> Women have been among the first to organise themselves upon International Lines. They have long proclaimed Internationalism as the only sure foundation for the betterment of social conditions, the eradication of social sores, and the elevation of national standards of justice and morality. The formation of the International Council of Women in 1888, was at the time a remarkable step in advance and a great augury for the future.[6]

The League was an idea that was remarkable in human history—we cannot, from our perspective, understand what it meant to women around the world. Women's organizations were already imbued with the ideals of internationalism and the hope that they would now have access to a forum in the world's foremost political body fueled

their enthusiasms. It is crucial to the understanding of the ICW during the 1920s and 1930s to realize that the women leaders, in a very deliberate fashion, seized the opportunity to participate at this level and in this process and worked to make it happen. The process of involvement was driven by this vanguard of women, who did not see the League model as "patriarchical" despite its being engineered by male initiatives and organizational models, but did demand that they be included in the experiments. Such inclusion, alone, made for a significantly different model quite apart from the initial experiment itself. The League was the symbol of all hope—for everyone, but for women's international organizations in particular, "who viewed it as a unique opportunity for the advancement of the status of women." [7] Backing by the prestige of the League would serve to strengthen and to validate to the world the role of the international women's voluntary organizations.

> I would like to draw the attention of National Councils to the necessity of taking adequate steps, in their own countries, in order to secure the application of the decisions adopted at Geneva....We must not forget that the more actively we co-operate with the League of Nations in their work for the protection of women and children and against the traffic in women the greater will be the support which we ourselves derive from its activity.[8]

Effective contact between the League and the ICW began at the Paris Peace Conference in 1919. Lady Aberdeen wrote to President Woodrow Wilson, Chairman of the League Committee, and requested an audience for a delegation to present women's views on the Covenant for the League that was being drafted.[9] It is hard to believe that the 1919 Sex Disqualification (Removal) Act in England ostensibly prohibiting or disqualifying a person from the exercise of any public function or appointment because

of sex or marital status did not play a hand in either the request for or the acceptance of an audience with the League. The Act appeared to fulfill the feminist demand that women be granted equal access to political and professional opportunities. This would prove a valuable bargaining tool for the women who requested the audience. If the League was to truly represent a new concept of internationalism, then all of the changes in the status of women should be acknowledged and recognized.

The request was granted and a representation of women's organizations led by Lady Aberdeen met with a Plenary Session of the Committee. Six recommendations were presented to this body. The two that are of most interest to this study are the inclusion of

1. The eligibility of women to occupy posts in all bodies of the League.
2. Nations entering the League were to agree to suppress traffic in women and children and licensed houses by establishing an Advisory Committee of the League on Traffic in Women and Children.[10]

These recommendations supported the overt feminist agenda of the ICW and its determination to continue the work for the eradication of the Traffic that had been started in 1904. As a result of this meeting one of the articles of the newly constituted League stated that the League had been entrusted in Article 23 (c) of its Covenant "with the general supervision for the execution of agreements with regard to the traffic in women and children and the traffic in opium and other dangerous drugs."[11]

There had been no consideration included in the deliberation and formation of the League for representation from private international organizations such as the ICW. Nor was there any plan to attempt to recruit public opinion or participation except by

means of regular reporting through the world press. After the delegation from women's organizations, however, a decision was made by resolution of Council on January 14th, 1922 to include representatives (called assessors) on Advisory Committees of the Assembly, especially in the field of social welfare.[12] The field of social welfare was an area which was regarded as the natural extension of women's nurturing abilities and interests which was in keeping with the observations made in the opening chapter. These observations discuss social feminism as a form of civic consciousness and practical politics which brought the public and private spheres together in an amalgam which did not threaten the complementary gender roles that were apparent in the previous century. Where better to "spring clean the nooks and crannies of the world"[13] but in the most dramatic international household itself– the League at Geneva? This work did not disrupt the sexual division of labor while operating in a male dominated political arena. Women were initially included on another committee in keeping with this politic– The Child Welfare Committee. It was of symbolic importance that the Social Section including both the Traffic and Child Welfare Committees was headed by the only female Chief at the League, Dame Rachel Crowdy.

Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix, President of the French National Council of Women and Vice-President of the ICW, was appointed as the accredited representative assessor of the major women's organizations on the Fifth Committee: the League Committee for the Prevention of Traffic in Women and Children. This Committee reported to the Assembly of the League. The *Bulletin* informed its readers:

> The recently appointed Advisory Committee for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children, met in Geneva on June 28th.
> This Committee consists of nine of Government representatives. We are glad to note that two Governments, Denmark and Uruguay, have appointed women, Dr. Estried Hein and Dr. Paulina Luisi respectively to act as their representatives.[14]
> In addition there are five assessors, representing different international organizations i.e.
> Miss Baker (International Office for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children)
> Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix (International Women's Organizations)
> Madame la Baronne de Montenach (International Roman-Catholic Association for the Protection of Young Girls)
> Mrs. [sic] S. Cohen (Jewish Association for the Protection of Young Girls)*[4]
> Madame Studer-Steinhauslin (Federation of Girls' Friendly Societies). [15]

It is interesting to note that at the first Conference called by the League in 1921 to discuss the Traffic the tone and stage was set for the work that was to be accomplished.[16] Missing however was the emotional rhetoric that had been previously employed when discussing the Traffic. It was decided to replace the term "White Slavery" with something more encompassing, "Traffic in Women and Children."This change of name reflected a government decision to make the studies and programs more bureaucratized. This is of note in view of the fact that the ICW had already at the 1909 Quinquennial Meeting held in Toronto, Canada, passed a motion to change the name of the ICW White Slave Traffic and Equal Moral Standard Committee to the Committee for Equal Moral Standard and Traffic in Women.[17] Officially changing the name to eliminate "White Slavery" is not to say that the term disappeared completely at this point for, as we see, an article appeared in the *Bulletin* in 1927 under the heading "Argentine White Slave Traffic." This article noted *The Times* as reporting that, "as a result of the disclosures

---

4 *This was a printing error. In fact Sol Cohen was the only male assessor on the committee.

made recently at Geneva regarding the White Slave Traffic, the Argentine President, Dr. de Alvear, has ordered a strict watch to be kept on the ports."[18] It was also present in the heading of a report from the National Council of Greece, "War on the White Slave Traffic."[19] Mrs Craig of the National Council of South Africa in her September 1928 report maintained that "the White Slave Traffic does not exist in South Africa."[20] The French National Council reported, in May 1929, that organisations had vied for the protection of young girls in their fight against prostitution and "the white slave traffic."[21] What the general move towards neutralizing the term does suggest however, is that there was a shift in attitude and response to the topic. The term "White Slave" is absent in a great deal of the dialogue of the ICW found in the *Bulletin*-- replaced by the emotionally and rhetorically more neutral term "Traffic in Women." By way of explanation we can see three possible rationalizations for this shift in response: the League and the organisations such as the ICW, conscious of the make-up of their respective international memberships, might strive towards a more racially inclusive and neutral term: a term that would include women and children of all races, colours and creeds.[22]

> The I.C.W. takes no part in religious or political controversies which affect the relations of different countries and sew disunion. Our mission is to create the atmosphere of sympathy and good-will towards all, to foster trust and confidence between nations, and between individuals, and to find in common work for great causes the secret of world peace, prosperity and happiness.[23]

A second conclusion might be that the rhetoric of the white slave trade was changing, e.g. in 1909 the American "Vigilance Association" as well as the ICW had already changed the name to "Traffic in Women."[24] This indicated perhaps that emotionalism and myth-making was waning within the realm of public debate. The interruption caused

by the war had presented perhaps, an opportunity to revise and revisit the subject on a less emotional level. Or, we might see that the ICW wished by way of a neutral language to consider the facts without the encompassing emotion, thereby educating its membership concerning the real, not perceived or emotionally charged, issues. The stereotypical vulgarity of public discourse was absent in most of the reporting in the ICW. As a result the ICW did not parade myth as propaganda. It chose instead to deal with the factual matter of prostitution which could be empirically studied. The third reason of course was that the male-ethos and the male dominated approach to problem-solving exerted a more 'objective' and empirical methodology in keeping with the League's image as a rational model of decision and influence making.

Reports of the League were full of examples that could be used for educational purposes through the pages of the *Bulletin*.[25] The ICW was able, through the reports of the League, to compile general information from specific national data bases. Because the League requested annual reports regarding the Traffic from participating countries, organizations like the ICW, could universalize the arguments they presented to their memberships.[26] These reports afforded women's organisations, and their international memberships, some of the most accurate information and statistics available for educating their members. "Such documentation, utterly reliable as to the facts on which it is based and of the highest interest, is published every year, at a very low cost."[27]

> If our members order and study this most enlightening documentation they will not only be better able to follow and to understand the doings of the Fifth Committee, but the knowledge thus gained cannot fail to give fresh impetus to their desire to support, and to co-operate in, its work.[28]

The method for accumulating these reports and statistics was established by the 1904 Paris Conference for the Suppression of the White Slave Trade which stipulated that each country signing the agreement would establish a central Authority concerned with co-ordination of information on the activity of the Traffic in each respective country. The work started by this Conference was continued by the League after the war. This reporting system was reactivated after 1919 and continued until the outbreak of the second world war. Most countries co-operated and submitted annual reports on prostitution to the League which in turn, acted as a major co-ordinator of statistics for the Traffic. Coupled with this was the information collection process employed by the Committee itself. The Advisory Committee sent out, on an annual basis, questionnaires to research specific areas within the Traffic, e.g. the May 1928 *Bulletin* refers in its Report from the League to two questionnaires, one concerning the employment of women abroad, the other a questionnaire that had been sent to the affiliated women's organisations on the questions of the closing of licensed houses, the effect of low wages on prostitution, and the suppression of obscene publications.[29] The results of these questionnaires would provide updated and current statistics to be circulated not only to the ICW and its members but to all of the international women's organisations.

The work of the 1920s and 1930s for the League with regard to the Traffic was twofold. The primary work consisted of the assignment and completion of two studies on the question of the international Traffic, its extent and its complexion. The secondary work involved the arrangement of International Conventions to discuss and ratify the decisions made by the League concerning the Traffic. Naturally, the primary work was

the more advertised and invoked the most attention both from the press, from women's voluntary organizations, and the ICW. The *Bulletin* carried reports, summations and propaganda as well as information and specific educative materials resulting from the studies.

THE STUDIES

The first study commissioned by the League was a two volume report, financed by the American Bureau of Social Hygiene of the Rockefeller Foundation and commenced in 1924.[30] It was scheduled as a three-year project. [31] The *Bulletin* did not report much of any substance concerning the study until the results of the report were announced in 1927. It did not even report the names of the Body of Experts elected by the League which included at least one ICW member.[32] However, by the time that the report was ready to be presented to the League interest was high, both in the press and among the members of the ICW.

The April edition of the *Bulletin* in 1927 reported to the membership that the most striking report at the 44th Session of the League was that of the Special Body of Experts on the Traffic in Women. It noted that much had already been written and said in the press. The *Bulletin* observed that the League had released only Part I of the report to the public which partly revealed "the terrible conditions in which the traffic is conducted, and public opinion strongly claims the publication of the second volume, which is not yet "released" by the League, but from which large quotations are apparently

being issued unofficially from Geneva." The *Bulletin* continued in a slightly hysterical tenor thereby declaring its position on behalf of the class it represented and the effects of the education and propaganda of the social purity movement.

> There is perhaps no other problem which more imperially [sic] needs to be dealt with internationally, and it is to be hoped that the League of Nations will not miss its chance of doing away with the veil of silence and secrecy which up to now has allowed the hideous traffic to prosper.[33]

What the *Bulletin* failed to report to its membership at this point, in spite of Sainte-Croix's representation on the Committee of the League, was the fact that the enquiry found that "most of the women now taken abroad were prostitutes in their own country;"[34] in other words career prostitutes and not young women or children who had been stolen or kidnaped. Instead, the rhetoric of the *Bulletin* adhered to the gendered, class sentiments and propaganda common at the time in the press and in other women's voluntary organizations that had been carefully constructed by the social purity movement.

The June *Bulletin* reported to its members that the League Committee for the Traffic met from April 25th to April 30th 1927 to study and adopt recommendations made by the Body of Experts. These recommendations concerning the moral protection of under-aged music-hall and similar artists, on tour abroad; the protection of women against traffickers, the influence of low salaries in certain areas of employment, and the employment of women police were outlined.[35] It is of note that the official report recognized the link between poverty and prostitution. This link had been acknowledged by many individuals and groups over the past half century but was often disregarded in

favor of the more "morally charged" debate linking prostitution to evil and /or sin. This, in turn, was motivated by the attempts of moral mothers to achieve access to participation and political power. The fact that this connection was publicly voiced by an official Report of an Expert Body under the auspices of the League forced all bodies, be it Government, Church or voluntary women's organizations like the ICW, to re-evaluate the case of prostitution. All were made aware that prostitution, or the selling of bodies, was not so much a provocative or wilful act but, in many cases, a reaction to poverty, a commodity to be traded.

There appears to have been some controversy surrounding the second part of the report. According to the *Bulletin* the results of Part II were leaked to the popular press. This was perhaps another manifestation of the unsatiable appetite of the general public for scandal, and the *Bulletin* for propaganda, as Part II included the reports of the local enquiries of the twenty eight participating countries. This would presumably hold more interest for general readers than the results of Part I which contained reports on such topics as the character of the traffic, the extent of the traffic, the demand for foreign women, sources of supply, traffickers and their associates, routes and methods of conducting traffic, measures taken to prevent traffic, growth of public opinion and the conclusions reached by the Committee.

By December of 1927 the Special Body of Experts was, according to the *Bulletin*, ready, after consulting with the various Governments and making the amendments it considered necessary, to submit to the Council of the League, its final Report. This report, readers were told, contained recommendations that:

- all governments abolish the system of licensed houses
- active propaganda be undertaken to have all Governments ratify the International Conventions
- a special study be undertaken for the protection of artists engaged in tours abroad in music halls and similar establishments
- severe control be established over the conditions in which girls under 18 are allowed to go to foreign lands
- severe measures be taken against proxenetes and souteneurs
- the effects on low wages on prostitution be examined
- reforms be made to the legal age of marriage
- the enquiry into the service of women police be continued
  ratification of the International Convention for the Repression of Immoral Publications be completed by all States Members.[36]

A footnote to this report states that "as we go to press, we see from the daily papers that the Council authorized the publication of Part II of the Report." What was not made clear in the reports of the *Bulletin* was the reason for the delay of the publication of Part II of the Report. The *Bulletin* failed to report to its membership that the Body of Experts realized that Part II of their report contained some extremely sensitive specific national information and statistics. The Body of Experts wished to send Part II to the various Governments in advance in order to allow them to see the results before they were released to the press. This would give those Governments a chance to respond to the report and to provide relevant feedback which would be attached to the Report. The Council was waiting for these observations and reactions before making the material public.[37] As is common with many such volatile documents much speculation and interest is created thereby heightening the impact of the release. Because of the interest surrounding the report one feasible explanation for this oversight on the part of the *Bulletin* could have been the fact that the press had already alerted the public to this

delay and reporting it would have been redundant. Or, it could have been a matter of the author of the articles (restricted by publication space) engaging in that slight of history called "objectivity" selected only the information that she deemed pertinent.

The May issue of the *Bulletin* in 1928 reported on the second part of the report of the expert committee that was published in December 1927. Part II of the report from the Expert Body advised a continuation and extension of the enquiry (which had been conducted in 28 countries) to include the Far East or the Asiatic countries.[38] Some on the Committee to the Assembly had felt that they were ill-equipped to express an opinion as to the feasibility of extending the enquiry until they had thoroughly examined Part II of the Report.[39] Consequently, the Expert Body was invited by the Council of the League to express its opinion as to whether the enquiry should be extended to further countries. The Expert Body expressed itself in favor of extending the work to include Asiatic countries.

The October 1928 *Bulletin* reported Oliver Bell of the Ninth Assembly of the League presenting a summary of the work done by the Committee on the Traffic. He remarked that in the Resolution passed by the Assembly three things were noticeable:

> First, a definite stand has been taken against the system of licensed houses. They are the root of the traffic and must be abolished. Secondly, far more stringent punishments must be inflicted on the "souteneurs," those who live on the proceeds of the vice of others. Lastly, all countries are recommended to set up a women's police force.[40]

Bell also commented on the recommendation to extend the work of the enquiry into the Far East. He noted that this would be an extremely difficult matter for prostitution was bound up with age-old tradition and customs. Moreover, he stated," it is

connected with another connection in which the League is interested–slavery."[41]

In May of 1930 the Council of the League approved the extension of the enquiry to the Far East, which was carried out, once again, with the help of a gift of $125,000 from the Social Hygiene Bureau of the Rockefeller Foundation. This time the *Bulletin* reported more fully on the composite of the new Committee which consisted of three traveling commissioners one woman, a Swedish physician, Dr. Alma Sundquist, an American lawyer and Director of the Legal Section of the American Association for Social Hygiene, Mr. Bascomb Johnson, who was later appointed in a personal capacity as an accessor on the League Traffic Committee, and M. Karol Pindor from Poland, Counsellor of Legation. The new study, *Bulletin* readers were told would extend over a period of one and one half years[42]

The April edition of the *Bulletin* in 1933 reported that the Commission of Inquiry into the Traffic in the East presented its final report to the Council of the League, and thus completed the process of investigation that was commenced in April 1923. The Commission left Marseilles in October, 1930 and returned in March 1932, having visited Siam, Indo-China, China, Japan, the Straits Settlement, Persia, Iraq, and Palestine. The article in this *Bulletin* observed that the Commission had not been able to make the personal contacts with members of the underworld that it did in the earlier investigation. The reason being, it suggested, diversity of language and customs would make this task difficult if not impossible.

The most significant item to come out of the second Report and the first item to be considered by the Traffic was the proposal to organise a Conference of the Central

Authorities of the Eastern Countries. This recommendation was made as a means of securing closer co-operation and a wider exchange of information among the authorities responsible in Eastern countries for the measures taken to prevent the Traffic. Russian women in China, driven to prostitution because of political disruption were a case in point and a good example of the steps involved presenting the problem at the League and through its propaganda channels the public at large. The *Bulletin* it might be argued formed a part of this propaganda machinery by alerting a wide female audience–readers, members of the ICW who would in turn inform others to the problem. This case demonstrates a clear understanding of the elements that combined in order for many women to prostitute themselves.

> Owing to the Bolshevist Revolution many of the Russians residing in Manchuria have become exiles and have lost their normal source of income, while many of their patriots [sic] have poured into China from Russian Siberia as refugees. Both impoverished residents and refugees being entirely destitute, it has been the fate of many of the young women among them to sink into prostitution...[43]

The resolution of the Traffic Committee was reported in the *Bulletin*, June 1935. It requested that the results of the enquiry be placed before the Assembly and that in order to prevent further victims from engaging in prostitution (and to frustrate the efforts of traffickers) funds were to be increased from public coffers. This same issue reported that the Traffic Committee was to instruct the Secretariat of the League to designate a time and venue for a Conference on the subject to be held in the East.

Consequently, the Sixteenth Assembly of the League included the subject on the agenda and encouraged international women's organisations to renew and combine their respective efforts in order to assist these women. The League declined to allocate monies

for new endeavors. Instead it authorized the Secretary-General to appoint a female agent to the Far East, either as a resident or with the ability to travel so as to co-ordinate efforts to help and co-ordinate efforts and assist women refugees–"provided, however, that no part of the cost was to fall on the League."[44] We can speculate as to the reasons for this. With issues of economic depression and serious threats to peace looming large, the League may have preferred to place its limited funds on issues that were viewed as more internationally pressing, at least to the community at large. In addition, there had always been "Some people...of the opinion that the League of Nations ought not to deal with social and humanitarian questions..." but should leave such matters up to the private institutions.[45] Consequently, the *Bulletin* responded to this authorization on behalf of women's organisations by appealing once again to the American Social Hygiene Association for approximately £1000.00 per year for two years to cover the agent's expenses. The voluntary organisations were to raise funds over and above this sum.

The Assembly also agreed that the Far East Conference should take place early in 1937 at Bandoeng, Java. ICW members were informed that the agenda would include questions such as the closer co-operation between Central Authorities and the East; migration, as it pertained to women and children; closer collaboration between authorities and private organizations; the employment of women officials; the abolition of licensed houses or tolerated brothels in the East; and, finally, the plight of Russian refugees who had become, or were in the danger of becoming prostitutes.[46]

In the May 1937 *Bulletin* we read that nine Governments sent representatives to Java: the United Kingdom, China, France, India, Japan, the Netherlands, Portugal, Siam,

and Straits Settlements. The United States sent an observer along with representatives from voluntary organisations such as the International Missionary Council, the Salvation Army, the Pan-Pacific Women's Association, the World Alliance of Young Women's Christian Associations, and the *Sacred Congregation de Propaganda fide*. This conference completed the League's work with the Traffic.

INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS

One of the initial tasks of the League was to ratify the agreement of 1904 and the Convention of 1910 discussed earlier.[47] Years before League involvement these had been signed by thirteen states, (Austria-Hungary, Belgium, Brazil, Denmark, France, Germany, Great Britain, Italy, the Netherlands, Portugal, Russia, Spain and Sweden). Dame Rachel Crowdy called an International Conference in June of 1921. The *Bulletin* described this event as the ratification of the work previously done by other government and volunteer agencies. The subsequent 1921 Convention was based on the final action of the Conference. It drew up a new Convention which, in the course of less than one year, was signed by 33 states. This was proof of the enthusiasm with which the concept of the League was accepted. Nations were anxious and excited about proceeding with the philosophy of international co-operation and readily agreed to extend themselves in the interest of internationalism.

The results of these discussions included an agreement to extradite those accused or convicted of procuring prostitutes, raised the age of protection from 20 to 21 years, and to monitor and supervise the licensing of employment agencies for those seeking employment overseas. As a result of this Conference, the December 1922 issue of the

Bulletin also reported the establishment of a permanent Advisory Committee to meet once a year with Dame Rachel Crowdy as its secretary. This pleased women's groups as Crowdy was the only appointed women official of the League. Moreover, the *Bulletin* was delegated to report that Mme Avril de Sainte-Croix represented the ICW and the other "big Women Organisations" on this Committee. [48] Without making much ado about these representations the ICW propaganda style was quietly pointing to the role of women at the League and how these women were in fact representing, by their presence and affiliations with women's organisations, the female voice in world affairs. These women represented the millions of female members around the world.

The ICW organ around this time refers to the "big Women's Organisations"–a term which appears consistent with the League correspondence and refers to the "big" international organisations as distinct from the less important (in League terms) national organisations.[49] This suggests that a conscious order of representation, relevance, and prestige, within a hierarchy of women's voluntarism existed. This hierarchy can be somewhat puzzling as women's volunteer organisations were often class based–therefore assumed prestige was accorded to them sometimes based on size but more often on membership, influence and patronage. A hierarchy within the realm of women's voluntary organizations emerged once they gained access to the world body. When Beverly Lynn Boutilier argues that the Council of Women was non-hierarchical we must remain skeptical that early feminism adopted the same postures as a later feminism.[50] While stressing co-operation, and while democratizing their governance and participation women's organisations, once they became involved at the League, were no less

hierarchically structured than the usual sociology of organisations dictates. Through the vehicle of the League women leaders of these "big Women's Organisations" were achieving access to committees and influence previously denied them, thus emphasizing hierarchical directions. Monsieur Regnault, the French representative to the Committee on the Traffic, explained its work as

> A matter which is negotiated between different countries in an official conference, after verification of credentials and after much serious discussion, must be regarded as being of a diplomatic nature. I therefore declare that the Conference and the question of the Traffic in Women are diplomatic in the highest degree.[51]

As a result of this association "League women" foresaw opportunities for their voluntarism translating into paid positions and professions which represented a shift in the understanding of feminism itself. Although these transitions from a social feminism to an equal rights feminism were more visible in other women's organizations e.g., the IAW, shifts were occurring even in the conservative ICW. The League, in fact, was to become an arena where these shifts would be worked out quite dramatically as women vied for positions of power. Moreover, the ICW and the WYWCA who were part of the Women's Consultative Committee at the League, were opposed by their more radical sisters because of their conservative views on Protective Labour Legislation. At this point social feminism faltered under the rising star of equity feminism as the hierarchy among the "big Women's Organisations" reorganized itself. The League became a crucible of feminist debate.[52]

> Thus the League was a site in which the tensions between panmaternalism and progressivism, voluntarism and professionalism coalesced: in short, a site where women's traditional sphere was transformed and reinterpreted, demonstrating the

> non-permeability of the metaphor of 'separate spheres' as a gender construction that accommodated and perpetuated the public and private domains, men and women's work. The League provides us with a case-study in the dissolution of maternalist ideology and its inadequacy as a basis for international co-operation.[53]

After the Body of Experts submitted Part I of their findings to the Fifth Committee, interest reached its peak but unanimous ratification of the Conventions had not yet been achieved. The *Bulletin,* in its May 1928 edition, reported that on March 17th the Committee closed its session and adopted a report to be submitted to the Council of the League at the next meeting which drew attention to the fact that a good many of the member Governments have not yet signed the Conventions on the Traffic. The ICW considered this lessened the efficacy of the world body in achieving reform. It was proposed that a letter be sent to the abstaining Governments requesting ratification.

At the same time the Traffic Committee discussed the advisability of convening a new international conference to deal with the suppression of obscene publications which has been a growing concern. The resulting fourth International Convention was held in conjunction with the Fourteenth Assembly of the League on October 11th 1933. However, it was overshadowed and obscured by several events: the earlier report of the Enquiry into Traffic in Women and Children in the East, the Economic Conference that had recently convened in London and the forthcoming Disarmament Conference which captured the energies and passions of many women's organisations quite apart from the single issue quasi-peaceful ones such as the Women's League for Peace and Freedom. The *Bulletin* concentrated much of its work throughout this period on matters relating to peace and disarmament. ICW representatives attended the Peace Conference. Coupled with this

was the anxiety and apprehension concerning Germany withdrawing from the League on October 14th, just four days after the commencement of the Fourteenth Assembly. The fabric of the League was rapidly unraveling as the world plummeted towards the pandemonium of the second World War. "We should also like to add that in this hour when the whole world is stricken with fear it is more than ever necessary that women shall represent–actively and energetically–the will for peace."[54]

Rarely distracted from her purpose even as the ICW was torn between normal business and threats of war, Sainte-Croix noted the importance of the additional article in the new Convention.

> Whoever, in order to gratify the passions of another person, has procured, enticed or led away, even with her consent, a woman or girl of full age, for immoral purposes, to be carried out in another country, shall be punished, notwithstanding that the various Acts constituting the offence may have been committed in different countries.
> Attempted offences, and, within the legal limits, Acts preparatory to the offences in question, shall also be punishable.[55]

This fourth Convention had added an ambitious and impossible amendment which would now include all women or girls who were involved in prostitution outside the boundaries of their own countries. The *Bulletin* saw it as the major achievement that it was ratified by 18 signatories and seized the opportunity to educate its membership by use of role models such as Mme Isabelle de Palencia who was officially authorized to sign on behalf of Spain. "It was the first time that a woman has been called upon to sign a diplomatic convention."[56]

In May of the following year (1934) the *Bulletin* carried reports supporting the changes from the previous year. Sainte-Croix thanked her correspondents urging their

respective governments to ratify the resolutions passed at Geneva.[57] The *Bulletin,* in short, politicized its members and readers and through education, propaganda, and the work of the Traffic Committee, it continued incrementally so that by 1936 it proposed a major document recounting its history and purpose which was made available from the Information Section of the League.

However, history overtook any major breakthroughs due to the war and the proposed conference for 1940 did not take place.[58] At this point the relationship between the Traffic Committee and the ICW came to a halt. The last major report was placed in the 1937 issue of the *Bulletin* informing members that the Committees of Child Welfare and the Combat of the Traffic in Women would be restructured and combined under the one name which would be the Advisory Committee on Social Questions.[59] This combination was a response to the social and economic problems of the day. Massive economic depression, war in China, civil-war in Spain, pre- occupation with disarmament and the impinging threat of war, coupled with the realization of the failure in the experiment that was the League created an environment of concern in which the political storms, sabre rattling and the great world problems took precedence over women's concerns and the concerns of the Traffic in Women and Children. Economics demanded re-structuring and expeditious restraint within the League. The restructuring of these Committees marks a point of denouement for the Committee on the Traffic as the world geared up to face another war. More crucially, as these committees were restructured female voluntary assessors were squeezed out and replaced by male government representatives which augmented the potential for increasing amounts of

bureaucratization at the League.[60]

It should be noted that before the outbreak of World War II, 44 member States had ratified the Convention of 1904, 43 States had ratified the Convention of 1910 and 23 States had ratified the Convention of 1933 as a result of the work of the League.[61]

At this point it is of interest to consider the success of women's organizations at the international level. Curiously, it was easier to get something passed or ratified at this level than at the national or local level, as national or local governments are often reluctant to alter constitutions and/or national laws. This could be explained by the fact that international meetings are mostly sponsored and attended by like-minded individuals. Much of the politicking that occurs at international conventions is merely the converted convincing the converted. Once a delegate returns "home" and is confronted with divergent or opposing viewpoints it requires tremendous political will, participation and agitation at the local or national level to achieve change. A clear contemporary illustration of this point is the international commitment to women's equality during the United Nations Decade for Women, 1976-1985. During this time two significant international agreements were signed by governments around the world: the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)–ratified by 151 countries by 1996 and the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women (FLS), adopted by consensus by 159 states in 1985. The recent Beijing Conference in 1995 reviewed and appraised the FLS and presented a Platform for Action for the years 1995-2000 based on the two previous Conventions.[62] Seven critical areas were presented 1) human rights including violence against women; 2) poverty; 3) the

economy and sustainable development; 4) employment; 5) public life; 6) statistical systems and data bases; 7) intra-and inter-regional co-operation. The fact that the Platform presented at Beijing contains many of the same elements presented in both CEDAW and FLS demonstrates the lack of success these previous Conventions have experienced. The International Labour Organisation (ILO) provides us with a further example. The Equal Renumeration Convention received 109 ratifications by 1990 and the Convention on Discrimination in Employment and Occupation the same number.[63] And how successful have they been? The United Nations itself reports only 36.8 percent of the professional-level Secretariat posts occupied by women; only 22 percent of higher level positions are occupied by women. At the Under-Secretaries-General positions, the ratio of women to men (as of March 31, 1998) is 2:22 and in the case of Assistant Secretaries-General 3:11. So even in the foremost body in the world, where international decrees for equality and harmony are easily achieved, this has not been actualized.[64]

These examples demonstrate what is being argued throughout this study–that progress is difficult. Without the experience of contemporary women's organisations the early twentieth-century women's organisations understood that achievement at the international level was easier than at the local level where they would have been held up to ridicule by a less tolerant population–an ironical paradox in some ways. Early attempts that made precisely the same claims for women, and succeeded no more, make for interesting parallels and remind contemporary feminists about their history. These attempts further emphasize that much of what is being done and argued today sadly is not new and has, in fact, been done before.

The memoriam printed in the April 1939 edition of the *Bulletin* carrying the news of the death of Sainte-Croix marked the end of the chapter for the ICW's input into the Traffic in Women and Children at the League during the inter-war years.

EDUCATION AND PROPAGANDA

What then was the summation of the education and propaganda affected by the *Bulletin* regarding the work on the Traffic carried out at the League? Influencing governments and educating members to do so are inter-linked objectives in woman's organisations. Did the campaign to educate women in political matters allow them the access to decision making, influence, or even entry into the League that they had believed possible? The ICW, and other similar big Women's Organisations placed a wager on the League from its beginning: did such a wager pay off, and if so, to what extent?

The interfacing of politics, education and propaganda becomes an intricate issue. If we accept the concept of propaganda as an organized method or scheme for spreading a belief or concept, or even if we are more comfortable with Sidney Tarrow's concept of "communities of print," then the ICW's *Bulletin* was certainly an effective tool. And if non-formal education is, as outlined in chapter one, a process to satisfy and develop intellectual quests, and to contribute positively to the improvement of society–what then of education? Can it be separated from propaganda? In this instance we understand that where propaganda has to do with persuasion, education deals with the development of the

human being to its fullest potential.[65] However, the separation may be viewed as difficult and arbitrary as we shall see as we explore the question further.

The *Bulletin* and its unrelenting feminist agenda carried the message of hope for greater female representation at the international table and constantly reminded its members of the value of the work they, as women, were achieving. It published their successes, encouraged their efforts, and legitimized their commitment. If we accept this as propaganda can the processes that lead to this be separated from education? Does the imparting of the specific knowledge including names and nature of the achievements of ICW members and associated women acting on behalf of other women, constitute an educational component that can be teased away from the process we name as propaganda or is it included in the process?

Throughout the two decades of this study the ICW basked in the title "Mother of the League." This title was made in reference to the ICW by three different statesmen–General Smuts of South Africa, Prime Minister Edward Benes of Czechoslovakia and British Foreign Minister Sir John Simon. "Naturally, the ICW felt strongly reinforced" to have been recognized publicly by three different, prominent men who were involved with and representative of the League and its work[66] It is hard to imagine the effect of such positive acclaim. ICW members were propagandized by such an elevated benediction which was reinforced whenever Lady Aberdeen, as ICW president, referred to and used this title in her column in the *Bulletin* reminding members that ICW " ideals and those of the League bear so close a resemblance." [67] As noted earlier, the ICW was in part responsible for the drafting of certain sections in the

Covenant of the League. The fact that women would be equal representatives in all positions: appointed on the same terms as men was one such section. Hence, the title it received as "mother" gave members a perception of inclusion and status at the League that did not translate into reality. Although this was largely propaganda–more rhetoric than reality–nonetheless, it did educate women into the possibilities of having equal representation.

During the twenties and thirties the *Bulletin* conducted a vigorous campaign which was aimed at the consciousness raising of its women members. It encouraged them to seek the equal representation and access to these decision making bodies to which they were theoretically entitled. From the very first issues of the *Bulletin* a heavy agenda was maintained to encourage women's organisations to lobby their Governments to increase women's representation on the international delegations to the League Assembly and Committee meetings. The *Bulletin* gave suggestions of how and why this might be done. Henni Forchhammer reported on the number of women present at the Third Assembly of the League. The number of women delegates, she reported, had increased to six: Norway, Sweden, Denmark and Roumania sent the same women as on previous years but Australia and Great Britain added women to their delegations. Professor Christine Bonnevie, Fru Anna Wicksell, Henni Forchhammer, Helene Vacarescu, Mrs. Coombe-Tennant and Mrs Margaret Dale were the six who attended the Third Assembly.*[5] It was reported in the same issue that Mrs. Coombe-Tennant gave a speech appealing to those nations that had

---

5 *Whenever possible I denote marital status or single status as such distinctions have become important in feminist historiography, quite apart from the fact that married women insisted on naming themselves in this way.

not included women in their delegation for two reasons: to make the Assembly more representative and to raise the interest level of women in the work of the League.[68] This speech provided an example to other members and demonstrated the practical means whereby members might approach governments to seek delegation. Such practical advice was invaluable for women socialized in voluntarism at the local level but neophytes in the formal political process of larger government bodies.

Throughout the twenties the *Bulletin* faithfully tracked and published the names of the women who were involved in delegations or advisory positions at the League. It was diligent in assuring that its members were aware of the names of women who were attending the meetings on their behalf, who they represented and where they came from. It often carried photographs of women who were involved with the proceedings. By way of example the December 1933 issue published photographs of Mme Malaterre-Sellier who wrote the report on the Fourteenth Assembly for the *Bulletin*, in the absence of Sainte-Croix, Miss Horsburgh, a member of the British delegation, and Mme Isabelle de Palencia from Spain. This visual record imprinted images of actual people thereby personalizing an otherwise distant connection and built up a network among the women who were actively involved in the work of the Traffic. This network gave women a sense of agency as they were then able to access it. Mineke Bosch's *Politics and Friendship* (1990) elaborates this process of networking, personalism, and intimacy that grew between the women who shared a common vision. She refers to the correspondence, social gatherings and hospitality among the women of the IAW and between the women's organisations that were connected to the League itself. No such study has been done to

this point of the ICW in the same way as for the IAW but there is no doubt in supposing it could not be replicated.

In order to establish a woman's network of role models, the ICW was fast to record the highlights of women's achievements during the two decades. Members were familiarized with the names, faces and acomplishments of those who were making headway in the political world of the League. Lists of representatives and delegates were printed, details and highlights of accomplishments were recorded. Dame Rachel Crowdy, for example, was Head of the Social Section of the League Secretariat; Henni Forchhammer was the first woman to deliver a speech at the Forum of the League. It was in response to her appeal that a Commission was set up to seek out women and children who had been deported from their homes in Armenia to Turkish harems in Mesopotamia.[69] However, despite efforts by women's organisations and the ICW, the attempts to move women into the visible and powerful positions was largely unsuccessful. The October 1937 *Bulletin* noted that twelve women delegates were appointed to the Assembly that year, two of them being full delegates. Five women experts brought the number of women participating up to 17. But 36 countries sent no woman either as delegate or as expert, Denmark having two for part of the time. These are not numbers that would reflect a resounding success for feminist politics.[70]

As part of its propaganda schedule the ICW rented space each year in Geneva during the period of the sessions of the Assembly of the League. This established its presence. Sessions were held each September. The *Bulletin* advertised the event, dates and address of its headquarters to encourage its members to attend. During the sessions of

the League, the ICW, and its women leaders hosted member delegates and made available office space for meetings or entertainments. At the same time it made available entrance tickets to any of its members who required, or were interested, in sitting in on the Sessions as well as providing information on women's, or general activities, or activities in Geneva during the sessions. Moreover, League committee meetings took place in Geneva in May with the ICW coinciding its Standing Committee meetings. In April 1935 it was reported that the Social Section of the League would reserve special seats for those members of the ICW who wished to attend the session. The same issue of the *Bulletin* reported that the Director of the Social Section, M.Ekstrand, usually hosted an evening reception in honor of the delegates to the Committee on the Traffic at the close of each session. This was hoped to provide an inducement for more ICW members of the Standing Committee on the Traffic to attend the sessions in Geneva. Such physical presence, it assumed, would stimulate member's involvement in the area of the Traffic and further instruct them in the skills of high level negotiation. Furthermore, it created a strong sense of solidarity and collegiality so important in the formation of women's networks and collective action as has been previously discussed.

Sainte-Croix was responsible during most of the period of this study for the reports written on the Traffic for the *Bulletin.* Seeing that she was the representative for the international voluntary organizations, we might assume that it was she who provided other organisations with the same reports. She was not only the representative on the Advisory Committee of the League on the Traffic, but also chairperson of the ICW Standing Committee on the Traffic, Vice President of the ICW and one time president of the

National Council of France. As such she was politicized in the ideals and concepts of middle-class social feminism grounded in the rhetoric of social purity. Her influence extended to diverse organisations such as the Young Girls' Friendly Society, the Association for the Protection of Catholic Girls, the International Union of Catholic Women's Leagues, the Jewish Association for the Protection of Women and Young Girls, the International Bureau for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children, the ICW, the World Alliance of Women on Suffrage and Equal Citizenship, the Y.W.C.A., St. Joan's Political Alliance, and the International Women's League for Peace and Freedom. She said at one point that co-operation of these organisations constituted "most convincing proofs of the interest of the great women's associations in those questions of justice and moral betterment which we all have at heart. The reforms claimed by them are the very condition of all progress in the moral domain."[71] This cross-fertilization of membership asserted the overall philosophy of rescue and feminist social action. Saint-Croix was, by no means, solitary or exceptional in her involvement. A cursory examination of the memberships, and often leaderships of numerous volunteer organisations, elicits similar information.

In the case of ICW members, the *Bulletin* delivered concrete education with regards to preparing women to participate in and take their place in the public political sense. Women members of the ICW were given the examples of surprisingly astute and expert leadership from their own representatives who learned to hone their skills through interactions with many of the world's influential male leaders, government officials, technocrats, as well as leaders of other women's organisations. In the March *Bulletin* of

1925, for example, it was reported that Ishbel Aberdeen, Margery Corbett Ashby, President of the IWSA, K.D. Courtney, Chairman of the Women's International League (British section), Constance M. Waldegrave, Acting President of the WYWCA, Winnifred C. Cullie Vice-President of the International Federation of University Women, wrote letters to the Editor of the London *Times* advertising their work and the concerns of women.

In addition hundreds of letters were sent to the League from these separate women's organizations lobbying for increased representation.[72] Other letters constituted suggestions for improvement or grievances concerning the handling of affairs on the various committees–for example, some argued that those equipped to deal with concerns of the Traffic would not necessarily have the essential or appropriate skills to enable them to deal with work involving the welfare of children.[73] This concern about combining the work of the Traffic with the Child Welfare Committee as part of the League's Social Section, emerged intermittently. Grace Abbott of the U.S. Children's Bureau and Charlotte Whitton of the Canadian Council on Child Welfare, who sat on the latter committee, consistently demanded a separation of the two mandates. Interestingly, these two women saw the Traffic assessors as amateurs in the volunteer paradigm and argued forcefully that "experts" ought to be, as they were, paid professionals representing governments and not adhoc groups even if these were international women's organisations. Curiously, Whitton was not a government representative although she postured as one.

The League represents both a departure from and broadening of the former

> parameters of the maternalist discourse. Geneva provided a moral and temporal space where it culminated in its universalization based on a vision of international co-operation. This space was a point of bifurcation that resulted in a parallel but not uniformly distinct discourse that legitimated a progressive or scientific basis for action on behalf of women and children. Thus the League was a site in which the tensions between panmaternalism and progressivism, voluntarism and professionalism coalesced....[74]

In this seemingly innocuous difference we see the new feminism's ascendancy over social feminism.

The big Women's Organisations were aware of the power that their numbers represented. A letter sent to Governments who did not include a woman delegate read:

> Your Excellency,
> At a very successful gathering held at Geneva in honor of the six women who had been sent by the Governments of Sweden, Denmark, Great Britain, Norway, Roumania and Australia as substitutes delegates to the VII Assembly of the League of Nations, speeches were made by several of the delegates as well as by women representing international organizations. Every speech was virtually an appeal to the Governments of all States Members of the League to include a woman in their delegations at future Assemblies.
> A strong point was made that the co-operation of women in the deliberations of the Assembly and its Committees not only gave added strength to the decisions of that body, but also was an encouragement to the womanhood of all countries to do their part in the constructive propaganda in support of peace.
> In conveying this appeal to you on behalf of our associations, we sincerely trust that you, Your Excellency, will do your utmost to include a woman in your delegation next year.
> We are,
> Yours faithfully,
> Ishbel Aberdeen and Temair
> Margery Corbett Ashby
> Jane Addams[75]

Their brand of practical politics demonstrated the combined weight of women's organizations. And 35 million women members of the ICW alone (at this time) was an impressive number. Thus they were able to persuade League officials that the numbers of

assessors on the Traffic and Child Welfare Committees should be increased to embrace more female input. This representation alone was a demonstration of the power of international, inter-agency co-operation and the efficiency of women's networking efforts.

As I have noted previously the ICW-- indeed, all women's organisations–were not reluctant to describe their work in terms of propaganda as can be seen in the December 1926 *Bulletin.* It reported that:

> The French National Council has been doing excellent propaganda for the League of Nations. Thanks to the help of generous friends leaflets have been published which have been distributed in the schools by the Ministry of Public Instruction. Mme Heimann drew attention to lantern slides belonging to the National Council which can be borrowed to illustrate lectures of the League of Nations.[76]

Education or propaganda? Obviously the distinctions were not made by the historical actors in the way we might today. The "accumulating memory of print" shaped behavior and suggested a model for the process of transformative learning. In short, this chapter's study of the *Bulletin* and how it informed its membership and the public of the ICW's work on the Traffic and at the League is a concrete example of propaganda as a word for consciousness raising and consciousness-raising is a necessary condition for education which is in the progressive sense a process rather than a product. "The immediate concern of women's organisations now, is to carry on active propaganda in their respective countries against the limitation of women's work...."[77]

Women learned meeting procedures and protocol through example. Members could learn through reading the *Bulletin* how reports, motions, resolutions and questionnaires were prepared, worded, presented and processed at the League. Each month the reports from the League on the Traffic kept members up to date with the tone

of the international discourse at the League. Members became fully immersed and politicized in the discourse of the politics of the body that transpired. They could read and discuss the resolutions and motions put forth to the Assembly thereby gaining accurate, detailed knowledge that might not be otherwise available in the local press. It was, in other words, a universalising experience because members world-wide could receive the same factual accounts and identical instruction. Whenever the League prepared documents and reports the *Bulletin* made members aware of the details, e.g., the cost, the title and the place of purchase. In March of 1928 there appeared an add in the *Bulletin* for the Publications of the League alerting members to the availability of the Report of the Special Body of Experts on Traffic in Women and Children. The following is a fair summary of how this form of education was accomplished.

> Part I which was published in March 1927 could be purchased for 50pp. Price 2/- $0.50. Part II, just published 226pp. Price:7/6 $2.00.
> Part I Contains: Introduction—1.The character of the traffic—2.The extent of the traffic—3.The demand for foreign women—4.Sources of supply—8.Growth of public opinion—9.Conclusion
> Part II Just Published 262 pp. Price 7/6 $2.00 This volume contains reports on the local enquiries carried out in the following countries:--Argentine, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Canada, Cuba, Czechoslavakia, Egypt, France (Algeria, Tunis), Germany, Great Britain, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Latvia, Mexico, Netherlands, Panama, Poland, and Danzig, Portugal, Roumania, Spain, Switzerland, Turkey, United States, Uruguay, together with the observations of the Governments on the investigators' results. It also includes the texts of a large number of laws and regulations, statistics of prostitution in various countries, etc.

Frequently, the Book Report Section would provide reviews. For example, the April 1939 edition of the *Bulletin* evaluated the report on the *Traffic in Women in the East: Work of the Bandoeng Conference*, and encouraged members to read it as the "The account of the Conference, though condensed, makes excellent reading"

In times when formal education for adult women was limited, the non-formal education taking place via the *Bulletin* was pertinent, relevant, and often intellectually challenging. The ICW did not "dumb down" its aspirations for feminist reform. It helped to prepare women of the ICW the world over, for the next step that Freire outlines as praxis. "What do you do with what you know?"[78]

ENDNOTES

[1]*Bulletin,* Vol. 2, no.4/5 (Dec./Jan 1923/24).

[2]*Bulletin* , Vol. 1, no. 8 (December 1922).

[3]Rooke and Schnell "Open Equally to Men and Women: The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39)" unpublished paper (1995), pp.3-4.

[4]Ibid., p.5.

[5]Mrs Oglivie Gordon's presidential address "The New Patriotism" delivered to the Annual Meeting of the National Councils of Great Britain and Ireland, June 25th, 1919 (Fawcett Library Archives, London: hereafter referred to as FLA --File: Mrs Olgivie Gordon).Reference to the 1915 Conference is found in Jane Addams, Emily G. Balch, Alice Hamilton *Women at the Hague: The International Congress and its Results Report* (New York: Garland Publishing Company, 1972); also the League of Nations Archives #23/117/84. Copies of this speech were sold for one penny.

[6] Ibid.

[7]Bulletin ,Vol.VI, no.1 (September 1927).

[8] Madame Avril de Sainte-Croix, See *Bulletin* Vol VII. no.10. (June 1929).

[9]It appears that each organisation that was involved with this initial move takes its own credit for the instigation, e.g. for a similar account varying only in the fact that the IWSA was responsible for the initial contact with Wilson see Whittick's *Woman Into Citizen,* especially p.70.

[10]ICW *Women in a Changing World,* p.45.

[11] "Modern Steps to Limit Traffic in Persons," talk given by Dame Rachel Crowdy Thornhill, Frankfurt, 24th October, 1955. Introductory Notes on the Legislative Development of International Conventions on the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (1899-1949), London: IB,1956.

[12]Sir Sidney Harris, C.B., C.V.O. "Traffic in Women and Children Past Achievements" International Conference of the International Bureau for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (1899-1949), held in London, May 19th-20th,1949, London: IB, 1956.

[13]Roberts, "Rocking the Cradle for the World", p.18.

[14] "A New Year's Message from the ICW President" the *Bulletin*, Vol.3, no.5/6, (January-February, 1925), p.2. The other participating countries were the British Empire, Italy, Roumania, Japan, Spain, France and Poland as reported in a letter to the Secretary of State, Washington, D.C. contained in the Arthur Sweetser Papers, #14, Library of Congress.

[15] Sir Sidney Harris, C.B., C.V.O. Lecture, "Traffic in Women and Children: Past Achievements," p.14.

[16] *Bulletin*, Vol.V. no.8, (April 1927).

[17]Countess of Aberdeen ed., *International Council of Women:Report of Transactions of The Fourth Quinquennial Meeting , Toronto, Canada, 1909* (London: Constable & Co.Ltd.) for the "Report of the Committee on the Equal Moral Standard and Traffic in Women," pp.298-300 for the discussion leading to the name change. See also p.109

[18] *Bulletin*, Vol.VI, no.3 (November 1927).

[19] League of Nations Protection of Children, Report by the British Representative, C.810.1924 FLA.

[20] *Bulletin* Vol.VII, no.1 (September 1928).

[21]*Bulletin* , Vol. VII, no.9 (May 1929).

[22] ICW, *Women in a Changing World.* P.157.

[23] League of Nations International Conference on Traffic in women and Children: General Report of the Work of the Conference, Recommendation no.14, August 5,1921, p.87, C.227:M.166. 1921.IV, FLA.

[24]Lady Aberdeen,ed. I*CW Quinquennial Meeting, Toronto, 1909,* p.110.

[25] Grabinska notes in her article "A Half Century of Co-Operation" delivered at the same Session as Dame Rachel Crowdy in Frankfurt on October 24th, 1955, that the signatories at the 1904 Conventions agreed to establish a central Authority charged with the coordination of information concerning traffic questions. p.7. The 1921 Convention held by the League of Nations set up an annual reporting process which provided statistics for the committee.

[26] Madame Grabinski, " A Half-Century of Co-Operation," p.9.

[27]*Bulletin*, Vol.XI, no.3 (November 1932).

[28]*Bulletin*, Vol.XI, no.3 (November 1932) p.25.

[29] *Bulletin*, Vol.VI, no.9 (May, 1928).

[30]This grant was influenced by Miss Grace Abbott. Miss Abbott, chief of the U.S. Children's Bureau, had been appointed by President Harding as a U.S. representative on the International Commission on Traffic in Women and Children. The appointment resulted from a recommendation from Mrs. Philip North Moore, President of the National Women's Council following an invitation received by her from the Secretary of the Commission to have a U.S. representative named on the Commission. *Bulletin*, Vol.1, no.9 (February, 1923). R.L.Schnell and P.T. Rooke "The Rise and Fall of a Progressive Social Movement for Children: The

U.S. Children's Bureau and the Canadian Council on child Welfare 1900-45," in *Canadian Child Studies: Historical And Comparative Readings* (University of Calgary, 1996), pp.1-56.

[31]Grace Abbott, Chief of the Federal Children's Bureau of the United States was able to obtain a $75,000 grant from the Rockefeller Bureau for Social Hygiene. See Rooke and Schnell "Open Equally To Men and Women", p.5.

[32]A letter from the Secretary General of the League of Nations, dated April 30th, 1924, lists the members of the Special Body of Experts as Donna Maria Christina Gustiniani Bandini, Mr. S.W. Harris, Dr. Paulina Luisi, an ICW member from Uruguay , Mr. Isidor Maus, M. de Neuron, Dr. William F. Snow (Chairman), M. Suzuki. ALN:document C.L.61.1924.IV.

[33] *Bulletin* Vol.V. no.8 (April 1927).

[34] Sir Austen Chamberlain " Report of the Special Body of Experts on the Extent of the International Traffic in Women and Children", Geneva, March 8th 1927. ALN: document C.126.1927.IV

[35]*Bulletin*, Vol.V. no.10 (June 1927).

[36]*Bulletin* Vol.VI. no.4 (December 1927).

[37]"Report by Sir Austen Chamberlain" Geneva March 8th 1927. ALN: document C.126.1927.IV.

[38]This report contained information from the following countries: Argentine, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Canada, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, Egypt, France (Algeria, Tunis), Germany, Great Britain, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Latvia, Mexico, Netherlands, Panama, Poland and Danzig, Portugal, Roumania, Spain, Switzerland, Turkey, United States of America, and Uruguay.

[39]Traffic in Women and Children Report of the Fifth Committee to the Assembly, Geneva, September 17th, 1927. ALN: A73 IV.Social 1927.IV.II, p.2.

[41]Ibid. In addition to the committee on White Slavery, the League had an established Commission to work on the question of International Slavery.

[42]Editorial Notes in the *Bulletin*, Vol. IX. no.2 (October 1930).

[43]Reprinted from the *Manchester Guardian*, in the *Bulletin* Vol.XI, no.8 (April 1933).

[44]*Bulletin*, Year XIV, no.4 (December, 1935), p.30.

[45]"The Mental Atmosphere at Geneva," *Bulletin* , Vol.3, no..3/4 (November/December 1924).

[46]*Bulletin* , Year XV, no.4 (December, 1936).

[47]Rooke and Schnell, "Women's Transnational Organisations and International Conventions and the League of Nations 1919-39" The Inaugural Conference of the European Social Science History Association, Amsterdam, May 9-12th, 1996.

[48]*Bulletin*, Vol.1, no.8 (December 1922).

[49]Designated in correspondence, and acknowledged by less represented women's organisations , the following were known collectively as "the Big Women's Organisations:" IWSA, Open Door International, Equal Rights International, Worlds' YWCA, International Federation of University Women,Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, ICW, St. Joan's Social and Political Alliance, All-Asia Conference of Women, World Union of Women for International Concord.

[50]Beverly Lynn Bouttilier, "Gender, Organized Women, and the Politics of Institution Building: Founding the Victorian Order of Nurses for Canada, 1893-1900," (PhD. diss.).

[51]ALN: document C.227:M.166 1921.IV Fawcett Library, August 5,1921, "International Report of the Conference on the Traffic in Women and Children. General Report of the work of the Conference", p.122.

[52]ICW Records 1925, p.199, cited in *Women in a Changing World* ,p.55.

[53]Rooke and Schnell, " 'Open Equally To Men and Women:'The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39)," unpublished manuscript circa 1995, p.33.

[54] "Report of the Fourteenth Assembly of the League of Nations" , *Bulletin* Vol.XII, no.4 (December, 1933).

[55]Ibid.

[56]Ibid.

[57]*Bulletin* , Vol.XII., no.9 (May, 1934).

[58] The proposed International Convention never occurred. The Draft was passed at the Assembly of the League of Nations in September, 1938. Much enthusiasm surrounded this proposal as it was projected to fill in the gaps in the fight against the exploitation of the prostitution of others. The Assembly instructed the Secretary General to budget for a conference in 1940. This Convention never occurred, as it was prevented by the outbreak of war.

[59]In September 1936, the Council of the League appointed the Advisory Committee on Social Questions, consisting of 25 Government representatives, appointed for one term of three years, with power to consult expert Assessors, selected according to the subjects under discussion. Though this new Committee was appointed primarily to deal with the same subjects as the former Advisory Commission, its title envisaged a wider and more flexible framework with which to study social problems and treat new subjects as the need arose; but, unfortunately, the work of the Committee came to an untimely end with the outbreak of the war. See Sir Sidney Harris "Traffic in Women and Children " p,7.

[60]Lof N Document C.235.M.169. 1937.IV. "Reorganization of the Advisory Committee" pp.5-7. The document outlines that "The revised constitution empowers the Advisory Committee, when studying a particular subject, to nominate experts as assessors in the field of their special experience."This was one method of squeezing out the volunteers. Another change the restructuring made was to retain the international associations that were formerly represented by their representative assessor as correspondent members. These associations were: International Alliance of Women for Suffrage and Equal Citizenship; St. Joan's Social and Political Alliance; World's Young Women's Christian Association; International Federation of Business and Professional Women; ICW; International Federation of University Women; International Federation of Women Magistrates, Barristers and Members of Other Branches of the Legal Profession; Equal Rights International; WILPF; World Union of Women for International Concord; World's Women's Christian Temperance Union; All-India Women's Conference; International Union of Catholic Women's Leagues; International Federation of the "Amies de la Jeune Fille"; Jewish Association for the

Protection of Girls, Women and Children; International Catholic Association for the Protection of Young Girls; International Bureau for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children; International Federation of Trade Unions; International Association for Child Welfare; Pan-American Child Welfare Institute; League of Red Cross Societies; "Save the Children" International Union.

[61]Dame Rachel Crowdy, "Modern Steps," p.9.

[62]The Beijing Conference, or the Fourth World Conference on Women, was perhaps the largest world conference held to date by the United Nations and certainly its largest on women. Almost 50,000, more than two thirds of them women, attended the inter-governmental Conference and its parallel event, the NGO Forum on Women '95 in Houairou. The total number registered was 16,921: 4,995 delegates, 4,035 NGO representatives; 3,250 media. The number of UN Member States was 181. In addition, the Cook Islands, Kiribati, the Holy See, Naura, Switzerland, Tonga, and Tuvalu attended as observers. An estimated 30,000 attended the Forum on Women'95 which was held in conjunction. "Womens Conference Round Up" *United Nations Information Centre in Sydney for Australia, New Zealand and the South Pacific* at unic@peg.pegasus.oz.au

[63]These numbers were provided by Carol Reigelman Lubin and Anne Winslow in *Social Justice for Women The International Labor Organization and Women* (Durham and London: Duke University Press: 1990), p.252.

[64]Tessitore and Woolfson, eds. *A Global Agenda Issues Before the 53rd General Assembly of the United Nations*, p. 214.

[65]Richard J. Novak. "Propaganda and Adult Education" in *New Horizons in Adult Education*, Vol.2, No.5/13/88, Spring, 1988 [electronic journal]. Available from horizons@fcae.acast.nova.edu, INTERNET.

[66]*Women in a Changing World*, p.46.

[67]*Bulletin*, Year XIV, no.5 (January, 1936).

[68]*Bulletin*, Vol.1, no.7 (October, 1922).

[69]*Bulletin* Vol.IX, no.7 (March 1931).

[70].*Bulletin*, Year XVI, no.2 (October, 1937). This opinion is also supported by Rooke and Schnell in their unpublished article "Open Equally to Men and Women:" The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39), 1995. p.15. In fact, they argue that the Traffic had the most representation of any of the committees at the League of Nations .

[71]*Bulletin*, Vol.X.,no, 9 (May, 1932).

[72]ALN File C.164.1925 contains letters from the ICW, the IWSA, the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom all requesting added representation to this committee.

[73]*Bulletin* Vol.3, no.7 (March 1925).

[74] Rooke and Schnell's "Open Equally to Men and Women:" The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39) circa 1995,unpublished paper, p.32; *No Bleeding Heart: Charlotte Whitton A Feminist on the Right* (Vancouver: University if British Columbia Press, 1987) pp.84-85; also "Feminists, Volunteers and Bureaucrats: Women of the U.S. Children's Bureau and the Social Section of the League of Nations, 1919-1939, circa 1995, unpublished manuscript, p.10.

[75]*Bulletin*, Vol. V, no.2 (October 1926).

[76]*Bulletin*, Vol.V., no.4 (December 1926), p.7.

[77]*Bulletin* , Vol. XII, no.5 (January 1934).

[78]Novak. "Propaganda" p.5

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

Early in the study the questions were raised:

1.How did the ICW, through the *Bulletin,* disseminate its educational program and conscientize its membership within a theoretical framework of non-formal education?
2.How were the processes of participatory democracy emphasized and achieved within the model of voluntary association?
3.To what extent were these processes either a gendered experience or a gender-specific program?
4.To what degree did the ICW, through the *Bulletin* effect a balance between propaganda and education?

It is now opportune to answer these questions by recapitulating the evidence presented in the preceding chapters. We have traced the ICW agenda of adult non-formal education through the theme of the Traffic in Women and Children. The ICW was one of the many women's organisations that responded to the call to work against the social disruption caused by the moral scandal of the Traffic. The ICW educated its members as a means to this end through the *Bulletin,* as a demonstration of how discourse could be translated into practical politics. This material has provided the basis for a study which has enabled us to examine how the *Bulletin* disseminated education, propaganda, suggestions, and emotive appeals which informed members about the relationships between the Traffic and social reform, the Traffic and the National Councils, the ICW and feminism, and between the ICW and the Traffic at the League of Nations.

The international arena in the inter-war years was a gendered environment. The power relationships, embedded in the theory of international relations reflected the

influence of gender. International relations theory is concerned with experience as a means of interpreting the relationships around us, and making sense of the world. In the inter-war years the interpretations were male-defined. "Knowledge and theory,... are built upon experience."[1] This theory was formulated at a time when women were not part of the equation. It was a prescriptive, normative process based on a conception of significance associated with the importance of work.[2] Because women's sphere was considered to be in the home women were, by description, eliminated from the process. As a consequence, the study of the role of women in international organisations during the inter-war years brings one face to face with the intractable workings of gender.[3] The interpretations were male defined. Women were entering a world that was male-structured, male understood and male priviledged–a Hobbesian world of power, conflict and warfare–separate and distinct from the world of domestic order which was viewed as their "proper place."[4] It is the struggle of how women's groups campaigned to become politically educated in the processes of participatory democracy in order to become included in the formula of international relations that forms much of the cohesion of this study. Women's efforts to change their political powerlessness and to gain access to this public world of men was the focus of the educational program of the ICW. This was a particularly difficult task considering the international character of the group. The fact that the ICW was challenged along lines of enfranchisement, religion, ethnicity, and race made this a mammoth objective as women came face to face with men on the issue of equality in society.

The ICW was unique at the time. It considered the question of women's universality in terms of citizenship and democratic participation. The educational agenda of the ICW aimed deliberatively, carefully and conscientiously to transmit these worthy goals through the medium of the *Bulletin*. Astute women leaders of the ICW understood the power of education, acted as role models, and orchestrated the non-formal agenda of the organisation. They realized that with education they could affect the intersection of the private and public spheres for female social action–women too could be brought into the policy-making public world of men and contribute to the interpretation of the world around them. ICW leaders aggressively sought to make it happen. The determination of these middle-class women to seek citizenship and participate in the democratic function belies the stereotype that they were passive and frivolous.

The international organizational apparatus of the ICW was set in place for the effective dissemination of large-scale non-formal education that was aimed at creating solidarity among members in order to transform the world for women. Through networks of local, national, and international members, women could be educated non-formally to take their place as equal citizens. Education occurred through organizational meetings, conferences and symposiums. More particularly for the rank and file member, education was communicated through the written word of the official organ, the *Bulletin*. Members were silently educated via communities of print in matters of national and international concern. The pages of the *Bulletin* were filled with examples of praxis and role modeling vital to the agenda of the organisation. Such education and propaganda campaigns taught women the necessary skills to take their place in the public arena. By reporting in the

Bulletin members could learn to conduct mass public meetings concerning the Traffic, organize petition campaigns to close *maisons tolérées*, and influence electoral politics–a tactic now referred to as pressure politics. Pamphlets were published to help women organize and run campaigns and to inform them of the latest developments on the Traffic. Information brochures were distributed to educate women on the issues, admittedly often from a self-serving perspective. New and pertinent books were reviewed and publications from other organisations and agencies were advertised. Notices of meetings of other organisations were posted to reinforce and deliver the silent message that others too were involved and interested in the same vital issues. All of this served to help ICW members make sense of the world they were learning about. It further served to alert women of the need for franchise in order to affect their world and to participate fully as citizens.

The relevance of the education delivered by the ICW was best demonstrated in the area of the equal moral standard. The education conducted by the *Bulletin* created a separation between the topic of the Traffic and prostitution, and the Equal Moral Standard. This study has provided a different interpretation from the commonly accepted theory that these issues were one and the same and that organisations were unable to separate the two. The study examined the distinction that was made by the *Bulletin* noting that the ICW was in fact capable and did, in fact, separate the two. The campaign relating to the double standard differed from other reform in that it: first, concentrated on the moral equality between the sexes therefore in this sense it was a gender-specific program as well as a gendered experience: second, it departed from the campaign which had initially claimed it needed the vote as a civic right but then it became gender-specific in

that women in particular argued that they needed a vote for a moral end–to benefit social and family life and to protect family life from male self interests.

The recommendations from the *Bulletin* suggested the establishment of women's police forces as a practical resolution to the problem of the equal moral standard. The gender-specific women's policing was viewed by ICW leaders as a less obvious and more acceptable involvement than the programs of eugenics and birth control that were the result of the newly emerging arena of sexuality. When such conversations were becoming more normalised and more common in the twentieth-century, the ICW devised an alternate solution. The educational agenda in this case, although restricted and effectively censored, in that the contentious issues were understood as being potentially disruptive to the organization, delivered an alternative value. In order to engage in meaningful work surrounding the topic, the ICW redirected its educational efforts into a program that would be politically acceptable to the greater number of members, thereby attempting to meet the goal of accommodating and representing all women. Moreover, ICW leaders were fully aware of the potential for friction and ultimate disintegration that topics like eugenics and birth control represented in an organisation that was complex and diverse in structure, but ultimately conservative in nature. Policing was instead, an interpretation of surveillance and control of female sexuality which was more in line with the social feminism of the ICW. The propaganda campaign to establish women's policing serves best to demonstrate the diplomatic acumen of the leaders of the ICW and their understanding of the universality of women as citizens. This instance underscores and reinforces the power and effectiveness of the dissemination of the educational propaganda

agenda of the ICW. It establishes the concept of non-formal education as a deliberate and systematic attempt to involve members in the activities that the ICW valued as worthy. This deliberate educational agenda further substantially refutes the stereotype of middle-class women as idle women. The propaganda that aimed at establishing women's police forces, because of its international endorsement, was a judicious achievement of insightful proportion in that it guaranteed an acceptable form of practical politics as a solution to a potentially controversial problem. This education program officially served to educate women concerning the equal moral standard according to the propaganda regiment of the ICW.

The non-formal education and propaganda that was delivered by the *Bulletin* however, as we have seen was, at times, limited, self-serving and in some cases censored and restricted. Crucial to the understanding of the world of the ICW woman was the propaganda surrounding the construct of feminism. During the inter-war years, after a good many of the western nations had received the vote, the definition of feminism strained under new incentives. The ICW, and other voluntary organisations, had entered the public domain as "moral mothers" or civic housekeepers. The concept of feminism began to change around issues of suffrage, the nationality and citizenship of married women, special labor legislation for women, and questions of sexual morality. [5] International groups disagreed on and about the issues.

At the beginning of the inter-war years the term *feminist* was, it seems, flexible enough to encompass various interpretations of the place of women in the world of international affairs. However, over time there were changes as consensus began to break

down. For example with labor legislation some groups wanted special treatment as women (protection) while other groups insisted on equal treatment of all sexes.[6] This disagreement created a tension around the definition of feminism that marked the beginning of the process of decline for the ICW.

The ICW had no trouble naming itself feminist. By way of example, in June 1926 the *Bulletin* carried two reports on feminism, a report on "The First Feminist and Education Congress" from the National Council of Portugal and the "New Danish Feminist Victory" that changed the Danish title of Mrs.or Miss to one title for all–Fru. The problem of feminism for the ICW however, remained the same as for other issues–the internationally complex political, social, and religious make-up of the organization. The fact that some of its member nations were not granted suffrage prevented the leaders from taking any form of radical stance. It was in the best interests for organisations like the ICW to keep dissension to a minimum and to retain relative solidarity. In a eulogy written about Lady Aberdeen by Augusta Rosenberg of the Hungarian NCW she stated that Lady Aberdeen was not a feminist in a 'suffragette sense,' but she did realize that "only after having become citizens with equal rights would ... [women] be able fully to exercise their influence for the common good."[7]

As president and role model, Lady Aberdeen set the feminist agenda for the ICW and the evidence in the *Bulletin* supports the argument that the ICW, in spite of individual leanings, retained a predominantly limited maternalist outlook on feminism. The propaganda presented to members was consistently concerned with mothering as the process of access. In April 1935 the *Bulletin* printed the "Mother's Charter" which among

other things declared that "Every mother should have the right to exercise an influence on the life of her country, since the child's fate depends on it."[8] Lady Aberdeen's "President's Letter" in October 1935 sent out an urgent plea to the membership. "Ever remember that it is our divine mission to "Mother the World" and the world at this time is in urgent need of that *Mothering*."[9] As late as February 1936 we find an article written by Marie Hoheisel on Peace titled "The World needs "Mothering."In it she stated:

> Women must become conscious of that power to mother the world that is inherent in us all, whether or not we have borne a child. They must not remain inarticulate: they should repeat again and again that we women are there to watch over, to nurse and preserve the life to which we give birth...I should like to conclude by saying to women: do not let yourselves be discouraged, if you find that the world at large does not hold your "mothering" powers, in that esteem in which they ought to be held...do not despair and do not cease believing in your mission. Warm, real, motherly loving-kindness can help to build bridges from people to people; it can contribute to widen the narrow limits of Law and Justice, for the benefit, the protection, the salvation of the world. Let each and all of us contribute their share in the pursuance of the final goal, conscious of the words of the great Nordic poet Ibsen: "It is in the hands of you women that the problem of humanity lies: as mothers you will solve it."[10]

This is not to say that individual National Councils did not become embroiled with the new feminism and other debates surrounding feminism. The *Bulletin* however, fostered a community of discourse, propaganda and education aimed at creating a feminist consciousness, based on the concept of nineteenth century social feminism. It was this familiar agenda that aided the conservative members of the ICW in making sense of their worlds. In a sense the international, conservative, middle-class, composition of the ICW tied it to this agenda. Leaders were not willing to risk dissension that would easily dissolve into major rifts for the organisation–solidarity was important to the success of the work in the Traffic. It was this understanding of feminism that allowed the ICW to

initiate women's policing as a practical solution to the controversial issue of the equal moral standard. It was however, to be this restricted understanding of feminism that would ultimately prove inadequate in Geneva. It was social feminism that would mark the ICW as "old guard" in the face of newer interpretations of feminism at this time, but, more especially in the post World War II era as the membership of the ICW declined.

It is interesting to note that in spite of other scholarship which tells us that the ICW was in fact losing ground at the League and being edged out of the picture as it were, the propaganda that was being disseminated to ICW members remained upbeat and positive. During the whole decade of the thirties the *Bulletin* constantly reported its membership as 40 million members in 40-42 countries. It seems questionable that these numbers would have remained so constant considering the world disruptions that were occurring. We can understand this as being propaganda, realizing that it remained in the best interests of these ICW women to maintain a positive image of success and effectiveness. The continued participation of women in the affairs of the public domain relied heavily on healthy organizational support.

Did the education disseminated on the Traffic by the ICW to the women members help them when they arrived at the most prestigious international table at the League of Nations? Did women make a difference at that table? Arriving at this august table in and of itself was an accomplishment for women's international organisations and the ICW in particular. The prestige that the ICW enjoyed as a result of this inclusion enhanced the credibility of its program to close the *maisons tolérées.* The involvement at the League can be viewed as the crowning achievement of the ICW during these years and testifies to

the credibility and success of the non-formal education delivered by the organisation. The program to close the licensed houses of prostitution became more intense with the backing of the League of Nations.

Despite the eligibility for entry into the League, women's acceptance at this level was a universal disappointment. The gendered ideas of the early twentieth-century and the understanding that a woman's "proper place" is in the home did not bode well for the inclusion of women into the foremost body of international politics. The Fifth Committee or Social Section was regarded as the logical place for the extension of women's nurturing abilities in the humanitarian and social work of the League. This work would not disrupt the sexual division of labor while operating in a male dominated political arena. This committee was popularly known as *La Commission Sentimentale* which probably reflected the stereotypical gendered attitudes of those who were against the participation of women at this, or any level of public politics. Rooke and Schnell tell us that male delegates considered that work of the Fifth Committee "irrelevant to the real 'stuff' of international politics–health (a male domain for medicos and experts), politics, mandates, economic matters, and treaties."[11] Consequently, one could argue that accepting work on the Fifth Committee reinforced the gendered position of women at the League. It could be seen as creating a ghetto for women relegating them to insignificant positions lacking international purpose.

The ICW and other organisations worked consistently yet unsuccessfully, educating their members to demand increased representation. During the two decades the *Bulletin* conducted vigorous campaigns aimed at educating Councils. It encouraged them

to seek the equal representation and access to which they were theoretically entitled. The *Bulletin's* educational agenda from the outset encouraged women's organisations to lobby their Governments to increase women's representation. The *Bulletin* faithfully tracked and published the names of the women who were involved in delegations and advisory positions at the League. Despite concerted efforts by women's organisations and the ICW, to educate their members to participate equally in the workings of the League, it never did become the reality that was envisaged by the women leaders of international organisations. Women were never appointed as members of the League Council.[12]

As has been demonstrated, in spite of great effort, women did not make huge gains into the political committees of the League with the exception of the Fifth Committee. They did not succeed in transforming the esteemed body. What then was their contribution? Did they make any difference? When attempting to assess the impact of the educational agenda of the ICW we must not forget, at this point, that there was no original plan for women to be included in the League of Nations at all. It was only on the insistence of women leaders like Lady Aberdeen that the inclusion took place. The gendered nature of international politics did not include women. This is an important and crucial detail for without the initiative of these women, and the gender specific education that they had received in social action, it would have been an exercise of much smaller proportion than it was.

The ICW was in part responsible for the drafting of certain sections of the Covenant of the League. The fact that women would be equal representatives in all positions: appointed on the same terms as men was one such section: the inclusion of the

Traffic another. These were important and significant accomplishments in a world that had not initially included them. Hence, the title the ICW received as "Mother of the League of Nations" gave members a perception of inclusion and status that did not translate into reality–nonetheless, it did educate women into the possibilities of having equal representation as international citizens.

This inclusion, although ineffective to a large degree at the League, was transmitted over however, when the composition of the United Nations was in formation. "The creation of the United Nations (UN) in the 1940s and its historic assertion of the "equal rights of men and women" brought new opportunities. It extended and reinforced the LN's [League of Nations] provision regarding women."[13] All of this was thanks to the ground work of women's groups like the ICW educating members and interested others in the importance of women's participatory democracy.

The ICW gained credibility in its campaign against the Traffic through its participation at the League. The fact that the United Nations stills attempts "to stem the growth of trafficking in persons (commonly for the purposes of prostitution)...."through the U.N. High Commissioner for Human Rights is proof that the insistence of women in 1919 to add the Traffic to the Covenant of the League was viewed as important and has continued as an international issue. It therefore made a difference. The 53rd agenda of the General Assembly of the U.N., in 1998, addressed the subject of **traffic in women and girls,** noting that **young boys** are also becoming victims. The Secretary-General was asked to prepare a report about the implementation of the provisions of the Platform for Action of the Fourth World Conference on Women (Beijing, 1995) and the Vienna

Declaration and Programme of Action (1993) relevant to the trafficking in women and girls.[14] This is a large legacy made possible by the educational efforts of the ICW and the other women's international organisations who convinced members of the need to become involved in the work of the Traffic. This is yet further evidence that the dismissal of middle-class women's history as uninteresting, is short sighted.

The fact that ICW women were not ignored totally at the League is a consideration when we are speaking of what influence these women made in Geneva. The *Bulletin* reported on several occasions the inclusion of members to high-ranking gatherings and consultations at Geneva. In the *Bulletin* of November 1937 His Highness Aga Khan, President of the assembly of the League of Nations received a deputation from the ICW and publicly endorsed the role of women and the educational agenda of the ICW.[15] Why then did this not translate into positions at the League?

The public endorsement of the ICW and its educational agenda at the League can be possibly interpreted as deference to the social positions that these women held–and the public respect that women like Lady Aberdeen commanded. Considering that the League was primarily male structured delegates would be aware of the influence these women could access. This provides us with an illustration of the intersection of the public and private spheres. At this point ICW members were in a rather interesting position. Women had, it seems, one foot in each sphere as it were. One foot represented the politically educated women venturing forth into public realms of men and power, the other was the stereotypical middle-class women who relied on the authority of her husband for social status and recognition and whose place was considered to be at home. The failure of the

ICW, in spite of effective programs of education and propaganda, to move conclusively from one sphere to the other, was a product the international male interpretation of how the world worked and women's understanding of their place within that sphere coupled with the resounding limitations of the concept of social feminism.

That the League would not have been the same without women is an obvious statement. What women did achieve and provide at the table however, was a constant reminder of their presence as a body politic. That women were successful in stopping the Traffic through the work of the national councils and the closures of the *maisons tolérées* and the various efforts at the League is obviously wrong. However, it can be argued that while their efforts failed this was due as much to the gendered organizational structures of international politics. The lack of genuine support, and the collapse of the League itself by the end of the thirties were other factors that bore considerable weight in the lack of women's advancement at the League. In spite of the political climate women kept the social and humanitarian questions concerning Traffic and Child Welfare and women's policing on the agenda. While these issues were not considered, by men, to be the most pressing in times of Depression, the rise of Fascism and the world armament agenda, it was in these arenas that ICW members naturally viewed the League as being the most successful.

A vital element in the dissemination of the education program of the ICW to create women's policing, close *maisons tolérées,* and participate at the League was the politic of friendship. One cannot imagine from our position of high speed Internet access, jet travel, and satellite communications, how the impetus for action and reform was

sustained in times of comparatively slow travel and communication. The bonds of friendship between members was an essential ingredient in the overall successful dissemination and communication of the education program. From Lady Aberdeen down to the smallest Local Council women formed friendships that legitimated and reinforced their sense of purpose and commitment. In the company of communities of friends women felt part of a larger process that constructed a common understanding of the world–a world that was changing for them. The *Bulletin* served to convince women that this community was solid and cohesive as well as being inter-connected with the other big Women's Organisations. In this sense the community of friends was enlarged as women interpreted their world as a common gendered experience. Without such bonds education programs would have been more difficult and limited. Women's worlds were constructed by the reality of their shared gendered experiences, internationally, nationally, and locally.

ICW women and the big Women's Organisations pioneered, set the stage, raised the consciousness of post-war women. We cannot stop sexual slavery even today in spite of massive financial input and professionalized feminist bureaucracies on the international stage. There is no reason to expect earlier attempts to have been any more successful. As with the WCTU and alcohol, an independent organisation using education as its medium, and the long range eradication of prostitution as its goal, was bound to meet with some impossible odds.[16] The fundamental reason; morality and passion cannot be legislated. That actual concrete changes did not occur was not as significant as the fact that all of this was part of the broad consciousness raising and education base that

interpreted the world for women and readied the feminist project of the secondwave feminist movement. The educational groundwork was done, the experience was there, the organizational networks set up. The history and propaganda was in place for the understanding of the very different–but connected–story of the second wave–"the whisper" had been heard. [17] As Josephine Butler wrote by way of encouragement to Avril de Sainte Croix " ...progress is not like a great flood that submerges everything, it is more like a rising tide which reaches its goal in the end, though sometimes it may seem to be ebbing away."[18]

The answer to the question did the educational agenda disseminated by the *Bulletin* of the ICW make a difference to the world of women, improve their situation and help them interpret their world can be seen in this example. Louise van Eeghen talking to the press about the Peace Exhibition at the Hague in 1929 reminded readers and the world that:

> At the first peace Conference at the Hague in 1899 Frau von Suttner in vain asked to be admitted to the meetings. At the second Conference in 1907 women were allowed to enter the Lobbies and in 1919 a delegation from the women's organisations, with Lady Aberdeen at the head, was the only delegation to be granted the honour of being received by President Wilson and the statesmen occupied in framing the Peace Treaty, and on that occasion several of the demands made by the women were incorporated in the Covenant of the League of Nations.[19]

In summation, several things have been accomplished by this study of the *Bulletin* of the ICW. By studying the *Bulletin* it has been possible to form a contextual analysis of the balance created by the ICW between non-formal education and propaganda techniques and comment as to how these methods were disseminated to conscientize the

membership. A relationship has been examined between feminism as practical politics, the role of women's organizations in the exercise of practical politics, and the impetus behind the ICW engagement in what it identified as an important value–"the process of transformative learning" for participatory democracy. The study has cast the historical qualitative study in an analytical framework that "focuses on the underlying social process that characterises the social structure of these educational and propaganda activities and their effects on the instructional methods, interrelations and overlap with other international women's organizations."[20] The study has further elaborated the characteristics of the feminist agenda of the ICW following the analysis of Rooke and Schnell of similar women's organizations at the League of Nations. This analysis suggests two things: a) that the ICW leadership was aware of the unique opportunities provided through education for the advancement of the status of women and used the *Bulletin* to disseminate such messages; and b) the ICW believed that they could educate others [men] on women's issues.[21] In conclusion, the study has drawn out the relevance of studying a middle-class historical example to expand contemporary understandings and practices of women's history and adult education.

ENDNOTES

[1]Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland's "Introduction" to Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland eds., *Gender and International Relations"* (Bloomingdale: Indiana University Press, 1991), p.1.

[2]Ibid.

[3]Carol Miller "Women in international relations? The debate in inter-war Britain" in Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland eds., *Gender and International Relations* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1991), p.65.

[4]J.Ann Tickner "Hans Morgenthau's principles of political realism" in *Gender and International Relations*, p.31.

[5]For a more detailed discussion see Rooke and Schnell's "'Unfettered Liberty:' Protective Legislation, Equal Rights and Women on the Margins at the League of Nations" unpublished manuscript, March 1994; "'The Right to Liberty:' Women's Organisations and the Quest for Equal Status at the League of Nations" paper given at the Social Science History Association, Atlanta, GA, Oct.11-12, 1994; "'Open Equally to Men and Women:' The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39)" unpublished manuscript, 1995.

[6] Caryn Neumann "The End of Gender Solidarity: The History of the Women's Organisation for National Prohibition Reform in the United States, 1929-1933" in *Journal of Women's History* Vol.9, no.2 (Summer 1997), pp.31-51, argues that women after suffrage, could "no longer count on the support of the majority of women and the absence of significant female opposition." Women began to divide their interests between matters of prohibition in the U.S. She adds that "women's disagreement marked their political maturation," as they moved away from a gendered position and developed differences. This is obvious in the divisions that developed. This seems to have happened on more general and universal women's issues in the 1920's. Some women saw "equal rights" (meaning identical laws for men and women) as the only avenue in which women could administer their "special" talents on the world, while others saw "special" laws for women as the ultimate equalizer.

[7]Augusta Rosenberg, "A fellow-worker remembers" *Bulletin*, Year XVII, no.8, (May 1939).

[8]*Bulletin*, Year XIII, no.8 (April 1935).

[9]"President's Letter" *Bulletin* , Year XIV, no.2 (October 1935).

[10]"Women for World Peace" *Bulletin*, Year XIV, no.7 (March 1936).

[11]Rooke and Schnell, "Open Equally", p.26.

[12] The October 1937 *Bulletin* noted that twelve women delegates were appointed to the Assembly that year, two only as full delegates. Five women experts brought the number of women participating up to 17. But 36 countries sent no women either as delegates or as experts, Denmark having two for part of the time. These are not numbers that would suggest resounding success of women's politics. By way of contrast in the League Secretariat, the civil service of the League, women held the majority of the positions, but largely as telephone operators, office keepers, secretarial pool and routine administrators. Henni Forchammer, reported through the *Bulletin* that the 300 persons of all nationalities working in the Secretariat (the majority being women) were doing chiefly mechanical work.

[13]Anne Winslow ed., *Women, Politics, and the United Nations* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1995), p.178."The United Nations shall place no restrictions on the eligibility of men and women to participate in any capacity and under conditions of equality in its principal and subsidiary organs" (Article 8).

[14]Tessitore and Woolfson eds., *A Global Agenda*, pp.168 and 231.

[15] Dame Maria Ogilvie Gordon, Countess Apponyi, Miss Forchhammer, Miss van Eeghen, Mme Dreyfus-Barney, and Dr. Renée Girod were the representatives.The Aga Khan was quoted as saying :

> The role of women has been, and remains, of importance in international life. It may be more important still: and I have realized this when I heard you, Ladies, setting out so clearly and in such an interesting manner your communications addressed to myself. It gives me great pleasure, as

President of the Assembly of the League of Nations, to congratulate you on your work, and to thank you for what you have done.

[16]See Sheehan "The WCTU" for the seed of this argument p.246.

[17]The official history of the WILPF maintained that women's voice rose to "no more that a whisper in the assembly of nations" Bussey and Tims 1965, 73, quoted in Rupp *Worlds of Women"*, p.215.

[18]Josephine Butler wrote these words to Sainte Croix in an attempt to encourage her to continue in the fight against the Traffic. *Bulletin,* Year XIV, no10. (June 1936).

[19] Bulletin, Vol VIII, no.3 (November 1929).

[20] John C. Bock and George J. Papagiannis eds., "Some Alternative Perspectives" in Non-formal Education and National Development, p.6

[21]Rooke and Schnell, "'The Right to Liberty:' Women's Organisations and the Quest for Equal Status at the League of Nations;" "'Open Equally to Men and Women:'The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39);" (unpublished manuscript, 1995)"'Ufettered Liberty:' Protective Legislation, Equal Rights and Women on the Margins at the League of Nations" (unpublished manuscript, 1994).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

PRIMARY SOURCES

Acton, William. *Prostitution* ed. Peter Fryer 1857, reprint (London: Fakenham and Reading 1968).

Addams, Jane. *A New Conscience And An Ancient Evil* (New York: The MacMillan Company, 1914).

Alberta. *Statutes of Alberta,* 1998, cP-19.3, proclaimed in effect from February 1,1999.

Archives of the League of Nations (ALN) Mrs.Ogilvie Gordon, "The New Patriotism," presidential address, Council for the Representation of Women in the League of Nations, London, June 25th 1919. 23.117.84.

ALN. International Conference of the Traffic in Women and Children: General Report of the work of the Conference. August 5th, 1921. C.227:M.166.1921.IV.

ALN. Outline Biographical Notes on ICW Presidents and Personalities. Box A-E, Section 5,#10.

ALN. League of Nations Summary of Annual Reports for 1922 Received from Governments relating to theTraffic in Women and Children.C.164.M.40.1924.IV.

ALN. League of Nations Advisory Committee on the traffic in Women and Children. Minutes of the second Session held at Geneva, March 22nd-27th, 1923. C.225.M.129.1923.IV.

ALN. Minutes of the Third Session Advisory Committee on Traffic in Women and Children. April 7th-11th, 1924. C.217.M.71.1924.IV.

ALN. Report of the Advisory Committee on Traffic in Women and Children Report on the Work of the Third Session. April 17th, 1924. C.184.M.73.1924.IV.

ALN. Letter written by the Secretary General regarding the appointment of Special Body of Experts. April 30th , 1924. C.L.61.1924.IV.

ALN. Memorandum by the Secretary-General to the Council on Commission for the Protection of Women and Children in the Near East. August 9th, 1924. C.382.M.140.1924.IV.

ALN. Advisory Committee on the Traffic in Women and Protection of Children. Report of the Fourth Session, May 1925. C.293. (1)1925.IV.

ALN. Advisory Commission for the Protection and Welfare of Children and Young Persons: Traffic in Women and Children Committee. Report on the Fifth Session, August 1st, 1926. A.18.1926.IV.[C.240.M.89.1926.IV.] [C.T.F.E.311 (2).]

ALN. Report of the Special Body of Experts on the Extent of the International Traffic in Women and Children, by Sir Austen Chamberlain, March 8th, 1927.C.126.1927.IV.

ALN Advisory Commission for the Protection and Welfare of Children and Young People. Minutes of the Seventh Session: Traffic in Women and Children Committee, June 1st, 1928. C.184.M.59.1928.IV.

ALN. Advisory Commission for the Protection and Welfare of Children and Young People. Report on the Ninth Session, April, 16th, 1930. C.218.M.104.1930.IV.

ALN. Advisory Commission for the Protection and Welfare of Children and Young People. Report to the Council on the Reorganization of the Advisory Commission. April 7th, 1936. C.192.M.121.1936.IV.

ALN. Reorganization of the Advisory Committee. C.235.M.169.1937.IV.

Countess of Aberdeen, ed. *International Council of Women Quinquennial Meeting Canada 1909* (London: Constable & Co.Ltd, 1910).

Edmonton Journal. "President faces down Chinese Army," October 18, 1998, F5.

International Bureau for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (IBST) Sir Sidney Harris, C.B.,C.V.O. "Traffic in Women and Children Past Achievements" Lecture at the International Conference of the IBST. May 19th -20th 1949.Fawcett Library, London. File: Introductory Notes on the Legislative Development of International Conventions on the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons.

IBST. Dame Rachel Crowdy Thorhill, D.B.E.,R.R.C.,L.L.D. "Modern Steps to Limit Traffic in Persons" Talk, Frankfurt, October 24th, 1955. Fawcett Library, London.

IBST. Madame Wanda Grabinska "A Half Century of Co-Operation in the Legislative Development of the International Conventions of the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons (1899-1949)" Lecture at the International Conference of the IBST. May 19th -20th 1955. Fawcett Library, London. File: Introductory Notes on the Legislative Development of International Conventions on the Suppression of the Traffic.

International Council of Women (ICW). *Bulletin,* Vols.1-18, (1922-1939) ICW Headquarters, Paris, France.

ICW. *The International Council of Women Resolutions from 1899-1973* (The National Council of Women of Canada, May 1976).

_____ "The International Council Of Women: What it is and what it does"undated.

National Council of Women of Canada (NCWC). *Year Book* (The National Council of Women of Canada,1938-1941).

_____*Year Book* (NCWC, 1938).

_____*Royal Visit Number Year Book* (NCWC,1939).

_____*Coronation Year Book* (NCWC, 1937).

Johnson, George W. and Lucy A. eds. *Josephine Butler An Autobiographical Memoir* (London: Simpkin, Marshall, Hamilton, Kent & Company Limited, 1913).

ARTICLES

Anderson, Kathryn. "Practicing Feminist Politics: Emily Newell Blair and U.S. Women's Political Choices in the Early Twentieth-century"in *Journal of Women's History*, Vol.9, no.2 (Summer 1997), 50-72.

Baker, Paula. "The Domestication of Politics: Women and American Political Society 1780-1920" in *American Historical Review*, 89 (June 1984), 630.

Becker, Susan. "International Feminism between the Wars: The National Woman's Party versus the League of Women Voters" in Lois Scharf and Joan M. Jensen *Decades of Discontent: The Woman's Movement 1920-1940* (London: Greenwood Press, 1983), 223-242.

Beckman, Marlene D. "The White Slave Traffic Act: Historical Impact of a Federal Crime Policy on Women" in *Women and Politics*, vol.4 (Fall 1984), 86.

Bloch, Ruth, H. "Untangling the Roots of Modern Sex Roles: A Survey of Four Centuries of Change"in *Signs* 4, no.2 (Winter, 1978), 237-252.

Blumer, Herbert. "Social Movements" in R.Serge Denison and Robert K. Merton eds. *The Sociology of Dissent"* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jonanovich, Inc., 1974).

Bock, J. and George J. Papagiannis, eds. "Some Alternative Perspectives" in *Non-Formal Education and National Development: A Critical Assessment of Policy, Research, and Practice* (New York: Praeger, 1983).

Borg, W. & Gall, M. "Techniques of Historical Research" in Borg & Gall eds., *Educational Research: An Introduction* (New York: Longman, 1989).

Burton, Antoinette. "The Feminist Quest for Identity: British Imperial Suffragism and A Global Sisterhood,"1900-1915," *Journal of Women's History*, .3 no.2 (Fall 1991): 46-81.

Cook, Blanche Wiessen. "Female Support Networks and Political Activism: Lillian Ward, Crystal Eastman, Emma Goldman" in *Chrysalis*, no.3 (1977), 43-61.

Cott, Nancy. "What's in a Name? The Limits of Social Feminism: Or, Expanding the Vocabulary of Women's History" in *Journal Of American History* 76 (December, 1989), 808-829.

_____"Passionlessness: An Interpretation of Victorian Sexual Ideology, 1790-1850" in *A Heritage of Her Own: Towards a New Social History of American Women*, Nancy Cott, Elizabeth H.Pleck eds., (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1979).

Davidoff, Leonore. "Class and Gender in Victorian England: The Diaries of Arthur J. Munby and Hannah Cullwick," *Feminist Studies* 5 (Spring 1979), 88-92.

Deutsch, Sarah. "Learning to Talk More Like A Man" in *American History Review*, vol.97, no.2 (1992), 379-404.

Findlay, Eileen J. "Decency and Democracy: The Politics of Prostitution in Ponce, Puerto Rico, 1890-1900" *Feminist Studies* 23, no.3 (fall 1997), 471-499.

Fisher, Berenice. "Wandering In The Wilderness: The Search For Women Role Models" in *Signs*, Vol.13, no.2 (Winter, 1988), 211-233.

Forbes, Ernest. "The Ideas of Carol Bacchi and the Suffragists of Halifax: A Review Essay on Liberation Deferred? The Ideas of the English Canadian Suffragists. 1877-1918" in *Atlantis* Vol.10, no.2 (1984-85),119-125.

Freedman, Estelle, B. "The New Woman: Changing Views of Women in the 1920s" in Lois Scharf and Joan M. Jensen, eds. *Decades of Discontent: The Woman's Movement 1920-1940* (London: Greenwood Press, 1983), 21-42.

_____ "Separatism as Strategy: Female Institution Building and American Feminism, 1870-1930, *Feminist Studies* 5, no.3, (fall 1979),.512-529.

Gluck, Sherna. "Socialist Feminism between the Two World Wars: Insights from Oral History" in Lois Scharf and Joan M. Jensen eds. *Decades of Discontent The Women's Movement 1920-1940* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1983), 279-297.

Gordon, Linda. "What's New in Women's History?" in Teresa de Lauretis, ed. *Feminist Studies/ Critical Studies* (Bloomingdale: Indiana U.P.,1991), 25-64.

Gorham, Deborah. "'Have we really rounded seraglio point?':Vera Brittain and inter-war feminism"in Harold L. Smith *British Feminism in the Twentieth-Century* (England: Edward Elgar, 1990).

Grant, Rebecca. "The sources of gender bias in international relations theory" in Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland eds., *Gender and international relations* (Bloomingdale and Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1991), 8-26.

Gustafson, Melanie. "Partisan Women in the Progressive Era: The Struggle for Inclusion in American Political Parties" in *Journal of Women's History* Vol.9, no.2 (Summer 1997), 8-30.

Headon, Christopher. "Women and Organized Religion in Mid and Late Nineteenth-Century Canada," in *JCCHS* (1978), 3-18.

Hollinger, David A. "How Wide the Circle of the We? American Intellectuals and the Problem of the Ethnos since World War II," *American Historical Review* (April 1993): 317-337.

Howe, Florence. "Women and the Power to Change" in *Women and the Power to Change* ed. Florence Howe (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1975), 151.

Ireland, Robert. "Frenzied and Fallen Females: Women and Sexual Dishonor in the Nineteenth-century United States" in *Journal of Women's History,* vol.3, no.3 (Winter 1992).

Janeway, Elizabeth. "Who is Sylvia: On the Loss of Sexual Paradigms" *Signs* 5, no.4 (1980), 573-589.

Jensen, Joan, M. "All Pink Sisters: The War Department and the Feminist Movement in the 1920s" in Lois Scharf and Joan M. Jensen, eds. *Decades of Discontent: The Woman's 1920-1940* (London: Greenwood Press, 1983), 199-222.

Kaplan, Temma. "Female Consciousness and Collective Action: The Case of Barcelona 1910-1918" in *Signs* 7, (Spring, 1982), 546-66.

Kelly, Joan. "The Social Relations of the Sexes: Methodological Implications od Women's History" in *Women, History, and Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1984).

Kennedy, Susan Eastabrook. "Poverty, Respectability, and Ability to Work" in *International Journal of Women's Studies,* vol.2 (1979), 408.

Kent, Susan Kingsley. "Gender reconstruction after the First World War" in Harold L.Smith ed. *British Feminism in the Twentieth-century* (Aldershot:Edward Elgar, 1990), 66-83.

Kerber, L. "Separate Spheres, Female Worlds, Woman's Place: The Rhetoric of Women's History" in *The Journal Of American History* (1989), 9-39.

Kidd, J.Roby. "Some Preliminary Notes Concerning An Enquiry Into the Heritage of Canadian Adult Education" in *Occasional Papers for Continuing Education,* (Vancouver, B.C. June 1979), 11-16.

Kingsley-Kent, Susan. "Gender reconstruction after the First World War" in Harold L. Smith,ed. *British Feminism in the Twentieth-Century* (England: Edward Elgar, 1990).

Kovan, Seth and Sonja Michel. "Womanly Duties: Maternalist Politics and the Origins of the Welfare State in France, Germany, Great Britain and the Unites States, 1880-1920" in *American Historical Review,* 43 (1989),112-119.

Ladd-Taylor, Mollie. "Toward Defining Maternalism in U.S. History" in *The Journal of Women's History,* vol.5, no.2 (Fall 1993), 110-113..

Langford, Nanci. "'All That Glitters' The Political Apprenticeship of Alberta Women, 1916-1930" in Catherine A.Cavanaugh and Randi Warne eds., *Standing on New Ground,* Alberta Nanture and Culture Series, John E. Foster and Dick Harrison, general eds., (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1993),71-85.

Lerner, Gerder "Placing Women in History: Definitions and Challenges" in *The Majority Finds its Past* (New York: 1979).

_____ "Women's Rights and American Feminism" in *American Scholar,*XI (Spring,1971), 236-237.

Lesbock, Suzanne. "Women and American Politics, 1880-1920" in Louise Tilley and Patricia Gurin eds., *Women Politics and Change* (New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1990).

Littlewood, Barbara and Linda Mahood. "Prostitutes, Magdalenes and Wayward Girls: Dangerous Sexualities of Working Class Women in Victorian Scotland" in *Gender and History,* vol.3, no.2 (Summer 1991), 161-190.

McDougall, Mary Lynn. "Working Class Women During the Industrial Revolution, 1780-1914" in Bridenthal and Koon, eds., *Becoming Visible: Women in European History* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977), 255-279.

McLaren, Angus. "Birth Control and Abortion in Canada 1870-1920" in Alison Prentice and Susan Mann Trofimenkoff eds. *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History Volume 2* (Toronto:McClelland and Stewart, 1985), 84-101

Melucci, Alberto. "The Process of Collective Identity"in Hank Johnston and Bert Klandermans eds., *Social Movements and Culture Social Movements, Protest, and Contention Volume 4* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995).

Milbank, Alison. "Josephine Butler: Christianity, Feminism and Social Action" in Jim Obelkevich, Lyndal Roper, Raphael Samuel eds., *Disciples of Faith: Studies in Religion, Politics and Patriarchy* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987), 154-165.

Miller, Carol. "Women in international relations? The debate in inter-war Britain" in Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland eds., *Gender and International Relations* (Bloomingdale and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1991), 64-82.

Mitchinson, Wendy. "The WCTU: 'For God, Home and Native Land:' A Study in Nineteenth-century Feminism" in L.Kealey ed., *A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880s-1920s* (Toronto: The Women's Press, 1979), 151-169.

Morrison, T. "Their Proper Sphere: Feminism, the Family, and Child Centred Social Reform in Ontario, 1875-1900" in *Ontario History* (March, 1976), 45-64.

Nelson, Cary. "Envoys of Otherness: Difference and Continuity in Feminist Criticism" in *For Alma Mater:Theory and Practice in Feminist Scholarship* (Chicago: University of Illinois, 1985).

Neumann, Caryn E. "The End of Gender Solidarity: The History of the Women's Organisation for National Prohibition Reform in the United States, 1929-1933" in *Journal of Women's History* Vol.9, no.2 (Summer 1997), 31-51.

Newman, Louise, M. "Critical Theory and the History of Women: What's at Stake in Reconstructing Women's History" in *Journal of Women's History* vol.2, no.3 (Winter 1991), 58.

Novak, Richard. "Propaganda and Adult Education" in *New Horizons in Adult Education,* vol.2, no.5/13/88, (Spring 1988) [electronic journal]. Available from horizons@fcae.acast.nova.edu.INTERNET.

Offen, Karen. "Defining Feminism: A Comparative Historical Approach," *Signs* 14, no.1 (1988):129-157.

O'Neill, W. "Feminism as Radical Ideology" in Alfred E.Young ed., *Dissent* (Northern Illinois: University Press, 1968).

Peters, R.S. "What is an Educational Process?" in R.S. Peters, ed. *The Concept of Education* (New York: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1967), 1-23.

Pierson, Ruth Roach."Experience, Difference, Dominance and Voice in the Writing of Canadian Women's History" in *Writing Women's History: International Perspectives,* eds. Karen Offen, Ruth Roach Pierson, and Jane Rendall (Bloomingdale: Indiana U.P, 1991).

Radford-Ruether, R. "The Cult of True Womanhood" in *Commonweal* 9, no.11 (1973), 129.

Roberts, Wayne. "Rocking the Cradle for the World: The New Woman and Maternal Feminism, Toronto,1877-1914" in Linda Kealey, ed., *A Not Unreasonable Claim* (Toronto: Canadian Women's Educational Press, 1979), 15-45.

Rooke, Patricia T. "Mothering the World" unpublished manuscript 1997.

_____ "Public Figure, Private Woman: Same-Sex Support Structures in the Life of Charlotte Whitten" in *International Journal Of Women's Studies*, Vol.6, no.5 (Nov/Dec., 1983), 412-428.

_____ "From Pollyanna to Jeremiah: Recent Interpretations of American Educational History," in *Journal of Educational Thought,* Vol.9, no.1 (April 1975).

_____ "Woman as Artifact: Sexual Scripts and a Female Education from the Reformation to Monique Wittig" in *Journal Of Educational Thought,* vol.30, no.1 (April 1996), 57-78.

Rooke, P.T and R.L. Schnell. " 'Open Equally to Men and Women:'The Dissolution of Maternalism on the Child Welfare Committee, League of Nations (1919-39)." (Unpublished manuscript, 1995).

_____ "Feminists, Volunteers, and Bureaucrats: Women of the U.S. Children's Bureau and the Social Section of the League of Nations, 1919-1939." (Unpublished manuscript, Oct.1995).

_____ "'Unfettered Liberty:' Protective Legislation, Equal Rights and Women on the Margins at the League of Nations." (Unpublished manuscript, March 1994).

_____ "The League of Nations, Women's International Organisations and the Political Education of Women, 1919-1945" (Unpublished manuscript).

Rubin, Gayle. "The Traffic in Women: Notes on the 'Political Economy' of Sex" in *Oxford Readings in Feminism: Feminism in History* edited by Joan Wallach Scott (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), 105-151.

Rupp, Leila J. "Constructing Internationalism: The case of Transnational Women's Organizations, 1888-1945," *American Historical Review* 99, 5 (December 1994): 1571-1600.

_____ "Sexuality and Politics in the Early Twentieth-century: The Case of the International Women's Movement"*Feminist Studies* 23, no.3 (fall 1997), 577-605.

Ryan, Mary. "The Power of Women's Networks: A Study of Female Moral Reform in Antebellum America" in *Feminist Studies* 5, no.1 (Spring 1979), 65-85.

Scott, Joan Wallace. "Women's History and Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis" in Scott, J.W. ed. *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York, 1988)

Scott, S.M. "An Overview of Transformation Theory in Adult Education" in Sue M.Scott, Bruce Spencer, Alan M.Thomas eds., *Learning For Life Canadian Readings in Adult Education* (Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc., 1998),178-187.

Selman, G. "Concerning the History of Adult Education in Canada" in *Canadian Journal of Continuing Education* 12, 34 (1979).

Semple, Neil. "The Quest for the Kingdom: Aspects of Protestant Revivalism in Nineteenth-century Ontario" in David Keane & Colin Read eds., *Old Ontario: Essays in Honour of J.M.S. Careless* (Toronto: Dundurn Press, 1990), 95-117.

Sheehan, Nancy,M."Women and Education in Alberta:The Rhetoric and the Reality" in Nick Kach and Kas Mazurek eds., *Exploring Our Educational Past* (Calgary: Detselig Enterprises, Ltd.,1992), 115-130.

_____ "Women's Organisations and Educational Issues, 1900-1930" in *Canadian Woman*

Studies Vol.7, no.3 (Fall 1986), 90-94.

_____ "The IODE, the Schools and World War I " in *History of Education Review* Vol.3, no.1 (1984), 29-44.

_____ "The WCTU and Educational Strategies on the Canadian Prairie" in *History of Education Quarterly* Vol.24, no.1 (1984), 101-19.

Sigsworth, E.M. and T.J. Wyke. "A Study of Victorian Prostitution and Venereal Disease" in Martha Vicinus ed. *Suffer and Be Still* (Bloomingdale and London: Indiana University Press, 1972).

Sklar, Kathryn Kish. "A Call for Comparisons" in *American Historical Review* 95 (October, 1990), 1109-1114.

_____"Organized Womanhood: Archival Sources on Women and Progressive Reform" in *Journal of American History,* vol. 75, no.1 (1988), 177.

Smart, Judith. "Feminists, Labour Women and venereal Disease in Early Twentieth-century Melbourne" in *Australian Feminist Studies,* no.15-17 (1992-1993), 29.

Smith, Harold, L. "British Feminism and the Equal Pay Issue in the 1930s" in *Women's History Review,* Vol.5, no.1 (1996).

_____"British Feminism in the 1920s" in Harold L.Smith, ed. *British Feminism in the Twentieth-Century* (England: Edward Elgar, 1990), 47-65.

Smith, Hilda. "Female Bonds and the Family: Recent Directions in Women's History" in *For Alma Mater: Theory And Practice in Feminist Scholarship*, eds., Paula Treichler, Chris Kramarae and Beth Stafford (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984).

Smith-Rosenberg, C. "The Female World of Love and Ritual: Relations Between Women in Nineteenth-century America" in N. Cott & E. Pleck eds., *A Heritage of Her Own* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1975).

Spender, Dale. "On Feminism and Propaganda" in *For Alma Mater: Theory and Practice in Feminist Scholarship,* eds., Paula A. Treichler, Cheris Kramarae, and Beth Stafford (Chicago:University of Illinois, 1985).

Strong-Boag, Veronica. "Setting the Stage: National Organisation and the Women's Movement in the Late 19th Century" in Susan Trofimenkoff and Alison Prentice eds., *The Neglected Majority: Essays in Canadian Women's History* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1977), 87-103.

Taylor, Mollie Ladd. "Toward Defining Maternalism in U.S. History" in *The Journal of Women's History*, vol.5, no.2 (Fall 1993), 110-113.

Taylor, Verta and Nancy Whittier. "Analytical Approaches to Social Movement Culture: The Culture of the Women's Movement" in Hank Johnston and Bert Klandermans eds., *Social Movements and Culture Social Movements, Protest, and Contention Volume 4* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1995).

Tickner, J.Ann. "Hans Morgenthau's principles of political realism: a feminist reformulation"in Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland eds., *Gender and international relations* (Bloomingdale and Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1991), 27-40.

Uglow, Jenny. "Josephine Butler: From Sympathy to Theory (1828-1906)" in *Feminist Theorists: Three Centuries of Key Women Thinkers,"* Dale Spender ed. (New York: Pantheon Books, 1983), 146-165.

Vicinus, Martha. "Sexuality and Power: A Review of Current Work in the History of Sexuality" *Feminist Studies* 8, no.1 (Spring 1982), 133-156.

Walkowitz, Judith R. "Jack the Ripper and the Myth of Male Violence"in *Feminist Studies* 8,no.3 (Fall 1982), 543-574.

_____ "The Politics of Prostitution" *Signs* 6, no.11 (1980), 123-135.

_____ "'We are not Beasts of the Field:' Prostitution and the Poor in Plymouth and Southhampton under the Contagious Diseases Acts"in *Feminist Studies* no.1 (1993),73-106.

Weiner, Lynn Y. "Maternalism as Paradigm" in *Journal of Women's History* vol.5, no.2 (Fall 1993), 96-130.

Welter, B. "The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820-1860" in *American Quarterly* 155, 1966.

White, P.A. "Socialization and education" in R.F.Dearden, P.H.Hirst and R.S. Peters eds. *Education and the development of reason* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972), 113-131.

BOOKS

Alberti, Johanna. *Beyond Suffrage: Feminists in War and Peace, 1914-28 (* New York: St. Martin's Press, 1989).

Alonso, Harriet Hyman. *Peace as a Woman's Issue: The History of the U.S. Movement for World Peace and Women's Rights* (Syracuse University Press, 1993).

Appelby, Joyce; Lynn Hunt; Margaret Jacob. *Telling the Truth About History* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1994).

Babbie, E. *The Practice of Social Research: Sixth Edition* (Belmont:Wadsworth Publishing Company, 1991).

Bacchi, Carol. *Liberation Deffered? The Ideas of the English Canadian Suffragists. 1877-1918* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983).

Basu, Amrita ed. *The Challenge of Local Feminisms: Women's Movements in Global Perspective* (San Francisco: Westview Press, 1995).

Berg, B.L. *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences* (Toronto: Allyn and Bacon, 1989).

Black, Naomi. *Social Feminism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989).

Blair, Karen. *The Clubwoman as Feminist* (New York: Holmes, Meier Publishers, Inc. 1980).

Bland, Lucy. *Banishing the Beast Sexuality And The Early Feminists* (New York: The New Press, 1995.

Bogden, R.C & Biklen, S.K. *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods* (Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1982).

Bosch, Mineke with Annemarie Kloosterman, eds., *Politics and Friendship: Letters from the International Woman Suffrage Alliance, 1902-1942 (*Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1990).

Boxer, Marilyn J. and Quataert Jean H.,eds. *Socialist Women: European Socialist Feminism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries* (New York: Elsevier North-Holland Inc., 1978).

_____ *Connecting Spheres: Women in the Present World, 1500 to the Present* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987).

Braham, Jeanne. *Crucial Conversations Interpreting Contemporary American Literary Autobiographies by Women* (New York: Teacher's College Press Teacher's College, Columbia University, 1995).

Brandt, Allan M. *No Magic Bullet: A Social History Of Venereal Disease In The United States Since 1880 With A New Chapter On AIDS* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987).

Bridenthal, Renate and Claudia Koonz, eds., *Becoming Visible:Women in European History (*Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1977).

Bristow, Edward J. *Prostitution and Prejudice: The Jewish Fight against White Slavery 1870-1939* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982).

Bryson, L. *Adult Education* (New York: American Book Co., 1936).

Bullough, Vern,L. *The History of Prostitution* (New York: University Books, Inc., 1964).

Bulmer,Martin, Kevin Bales, Kathryn Kish Sklar, eds. *The Social Survey in Historical Perspective 1880-1940* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

Burstyn, J. *Victorian Education and the Ideal of Womanhood* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1984).

Butterfield, Herbert. *The Whig Interpretation of History* (New York: W.W.Norton, 1965).

Carr, E.H. *What is History?* (London: Penguin Press, 1985).

Cassel, Jay. *The Secret Plague: Venereal Disease in Canada 1838-1939* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1987).

Cook, Ramsay.*The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985).

Cook, Ramsay and Wendy Mitchinson.eds. *The Proper Sphere Woman's Place in Canadian Society* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976).

Cook, Sharon Anne. *Through Sunshine and Shadow: The Women's Christian Temperance Union Evangelicalism, and Reform in Ontario, 1874-1930* (London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1995).

Cott, N. *The Grounding of Modern Feminism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987).

Denisoff, R.Serge and Robert K. Merton. *The Sociology of Dissent* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc, 1974).

Doving, K. *Road of Propaganda: The Semantics of Biased Communication* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1959).

Elias, J. & Merriam,S. *Philosophical Foundations of Adult Education* (Malabar: Kreiger Publishing Company, 1984).

Epstein, Steven. *Impure Science AIDS, Activism, and the Politics of Knowledge* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996).

Evans, Richard, J. *Comrades and Sisters: Feminism, Socialism and Pacificism in Europe 1870-1945* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1987).

_____ *The Feminists:Women's Emancipation Movement in Europe, America and Australasia 1840-1920* (New York: Barnes & Noble Books, 1977).

Fingard, Judith. *The Dark Side of Life in Victorian Halifax* (Porter's Lake: Pottersfield Press, 1989).

Finnegan, Frances. *Poverty and Prostitution: A Study of Victorian Prostitutes in York* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979).

Fishburn J.F. *The Fatherhood of God and the Victorian Family: The Social Gospel in America* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1981)

Fisher, Trevor. *Prostitution and the Victorians* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997).

Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sex: An Introduction* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978).

Fraser, B.J. *The Social Uplifters: Presbyterian Progressives and theSocial Gospel in Canada, 1875-1915* (Waterloo: Wilfred Laurier Press, 1988).

Freire, P. *Paulo Freire: A Critical Encounter* eds., Peter McLaren and Peter Leonard (London: Putledge, 1993).

Freire, P. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* trans. Myra Bergman Ramos (New York: Herder and Herder, 1972).

French, Doris. *Ishbel and the Empire: A Biography of Lady Aberdeen* (Toronto and Oxford: Dundurn Press, 1988).

Friedl, Bettina ed., *On To Victory: Propaganda Plays of the Woman Suffrage Movement* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1987).

Gagan, Rosemary, R. *A Sensitive Independence: Canadian Methodist Women Missionaries in Canada and the Orient, 1881-1925* (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992).

Genovese, Elizabeth Fox. *Feminism Without Illusions* (University of North Carolina Press, 1991).

Griffiths, Naomi. *The Splendid Vision: Centennial History of the National Council of Women 1893-1993* (Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1993).

Hammerton, A.James. *Emigrant Gentlewomen Genteel Poverty and Female Emigration 1830-1914* (London: Croom Helm, 1979).

Hammond, J.L. and Barbara. *The Town Labourer, 1760-1832* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1920).

Harrison, Brian. *Drink and the Victorians* (London: Oxford University Press, 1971).

Harrison, J.F.C. *Learning and Living, 1790-1960 A Study in the History of the English Adult Education Movement* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1961).

Hersh, Blanche Glassman. *The Slavery of Sex: Feminist-Abolitionists in America.* (Urbana: University of Chicago Press, 1978).

Hilton, B. *The Age of Atonement: The Influence of Evangelicalism on Social anf Economic Thought , 1795-1865* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1988).

Houle, C. *The Design of Education* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1972).

Hudson, J.W. *The History of Adult Education* (London:The Woburn Press,1969).

International Council of Women. *Women in a Changing World: The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women since 1888* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul,1966).

Jackel, Susan.ed. *A Flannel Shirt and Liberty British Emigrant Gentlewomen in the Canadian West 1880-1914* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1982).

Jarvis, P. *Adult & Continuing Education: Theory and Practice*,second edition (London: Routledge, 1983).

Jeffreys, Sheila. *The Spinster and Her Enemies:Feminism and Sexuality 1880-1930* (London: Pandora Press, 1985).

Kealey, L.and Sangster. *Beyond the Vote* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989).

Kinnear, Mary. *Margaret McWilliams: An Interwar Feminist* (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991).

Knowles, M. *A History of the Adult Education Movement in the United States* (Huntington: Kreiger, 1977).

Langford, Nanci. *Politics and Pitchforks: 75 Years of Organized Farm Women in Alberta* (Calgary: Detselig Enterprises Ltd, 1997).

Kerber, Linda, Alice Kessler-Harris and Kathryn Kish Sklar, eds., *Women's History* (University of North Carolina Press, 1991).

Kraditor, Aileen. *Up From the Pedestal: Selected Writings in the History of American Feminism* (Chicago: Quadrangle, 1968).

Lageman, Ellen, Condliffe. *A Generation of Women: Education in the Lives of Progressive Reformers* (Harvard University Press, 1979).

Laquer, Thomas Walter. *Religion and Respectability (Sunday Schools for Adults)* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976).

Lehrer, Susan. *Origins of Protective Legislation for Women 1905-25* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987).

Lemons, J.Stanley. *The Woman Citizen: Social Feminism in the 1920s* (University Press of Virgina, 1973).

Lerner, Gerder. *The Majority Finds its Past* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1979).

Locke, L.F., Spirduso,W.W., Silverman, S.J. *Proposals that Work: A Guide for Planning Dissertations and Grant Proposals* (Newbury Park: Sage Publications, 1987).

Lubin, Carol Riegelman and Anne Winslow. *Social Justice For Women The International Labor Organization and Women* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1990).

Lynn, Susan. *Progressive Women in Conservative Times* (Rutgers University Press, 1992).

McCann, W.P. *The Educational Innovators, 1750-1880* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1967).

McDonald, Lynn. *The Woman Founders of the Social Sciences* (Carleton University Press, 1994).

McKeganey and Marina Barnard. *Sex work on the streets: Prostitutes and their clients* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 1996).

McLeish, John. *Evangelical Religion and Popular Education* (London: Methuen, 1969).

Maack, Mary Niles and Joanne Passet. *Aspirations and Mentoring in an Academic Environment: Women Faculty in Library and Information Science* (Westport, Conneticut: Greenwood Press, 1994).

Martin, T. *The Sound of Our Own Voices: Women's Study Clubs 1860-1910* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1987).

Miller, Francesca. *Latin American Women and the stand for Social Justice* (Hanover and London: University Press of New-England, 1991).

Mintz, Steven. *Moralists and Modernizers: America's Pre-Civil War Reformers* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995).

Mort, Frank. *Dangerous Sexualities: Medico-moral Politics in England since 1830* (New York: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987).

O'Connor, Pat. *Friendships Between Women: A Critical Review* (New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1992).

Pascoe, Peggy. *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990).

Penderson, Diana. *Changing Women Changing History A Bibliography of the History of Women in Canada Second Edition* (Carleton University Press, 1996).

Pentland, M. *A Bonnie Fetcher* (London: B.T.Batsford, 1952).

Perkin. H. *The Rise of Professional Society:England Since 1880* (London:Routledge, 1989).

Petrie, Glen. *A Singular Iniquity: The Campaigns of Josephine Butler* (London: MacMillan Company, 1971).

Pheterson, Gail. *The Prostitution Prism* (Amsterdam University Press, 1996).

Pollard, Hugh, M. *Pioneers and Popular Education 1760-1850* (London: J.Murray, 1956).

Quétel, Claude. *History of Syphilis.* Translated by Judith Braddock and Brian Pike (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1990).

Reinharz, S. *Feminist Methods in Social Research* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992).

Rooke, P.T. & R.L. Schnell. *No Bleeding Heart: Charlotte Whitton a Feminist on the Right* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1987).

_____*Discarding the Asylum From Child Rescue to the Welfare State in Canada (1800-1950)* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1983).

Rothman, Sheila. *Woman's Proper Place: A History of Changing Ideals and Practices, 1870 to the Present* (New York: Basic Books, Inc., 1978).

Rupp, Leila. *Worlds of Women The Making of an International Women's Movement* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997).

Saltzman, Chafetz, Janet and Dworkin, A.G. *Female Revolt: Women's Movements in World and Historical Perspective* (New Jersey: Rowman & Allanheld, 1986).

Scott, Anne Firor. *Natural Allies: Women's Associations in American History* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1991).

Selman, G.& Dampier, P. *The Foundations of Adult Education in Canada* (Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing Inc., 1991).

Semmel, B. *The Methodist Revolution* (New York: Basic Books, 1973).

Shafer, Robert Jones.*A Guide to Historical Method, Third Edition* (Belmont California: Wadsworth Publishing Company, 1980).

Shaw, R. *Proud Heritage: A History of the National Council Of Women of Canada* (Toronto: The Ryerson Press, 1957).

Silver, Harold. *The Concept of Popular Education: A Study of Ideas and Social Movements in the Early Nineteenth-century* (London: MacGibbon and Kee, 1965).

Skeggs, Beverley. *Formations of Class & Gender Becoming Respectable* (London: SAGE Publications, 1997).

Sklar, Kathryn Kish. *Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1973).

Smith, Dorothy, E. *Texts, Facts, and Feminity: Exploring the Relations of Ruling* (New York: Routledge, 1990).

Sontag, Susan. *AIDS and Its Metaphors* (New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux, 1989).

Spelman, Elizabeth V. *Inessential Woman: Problems of Exclusion in Feminist Thought* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1988).

Spender, Dale. *There's Always Been a Women's Movement This Century* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1983).

Stienstra, Deborah and Barbara Roberts. *Little But Lip Service: Assessing Canada's Implementation of its International Commitments to Women's Equality (1981-January 1993)* (Ottawa: The Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1993).

_____ *Strategies for the Year 2000 A Woman's Handbook* (Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1995.

Tarrow, Sidney. *Power in Movement: Social Movements, Collective Action and Politics* (Cambridge University Press, 1994).

The International Council of Women. *Women in a Changing World: The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women since 1888* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1966).

Thompson, F.M.L.*The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain 1830-1900* (London: Fontana Press, 1988).

Thomson, O. *Mass Persuasion in History: An Historical Analysis of the Development of Propaganda Techniques* (New York: Crane, Russak & Company, Inc, 1977).

Tilly, Louise A. and Patricia Gurin eds. *Women, Politics and Change* (New York: Russell Sage, 1990).

Tosh, J. *The Pursuit of History: Aims, Methods and New Directions in the Study of Modern History* (New York: Longman, 1991).

Tyrell, Ian. *Woman's World Woman's Empire: The Woman's Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective, 1880-1930* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1991).

Valverde, Marianne. *The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada, 1885-1925* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, Inc., 1991).

Verner, Coolie. *Pole's History of Adult schools: A Facsimile of the 1816 Edition with An Introduction and Bibliographic Notes* (Washington, D.C.:Adult Education Association, 1967).

Walkowitz, Judith R. *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class and the State* (London: Cambridge University Press, 1980).

Weber, R. *Basic Content Analysis: Series 49: Qualitative Applications in the Social Sciences (London: Sage, 1985).*

Weeks, Jeffrey. *Sex, Politics & Society: The regulation of sexuality since 1880* Second Edition (London: Longman, 1989).

Westwood, Robert, B. *John Dewey and American Democracy* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991).

Whittick, Arnold. *Woman into Citizen* (London: Atheneum, 1979).

Winslow, Anne ed. *Women, Politics, and the United Nations* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1995

THESES, PAPERS AND REPORTS

Department of Canadian Heritage. *Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women Fourth Report of Canada covering the period January 1, 1991 to March 31, 1994* (Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada, 1995).

Bendroth, Margaret Lamberts. "The Social Dimensions of 'Woman's Sphere': the Rise of Women's Organisations in Late Nineteenth-Century Protestantis " (PhD dissertation, John Hopkins University, 1984).

Bosetti-Piche, Shelley. "Interests of Edmonton Club Women 1919-1939" (PhD dissertation, University of Alberta, 1990).

Kovan, Seth. "Civic Maternalism and the Welfare State: The Case of Mrs. humphrey Ward." Paper presented to the Berkshire Conference on Women's History, Wellesley, 1987.

Langford, Nanci. "First Generation and Lasting Impressions: The Gendered Identities of Prairie Homestead Women"(PhD dissertation, University of Alberta, 1994).

Padavell, Jacqlyn. "Gender and the University: The Debate Over Women's Studies" (master's diss., University of Alberta, 1998).

Program of Studies in Non-Formal Education Institute for International studies College of Education. "Report of the Conference and Workshop on Non-formal Education and the Rural Poor" (Michigan State University, 1977).

Rooke, P.T. and Schnell, R. "Women's Transnational Organisations and International Conventions and the League of Nations 1919-1939." Paper presented at the Inaugural Conference of the European Social Science History Association, Amsterdam, May 9th-12th, 1996.

_____"'The Right to Liberty': Women's Organisations and the Quest for Equal Status at the League of Nations."Paper given at the Social Sciences History Association, Atlanta, GA. October 11th- 12th 1994.

_____ "The Pauper Stamp: A Historical Study of Ervin Goffman's Theory of Stigma and Spoiled Identity."Paper presented at the Symposium *In Whose Care and Custody: Orphans of the HIV Epidemic in Historical Perspectives,* New York, March 3rd- 5th, 1994.

_____ "That Women Might Speak for Women:Feminist Non-Formal Education at the League of Nations, 1920-1934." Paper presented at the History of Education Society, Minneapolis, Oct.1995.

Sheehan, Nancy M. "Temperance, the WCTU, and Education in Alberta, 1905-1930" (Ph.D. diss, University of Alberta, 1980).

Status of Women Canada. *Women's Equality in Canada Progress in Implementing the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women January 1992 to April 1995* (Ottawa: Status of Women Canada, 1995).

Strong-Boag, Veronica. "The Parliament of Women:The National Council of Women in Canada1893-1929" (Ph.D.diss.,Ottawa, 1976).

The British Ministry of Reconstruction Report. "A Design for Democracy" commonly called, "The 1919 Report" (1919, reprint New York: Association Press).

Tessitore, John and Susan Woolfson, eds. *A Global Agenda Issues Before the 53rd General Assembly of the United Nations An annual publication of the United Nations Association of the United States of America* (New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.,1998).

United Nations. *Fourth World Conference on Women Beijing, China 4-15 September 1995* (United Nations Document:1995).

Weston, Elizabeth, Anne. "Prostitution in Paris in the later Nineteenth-Century: A Study of Political and Social Ideology" (Ph.D. diss., State University of New York at Buffalo, 1979).

APPENDIX I

Preamble and first two articles of the
CONSTITUTION OF THE ICW
adopted in Washington, 1888.

Preamble
We, women of all Nations, sincerely believing that the best good of humanity will be advanced by greater unity of thought, sympathy and purpose, and that an organized movement of women will best conserve the highest good of the family and of the State, do hereby band ourselves in a confederation of workers to further the application of the Golden Rule to society, custom and law: DO UNTO OTHERS AS YE WOULD THAT THEY SHOULD DO UNTO YOU.

Article I Name
The Federation shall be called the International Council of Women.
Objects
(a) To provide a means of communication between women's organisations in al countries.
(b) To provide opportunities for women to meet together from all parts of the world to confer upon questions relating to the welfare of the commonwealth and the family.

Article II General Policy
This International Council is organized in the interests of no one propaganda, and has no power over its members beyond that of suggestion and sympathy; therefore, no National Council voting to become a member of the International Council shall render itself liable to be interfered with in respect to its complete organic unity, independence or methods of work, or shall be committed to any principle or method of any other Council, or to any utterance or act of this International Council, beyond compliance with the terms of this Constitution.

Women in a Changing World The Dynamic Story of the International Council of Women since 1888, p.329.

APPENDIX II

A Return of the number of Brothels and Prostitutes within the Metropolitan Police District, as nearly as could be ascertained at that date (May 20th, 1857)

	Number of Brothels					Number of Prostitutes			
	Where prostitutes are kept	Where prostitutes lodge	Where prostitutes resort	Total	Total returned in 1841	Well dressed, living in brothels	Well dressed, walking in the streets	Low, infesting low neighbourhoods	Total
A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
B	-	135	18	153	181	16	144	364	524
C	14	92	46	152	83	168	150	-	318
D	10	113	16	139	93	49	188	289	526
E	30	110	54	194	266	74	85	387	546
F	26	-	19	45	181	60	120	300	480
G	3	77	27	152	360	26	165	158	349
H	209	217	45	471	289	132	420	1251	1803
K	-	402	17	419	882	13	435	517	965
L	-	184	193	377	275	108	329	365	802
M	12	138	28	178	178	13	71	583	667
N	53	98	34	185	152	87	142	216	445
P	3	33	29	65	56	63	67	98	228
R	46	66	36	148	122	69	116	216	401
S	-	52	36	88	96	8	90	133	231
T	-	12	-	12	107	-	12	94	106
V	4	37	6	47	4	35	82	92	209
Total	**410**	**1766**	**649**	**2825**	**3325**	**921**	**2616**	**5063**	**8600**
Do. 1841	933	1544	848	3325	-	2071	1994	5344	9409

A. Whitehall, the Parks, Palaces,Governement Offices.
B. Westminister, Brompton,Pimlico, part of Chelsea.
C. St. James's,Regent-street, Soho, Leicester-square.
D. Marylebone,Paddington, St. John's Wood.
E. Between Oxford-street, Portland-place,New-road, and Gray's-inn-lane.
F. Covent Garden,Drury-lane, St. Giles's
G. Clerkenwell,Pentonville,City-road, Shoreditch.
H. Spitalfields, Houndsditch, Whitechapel,Ratcliff.
K. Bethnal-green,Mile-end,and from Shadwell to Blackwall.
L. Lambeth and Blackfriars,including Waterloo-road, & c.
M. Southwark, Bermondsey,Rotherhithe.
N. Islihngton,Hackney,Homerton, & c.
P. Camberwell,Walworth,part of Peckham.
R. Deptford,Greenwich, and neighbourhood.
S. Kilburn,Portland,Kentish and Camden Towns to Cattle Market
T. Kensingston, Hammersmith,North End, Fulham.
V. Walham-green, Fulham,Chelsea,Cremone.

Evidence from William Acton, *Prostitution*, 1857.

APPENDIX III

SELECTED SAMPLE OF 'WOMEN WORTHIES' FROM NOTES AND NEWS

London (May 1923) Lady Trustram Eve, Treasurer of the NCW of Great Britain and member of the ICW Finance Committee has been appointed Chairman of the London County Council Committee for the Control of Parks and Open Spaces, a very important committee affecting the welfare of youth of London.

Denmark (November 1923) Miss Joan Fry, a well known Quaker and one of the leaders of English Friends' Relief Work in Berlin, visited Copenhagen, where she gave two lectures on the relief work that is being done by the Friends in Germany. She had been invited by the Danish Branch of the Fellowship of Reconciliation. During the war Miss Fry had acted as Quaker chaplain among the conscientious objectors in the prisons.

First Woman Magistrate in Austria (October 1924) A young lawyer, Dr. Maria Fischer, practicing in the Children's Court was made a magistrate.

American Woman in the foreign Service (October 1925) Miss Pattie Field has been appointed as Vice-Counsul to Amsterdam. Miss Field is the second appointment of this kind the first being Miss Lucille Atcheson, who is Secretary to the American Legation in Berne.

Marie von Ebner-Eschenbach (November 1925) A monument has been erected to the well-known Austrain poetess, under the arcades of the Vienna University. She is the only woman to have been given the title of Doctor honoris causa by the University of Vienna.

Hygiene and Social Welfare Exhibition at Düsseldorf (May 1926) In May the exhibit will open. It will highlight the work done by women such as Josephine Butler, Elizabeth Fry, Florence Nightingale, Octavia Hill and Dr. Garrett Anderson.

First Woman Professor in Experimental Pharmacology at Prague University (November 1926) Miss Hedwig langecker has been appointed to the chair of experimental pharmacology at the German University at Prague. She is the first woman to hold a professorship there.

First Woman Doctor in Bolivia (January 1927) Senorita Amelia Chopitea has graduated as Doctor of Medicine and Surgery at Sucre, in Bolivia, the first Bolivian woman to obtain this degree. The Government has granted her a bursary so that she might continue her studies in Europe.

Italian Woman Engineer (June 1927) Signorina Laetitia Andra has recently graduated with honours from the National School of Engineering, Rome, being the first woman to do so.

Woman Sea Captain (September 1927) Gudrun Trogstad, of Oslo, nineteen years of age, has passed her examination as a sea captain, and has received her certificate as a master mariner.

Woman Architect for Stratford Theatre (January 1928) A young Englishwoman, Miss Elizabeth Scott, has beaten seventy-five British and American competitors with her design for the new Shakespeare Memorial Theatre at Stratford-on-Avon. She is the first woman in any country to have won so great a distinction.

A Woman High Sheriff in Belfast (January 1928) Mrs. McMordie was appointed high sheriff in Belfast. The first woman to hold this position in Belfast.

South African Woman Air Champion (February 1928) The International League of Aviators has awarded Lady Bailey, the well-known lady aviator, the international trophy for women for her altitude records for light aeroplanes–18,000 feet last June.

Women Motor Scouts in Great Britain (October 1929). A new opening has been created by the Women's Automobile and Sports Association, which has been formed to look after the interests of women motorists and sportswomen generally. The Association is arranging to put uniformed women patrols on the road in the near future. These skilled mechanics will be mounted on motor cycles and will be able to render first aid wherever necessary.

German Woman Painter honoured (November 1929) Käthe Kollwitz, the well-known German painter, who not long ago was appointed Professor of the Academy of Fine Arts in Berlin, has been decorated with the Order Pour Mérite, a distinction which is not often conferred on a woman.

An Englishwoman appointed Harbour Master (January 1930) Miss Edith Gale, the new Harbour Master at Paignton, South Devon is only 21 years old. We hardly think that there are other countries where women have been appointed to positions of this kind.

The First Woman Architect in Czechoslavkia (January 1930) Melle. Marie Smizova has just completed her studies in Prague and is the first woman to exercise the profession in Czechoslavakia.

Italian Woman Opera Director (September 1930) Signora Anita Colombo has been appointed manager of the famous "Scala" Opera of Milan.

First Woman Post Office Director in Turkey (February 1931) We have to announce another remarkable appointment in Turkey, which marks the astonishingly rapid progress of the women's movement in that country. Not only is Mme.Server Ali Hanum the first appointed Director of the General Post Office in Stamboul, but the first in the whole world to achieve such a distinction.

Australian Commonwealth Committee on Sugar Enquiry (April 1931) Mrs. Elsie E. Morgan M.P. has been appointed by the Federal Government to represent the Connsumers of Australia on the Sugar Industry Enquiry Committee, and is the first woman appointed to a Commonwealth body to conduct an enquiry of international significance.

A Woman Director of Prisons in Spain (May 1931) Senorita Victoria Kent has been appointed Director General of Prisons by the new Republican Government. She is said to have been the first woman lawyer in Spain and has practiced at the Bar for two years.

A French Woman Explorer (November 1932) In 1920 the "Daily telegraph" reports, the French Colonial Ministry required a young scientist to collect topographical and geological materials in little-known regions of Madagascar. No male candidate was forthcoming but Melle. Basse, who had distinguished herself in science at the Sorbonne, was rather reluctantly accepted. The bold young explorer has returned with the sorely needed maps, charts, geological, botanical and zoological materials which will supply material for a thesis for a Doctor's Degree which she is about to write.

Mrs. Keyes, Mayor of Cambridge (December 1932) The former president of the British National Council of Women has been appointed the Mayor of Cambridge. She is the mother of the well-known economist Professor Keynes.

First Woman "Customs Expert" in France (November 1933) For the first time in France a woman has been appointed "Customs Expert" for the valuation and determination of the origins of carpets and tapestry.

German Actress Director of the State School of Dramatic Art (November 1933) Miss Lucie Höflich has been appointed Director of the new State School of Dramatic Art in Berlin.

A Woman Expert in Taxation Law (March 1934) Miss Irene Steiner, D.L.L. who has held a high position in Swiss Customs has become a lecturer on Taxation Legislation at the University of Berne.

Woman Astronomer Honoured (April 1934) The hon.degree of M.A. has been bestowed by the University of Oxford on Miss Ethel Bellamy, in recognition for her valuable work during thirty years at the university Observatory.

A Woman Fellow of the Royal Society in Literature in Great Britain (July 1935) The Well-known English author, Sheila Kaye-Smith, has been elected a Fellow of the Royal Society of Literature.

Women in "unusual" Positions (November 1935) The recent Congress of women engineers that took place in London has borne fresh witness to the fact that women professional workers are advancing in fields which until recently have been considered "outside women's sphere." One of the past presidents of the Society of Women Engineers is at the head of a machine tool company with business in Europe and U.S.A. A member whose name is perpetuated in the Holmes Poppet valve gear used in Diesel engines, is a mechanical and locomotive engineer who invents and tests her own models. Another is an expert on mine lighting, a fourth owns and runs a shipyard and yet another is a Governing Director of a paint and varnish factory.

Mme Jolie-Curie, Winner of the Nobel Prize and Knight of the Légion d'Honneur (December 1935) Together with her husband, Dr. Frederic Joliot, Irene Joliot-Curie has been awarded the Nobel Prize for Chemistry for work in pursuance of the scientific research and the discovery of radium.The French Government has bestowed upon Mme Joliot-Curie and her husband the distinction of Knights of the "Legion d'Honneur."

New York Investigation of Organised Crime (January 1936) A negro lawyer, Mrs. Eunice Hutton Carter, is the only woman to serve on the staff of the special prosecutor in charge of the investigation of organized crime in New York city. Mrs. Hutton Carter has held the position of a supervisor of home relief in Harlem and has acted as a secretary to the Mayor's Committee on Social Conditions in Harlem.

Miss Sylvia Pankhurst –Dame of the British Empire (February 1936) Women in countries still struggling for suffrage may take as encouraging proof of how official attitudes and public opinion may change in a few decades the fact that Sylvia Pankhurst has had the B.B.E. conferred upon her.

First Woman Mayor in Canada (March 1936) Mrs. Barbara Hanley, the wife of the locomotive fireman, was recently elected Mayor of the little township of Webbwood, Ontario. She is said to be the first woman in Canada to hold such an office.

Air Hostesses in the United States (July 1936) This novel position, to which women were first appointed in the United States, with Switzerland and the Netherlands following, was alluded to in the previous *Bulletin.* There are now (according to press reports)197 employed in this capacity in the United States.

The first woman barrister in Syria (March 1937) A Mohammedan woman of Syria, Miss Bourone Tarazi, has–the first woman in her country to achieve this–been called to the Bar at Damascus. This sheds an interesting light on the evolution of women in the countries of the Near East. The young advocate, who has graduated from Beyrouth University,
will plead in Arabian and French.

A distinguished Australian Scientist (May 1937) Dr.Georgina Sweet has been elected as a member of the Melbourne University Council. She is the first woman to hold such a position at that University. She was the first woman lecturer at the University of Melbourne; the first woman to receive a Doctorate of Sciences in Australia; the first woman member of the Faculty of Sciences, and the first woman associate professor. Dr. Georgina Sweet is hon. Lecturer in Zoology and Parasitology; a member of the Faculties of Science and Veterinary Science and a member of the Australian Research Council.

Women "flying Doctors" in Australia (November 1937) In Australia a chain of fully equipped base hospitals and radio stations to ensure quick medical treatment for people in all parts of the sparsely populated country extends around the continent. Australia is the proud possessor of the first "women flying doctors" of the world.

An American Woman explores the Arctic (January 1938) According to reports in English newspapers, the American Arctic explorer, Miss Louise A. Boyd, leader and photographer of an expedition which set out from Aalesund in Norway last summer to study the formation of fiords and glaciers in the North-East of Greenland, has discovered an hitherto unchartered range of submarine mountains between Jan Mayen and Bear Islands, in the Arctic Ocean.

Important Posts for Women in Soviet Russia (June 1939) Mme Polina Zhemchuzhina, the wife of the Russian Prime Minister, who was formerly at the head of the Perfumery and Cosmetic Trust, has been appointed Commissar for the Fish Industry.
One of Russia's leading air women, Miss Valentia Grizodubova, has been appointed head of Russia's international air lines.

Partnership (July 1939) Two young London architects, who are partners in marriage as well as in business, were jointly awarded the Building Centre's Prize for the best design for a school and holiday camp.

Woman Lord Mayor of Dublin (November 1939) Mrs Kathleen Clarke, widow of one of the leaders of the Irish Rebellion in 1916, is the new Lard Mayor of Dublin, and Ireland's first woman mayor. Mrs. Clarke was a member of the first Dail, voting

against the Treaty in 1922. She served as a Republican Justice of the Peace. On the initiative of Mr.de Valera's party she supported him and became a Fianna Fail Senator. She has a record of good work to her credit.

APPENDIX IV

SELECTED SAMPLE OF INSTITUTIONAL ROLE MODELS FROM NOTES AND NEWS

London Women Police in London (May 1923) A great step forward has been madewith regard to the position of women police in London. For the present, only 20 women police are to be appointed, but these are to have exactly the same powers and status as men constables of similar rank.

Education (May 1923) the University of Cambridge has lately granted "Titular Degrees" to women, giving the right to attend lectures, but no rights as Members and no powers to suggest alterations in the curriculum for women students. It is the only university in Britain where women are not allowed part in the University life.

Bill before Parliament (October 1924) A Bill before the Austrian Parliament deals with the regular payment of affiliation orders. Olga Rudel-Zeynek proposes strict punishment for those found negligent especially where serious harm is likely to result.

Inheritance in Yugo-Slavia (October 1925) The Women's Organisations in Yugo-Slavia are carrying on a vigorous campaign in favor of equal rights of inheritance for sons and daughters. At present male heirs have the right to the larger proportion of the estate.

Austrian Midwives Act (November 1925) Austrian women propose a Bill for the regulation of Midwifery Service. It is designed to bring the practice more into line with modern scientific knowledge.

Deputation on Women Police in England (April 1926) The home Secretary recently received a large deputation from the NCW regarding a case for reforms in regard to the supervision of women in custody. He said he was prepared to circulate a letter to police authorities stating his opinion that women police had been a success and that more should be engaged.

Progress in Turkey (April 1926) The National Assembly voted *en bloc* in approval of the new Turkish civil code which contains more than 900 articles based on the code of Switzerland. This new body of laws is notable for the changes it makes in the status of women. It gives them equal rights with men in the matter of divorce and abolishes polygamy.

International Police Conference (November 1926) The International Police Conference was recently held in Berlin. The following resolution was passed: "The

Congress recommends the question of women police to the attention of all Governments and police organisations, because it considers that the co-operation of women in the various departments of police work is of very considerable benefit to the welfare of the people."

Women Police (April 1927) Eight candidates passed the examinations for the Women's Section with the Berlin criminal police service. They all have practical experience in social and welfare work. Hamburg has likewise appointed its first police woman.

Woman Suffrage in Rumania (May 1927) We hear that the Minister of Justice proposes to introduce a single clause Bill at the beginning of the next session of the Legislative Assembly for the equalisation of civil rights between men and women.

Women Police in Germany (September 1927) Prussia now has 54 policewomen, 24 in training and 30 in active service.

New Legal Status for Women in Japan (February 1928) American papers report the revision of the Inheritance Law is being considered in Japan. These revisions will recognize the legal equality of women with men.

Policewoman in Haarlem (March 1928) A woman Liberal member of theHaarlem Town Council, Miss Berdenis van Berlekom, has succeeded, after four years struggle, in having her proposal adopted to add a woman to the Haarlem Police Force.

Votes for Women in India (April 1928) Bangalore has fallen in line with Madras and decided to extend the Franchise to women.

Women Police in Australia (October 1928) Since the first two appointments in Adelaide in December in 1915, additional appointments have been made. There are now 10 police women in Adelaide.

U.S.A. Elections (March 1929) Eight women instead of seven will sit in the Congress. As a result of the special election, Mrs.William A. Oldfield, Democrat of Arkansas was returned. She will sit in the present Congress and the next.

The first woman police doctor in Austria (April 1929) The first woman doctor to be attached to the Police Department of the capital was appointed at Vienna. Dr. Helene Jokl is in charge of medical examinations of women arrested by the Police.

Once More Women Police New Appointment at Scotland Yard (March 1930) Miss Peto, director of the Liverpool Women Police has been appointed to the temporary post

of Advisor at Scotland Yard on the organisation and training of the new women police force.

Woman Suffrage in Japan (March 1930) News comes from Japan that the Liberal Government has included woman's suffrage in its programme.

British Mental Treatment Act (February 1931) The Mental Treatment Act provides that women must be among the Commissioners and on the visiting Committees of all mental hospitals.

Are Brazillian Women to vote? (May 1931) The Brazilian Government is said to have announced that the new election laws will allow women to register as voters, according to the daily Press.

Women Police in Uruguay (October 1931) The President of the Republic has announced the formation of a women's police corps.

Marriage Law Reform in Persia (October 1931) A recent Bill raised the age of marriage to 16 for girls and 18 for boys. Another result of the new Bill is that Persian women will have the right to seek divorce from their husbands.

Women Police (May 1932) The U.S. can boast of two aerial traffic policewomen, Mrs. McQueen and Miss Patricia Mendall.
Miss Johanne Berg has been appointed Police Inspector in Aarhus. She is the first Danish woman to hold this office.

Women Enfranchised in Siam (September 1932) A new Constitution has recently obtained the Royal assent in Siam. Siamese women will now have the right to vote.

Women Police in Mexico (September 1932) Mexico can boast a women's police force.

Women Police in China (May 1933) Hankow, where eight women were trained for the Police Force in 1931 had the honor of being the first Chinese town to introduce women police.

Women at Scotland Yard (November 1933) Three women have been appointed to the deceive staff at Scotland Yard.

Suffrage for the Women of the Phillipines (February 1934) Women in the Phillipines have been granted suffrage on the same conditions as men: they must be 21 years, able to read and write and possess property worth at least $250.00.

A Police Woman in Turkey (May 1934) The first woman has been appointed to the position of Constable.

The Nationality of Married Women in Luxembourg (June 1934)A new Law on Nationality was recently voted in Luxembourg. A foreign woman has six months to renounce the nationality of her husband if she wishes to retain her own. Women who had lost their nationality following a marriage to a foreigner may reclaim it if they sign a declaration within twelve months of the passing of the Bill.

Quebec Women's Petition to the King (June 1935) A petition seeking His Majesty's "benevolent sympathy" in the efforts of Quebec women to secure the vote on the occasion of his silver jubilee. The mass petition has been signed by 9,000 women of the Province–Quebec being the only Canadian province which still denies her women the vote.

Women Police in Turkey (July 1935) The women's Police Force now includes 22 police women: 18 in Instanboul, 1 at Seyhan, 2 at Izmir, 1 at Ankarra. One woman district inspector and two police women serve on Headquarters staff.

Votes for Cuban Women (July 1935) The new Constitution of Cuba provides for women's franchise on equal terms with men.

Feminist Successes in Egypt (January 1936) The Egyptian Government has raised the marriage ban where women teachers are concerned. The appointment of a woman factory inspector under the Ministry of Labour has been greeted with much satisfaction in feminist
circles.

Employment of Married Women in Belgium (April 1936) A Belgium Royal Order suspends for three months as from February 3rd, 1936, the provision which, in order to induce married women to leave employment , reduced by 25% of the wife's wages the benefit drawn by an unemployed man whose wife worked in an insurable occupation.

Municipal Franchise for Women in Bulgaria (January/February 1937) As we go to press we learn that a new Bulgarian law provides for women to vote at municipal elections. This is restricted to women legally married and mothers of a family. Although restricted, this reform may be greeted as the first step in the right direction.

Women's Rights Threatened in China? (June 1936) Following rumors that the National Government of China proposes to eliminate women from all public offices, several women's organisations jointly presented a petition to the Government claiming equal rights and protection for women.

The Civil Status of Women in Bolivia (July 1937) According to *International Women's News* Bolivian women have been granted civil rights by a recent decree which modifies no less than 102 of the articles of the existing Civil Code in regard to marriage.

French Women may now obtain a passport without their husband's permission (July 1937) The French Minister of the Interior, after consultation with the Minister of Justice and in agreement with the Government, has instructed the passport authorities that henceforth married women may obtain a passport without the marital authorization which by law had to accompany their application hitherto.

Equal Nationality Treaty ratified by nine States (January 1938) Brazil has ratified the Equal Nationality Treaty, which was signed by four countries in Montevideo, in 1933. This brings the total number of ratifications of this Convention to nine, the others being: the United States, Chile, Mexico, Honduras, Columbia, Guatemala, Ecuador, and Nicaragua.

Women Police (May 1938) In Czechoslavakia, two women have been appointed to the Police for special duties.
According to press reports, women police will be introduced in New Zealand.

Social Hygiene Visitors in Argentina (May 1938) A school for training women as social hygiene visitors has been recently established in Argentina. It is attached to theFaculty of Medicine of the National University of La Plata. The object of the school is to train women visitors to deal with such subjects as school hygiene, prevention of tuberculosis, obstetrics and infant welfare.

Burmese Woman appointed Inspector of Police (October 1938) For the first time a Burmese woman, Daw Nuein Kin, has been appointed Inspector of Police in the Vigilance Department, Rangoon.

The Women of Equador enfranchised (February 1939) The Republic of Equador has promulgated a new law which provides that all men and women who can read and write may vote at the age of 18.

Discrimination against married women in Czechoslavakia (March 1939) According to *The International Women's News* married women are to be dismissed from State Service with a few exceptions and also from private employment, in spite of determined opposition from women's organisations.

Women Police for Zurich (July 1939) In Zurich, the advisability of following the example of other Swiss towns by introducing Women Police, is at present being

studied. Geneva can boast of having been the first city in Switzerland to appoint police women in 1914; Berne followed suit in 1928, Lausanne in 1929 and Basle in 1931. In all these places the authorities and the public alike are very well satisfied with their work.